The Role of Values in Higher Education: A Case Study of Two Higher Education Institutions

Bonnie L. Burchett

East Tennessee State University

Follow this and additional works at: http://dc.etsu.edu/etd

Part of the Higher Education Commons, and the Higher Education Administration Commons

Recommended Citation


This Dissertation - Open Access is brought to you for free and open access by Digital Commons @ East Tennessee State University. It has been accepted for inclusion in Electronic Theses and Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons @ East Tennessee State University. For more information, please contact dcadmin@etsu.edu.
INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.

UMI
A Bell & Howell Information Company
300 North Zeeb Road, Ann Arbor MI 48106-1346 USA
313/761-4700  800/521-0600

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
The Role of Values in Higher Education:
A Case Study of Two Higher Education Institutions

A Dissertation
Presented to the Faculty of the
Department of Educational Leadership and Policy Analysis

East Tennessee State University

In Partial Fulfillment
of the Requirements for the Degree
Doctor of Education
in Educational Leadership and Policy Analysis

by
Bonnie L. Burchett

May 1999
APPROVAL

This is to certify that the Graduate Committee of

BONNIE L. BURCHETT

met on the

1st day of April, 1999

The committee read and examined her dissertation, supervised her defense of it in an oral examination, and decided to recommend that her study be submitted to the Graduate Council, in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of Doctor of Education in Educational Leadership and Policy Analysis.

Chairman, Graduate Committee

Signed on behalf of the Graduate Council

Dean, School of Graduate Studies
ABSTRACT

THE ROLE OF VALUES IN HIGHER EDUCATION:
A CASE STUDY OF TWO HIGHER EDUCATION INSTITUTIONS

by

BONNIE L. BURCHETT

The primary purpose of this study was to develop case studies providing a description of how two higher education institutions addressed the role of values. The researcher attempted to provide insight and understanding into the implicit and explicit values of the institutions through a values audit process. The methods of transmitting those values internally and externally were examined, as well as, implications for students, faculty, and staff. There was also an analysis as to what evaluation process was used to ensure compliance or alignment and to gauge that alignment between educational practices and the institutions’ mission and purpose. The study examined the established and appropriate reward systems for recognizing and assuring compliance or alignment.

The ethnographic case study was chosen as the research model for the investigative process for this study. Two case studies were conducted in which a four-year public institution, East Tennessee State University; and a four-year private Christian, liberal arts institution, Milligan College were examined. Each institution was treated as a case study, then a cross-case analysis was conducted between institutions noting similarities and differences. Four ethnographic techniques were used in the data collection phase of the research study: researcher’s notes, face-to-face interviewing, document analysis, and participant observation. In each technique, the researcher emerged as the primary instrument for data collection.

Based on the data collected, it was found that an institution’s vision, mission, values, and goals provide the context in which it operates. The leader emerged as the individual who sets the tone for values for the institution. Effective strategies for communicating and implementing the values throughout all levels of the organization are critical. Compliance and alignment of members with the values must be expected, encourages, rewarded, and punished. Institutions may employ

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
differing, yet, effective strategies for values definition, communication, and implementation.

Recommendations made, as a result of the study are the following: (1) a periodic, broad-based review of the vision, mission, and values be conducted, (2) effective and continuous communication strategies be formulated and implemented into the hiring, supervision, and evaluation process, (3) an individual or an area be responsible for reviewing, transmitting, and evaluating the values, (4) periodic values audits be conducted internally and externally, and (5) further research be conducted in areas impacted by institutional values.
INSTITUTIONAL REVIEW BOARD APPROVAL

This is to certify that the following study has been filed and approved by the Institutional Review Board of East Tennessee State University.

Title of Grant or Project _The Role of Values in Higher Education: A Case Study of Two Higher Education Institutions_

Principle Investigator ___ Bonnie L. Burchett ___

Department ___ Educational Leadership and Policy Analysis ___

Date Submitted ___ November 1998 ___

Institutional Review Board, Chair ___ [Signature] ___

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
DEDICATION

This dissertation is dedicated in memory of my father, Hiram Burchett; brother, Dr. E. Wayne Burchett; and nieces, Kara and Rena whose tragic and untimely deaths delayed this project, but whose lives became a source of inspiration to my finally completing it.
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Thanks be to Jesus Christ, my Lord and Savior, the source of my strength and who sent a multitude of "angels" to provide assistance and encouragement, at the time I needed it, throughout the completion of this project. There is no way I can identify or name all my "angels" personally; however, there are several that seem to stand a little taller that I would like to thank.

I would like to express my deepest appreciation to the members of my doctoral committee who have in different, yet, meaningful and purposeful ways acted as a mentor, advisor, supporter, and friend throughout my long doctoral career. My sincere thanks and appreciation is expressed to my chair, Dr. Richard Manahan, who absolutely would not allow me to give up [even when I thought I wanted to], and who always seemed to have words of motivation at the right time, particular ones of importance were "get it on the shelf".

I am very grateful to Dr. Russell West, who as interim chair of the department, assisted me in planning a course of study that would allow me to complete my degree and continued to advise and support my efforts as a member of my committee. My sincere appreciation is expressed to Dr. Hal Knight, who has always challenged me and whose suggestions, while at first seemed more difficult than I preferred or liked, have resulted in some of my most meaningful and valuable experiences. My thanks and gratitude are extended to Dr. Harold "Doc" Whitmore, my mentor and friend for over 20 years, who has always been encouraging and supportive of me both personally and professionally.
I am also truly grateful to my debriefers, Dr. Nancy Dishner and Dr. Carolyn Brown, for their time, advice, guidance, and encouragement throughout the completion of this study, as well as, my doctoral program. I also express thanks to Ms. Jane Jones, who served as my inquiry auditor and provided much helpful feedback. To my readers, Dr. Ginger Rutherford and Dr. Judy Johnston, I express my sincere gratitude for your continuous support, encouragement, and feedback throughout this project. A very special thanks to my transcribers, Georgia Dover, Kristin Chamberlin, and Jeff and Lainey Howard for their many hours of hard work. Much appreciation is expressed to my good friend Mary Jordan who allowed me to reflect ideas and thoughts and provided much needed feedback.

I would also like to thank Mr. Harry Steele and my colleagues in the Office of Housing and Residence Life for their support, encouragement, and generally tolerating me throughout this process. My thanks to Dr. Wayne Andrews and Dr. Sally Lee and other members of the Student Affairs Division for their continuing encouragement. To Dr. Roberta Herrin, Dr. Wes Brown, and the Graduate Studies staff, my sincerest thanks for your assistance in providing me the time and opportunity to complete my dissertation. Thanks also to the faculty of the Department of Educational Leadership and Policy Analysis for providing opportunities that has made my doctoral experience a meaningful and valuable learning experience. Special thanks to Sharon Barnett for her gracious and kind help with the paperwork.

I would like to express my gratitude to Dr. Paul Stanton, President of East Tennessee State University, and Dr. Donald Jeanes, President of Milligan College, and
their staff for their support in providing much needed information during the data collection phase of the study. Through this process, I have renewed and gained a greater appreciation for my colleagues at ETSU, and I have met new friends and colleagues at Milligan College. For this, I am truly grateful.

My most sincere thanks to my mother, siblings, nieces, and friends for their continued love, support, and encouragement throughout my life. Thanks for believing in me, even when I doubted myself. My special thanks, gratitude, and forever indebtedness is expressed to Georgia Dover who typed every word, made each correction, and worked tirelessly with me throughout this project. Without her physical help and emotional support from the beginning, this project would not have been completed.

Each individual named, and many that were not, will never know the extent of their impact upon my life before and during this process. I can only say thank you and thank God for sending you, my “angels,” to me just when I needed you. My prayer, as I complete this phase of my life, is that I will re-dedicate myself to giving to others the kind of support, love, and encouragement you have shown me. For this, if no other reason, I can humbly say, “it has been worth it.”
Chapter Page

Values and Leadership ............................................. 33
Values Audit .............................................................. 44
Summary ................................................................. 47

3. RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY ............ 48
Overview of the Methods ........................................... 48
Research Design .......................................................... 48
Sampling ................................................................. 50
Data Collection .......................................................... 51
Data Analysis .............................................................. 55
   Data Reduction ......................................................... 56
   Unitization .............................................................. 56
   Categorization ........................................................ 56
   Trustworthiness ...................................................... 57
Summary ................................................................. 60

4. CASE STUDY I - EAST TENNESSEE STATE UNIVERSITY ... 62
Introduction .............................................................. 62
Background .............................................................. 63
   Vision Statement ..................................................... 64
   Mission ............................................................... 64
   Values ................................................................. 64
   Goals ................................................................. 65

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 1</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 2</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kellogg Grant III</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Service Learning</td>
<td>80</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interdisciplinary Initiatives</td>
<td>81</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community Partnerships</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 3</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 4</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 5</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 6</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students--Academic</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students--Extra-Curricular</td>
<td>93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty/Staff</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 7</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty/Staff</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 8</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 9</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 10</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 11</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>110</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. CASE STUDY II - MILLIGAN COLLEGE</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Background</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vision</td>
<td>112</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mission</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goals</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 1</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 2</td>
<td>121</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 3</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 4</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 5</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty/Staff</td>
<td>127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 6</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>130</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty</td>
<td>132</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 7</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty/Staff</td>
<td>134</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 8</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students</td>
<td>135</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty</td>
<td>136</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Staff/Administration</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 9</td>
<td>137</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 10</td>
<td>141</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Research Question 11</td>
<td>145</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>152</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. SUMMARY, OBSERVATIONS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Summary</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Tennessee State University</td>
<td>153</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Milligan College</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Observations</td>
<td>166</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conclusion</td>
<td>171</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations</td>
<td>174</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommendations for Further Research</td>
<td>176</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>REFERENCES</td>
<td>178</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDICES</td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX A: Interviewees East Tennessee State University</td>
<td>197</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX B: Interviewees Milligan College</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX C: Documents - East Tennessee State University</td>
<td>201</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX D: Documents - Milligan College</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>APPENDIX E: Audit</td>
<td>205</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VITA</td>
<td>209</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Ethics and ethical behavior of individuals within organizations have been studied for decades (Baumhart, 1961; Brenner & Molander, 1977). During the last few years, numerous incidents of misconduct in government and business have been cited in articles, books, magazines, and newspapers. Examples include corrupt actions by government officials, insider trading on the stock market, fraudulent defense contracts, price-fixing, embezzlement, and sexual harassment. Lack of ethical behavior in business seems to be a growing concern for politicians, educators, consumers, as well as, business leaders (Gaedeke, Kelley, & Tootelian, 1992). Their research indicated that the public opinion of honesty and ethical standards in business is on the decline from average to low.

Traditionally, higher education institutions could point to values and ethics as guides to their actions and to demonstrate that faculty and graduates reflected those values, and society was content (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). However, over the last decade, higher education has had its share of moral and ethical problems that have gained national attention. Almost any issue of the Chronicle of Higher Education and daily newspapers contain articles regarding athletic scandals, discriminatory admission policies, academic dishonesty, research and administrative fraud, and sexual violence or harassment.

On a more fundamental level is the crisis of values on college and university campuses which can lead to confusion concerning the mission of higher education (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). Historically, universities have long been concerned with
ethical matters. However, Cunelis (1993) observed the university’s mission and goals may no longer apply to educational practice. Mortimer (1972) described business organizations and universities as having dispersed responsibility to the extent that no one person was held accountable for institutional direction, except perhaps, the president. Payton (1997) observed that in the 1960s educators were molding their institutions into government agencies, but presently, they were being reshaped to function as corporations. He asserted that neither movement portrayed the primary mission of a developing and advancing educational institution, which is about purpose and moral values.

Astin (1989) wrote that universities have two sets of values or moral messages: explicit and implicit. Explicit or formal values are those found in official statements such as charters, catalogs, mission statements, annual reports, speeches, public announcements, or other written material. Implicit values are those that dictate institutional policies, such as, the allocating of resources, hiring of faculty and staff, admitting of students, establishing curriculum, choosing pedagogical techniques, and implementing new programs. According to Astin, the most difficult problems come from serving students when there are inconsistencies between explicit and implicit values. For example, the university’s mission statement may emphasize teaching, research, and public service with all being equally important. However, at many institutions, even small institutions, research is given higher priority in terms of rewards for faculty (Astin, 1989). At community colleges, teaching and equal opportunity are often expressed as the top priority, yet are threatened by increasing enrollment. Astin indicated that the
challenge was to provide better correlation between implicit values that drive internal institutional policies and explicit values that are written in university documents.

Astin's (1989) recommendations were to start campus-wide dialogue on excellence that generally has been measured by reputation and resources. He contended that this method of measuring excellence does not consider the central mission of the institution which is to educate students and facilitate the fullest development of their abilities and talents. Astin stated that talent development of excellence emphasizes the educational impact of the institution on its students. The resource and reputational approaches to excellence dwell on a competitive view while the talent development approach focuses on the cooperative view. Astin further stated that in institutions where reputational and resource considerations were the measures of excellence students were viewed as resources rather than people to be educated. Students with either high grades, test scores, or both were sought at the expense of less prepared students. He indicated these two approaches were barriers to affirmative action and expansion of educational opportunities for minority and disadvantaged students. When the college’s or university’s implicit and explicit values were matched, according to Astin, the quality of student life and the effectiveness of an educational program became more important. The student was someone to be served and the less-prepared student was viewed as an important educational opportunity, not a liability.

The values of an institution are reflected in the kind of information collected and reviewed (Astin, 1989). He opined that college catalogs mention "affective" goals, such as good citizenship, yet tended to stress the cognitive aspects of learning. Astin further
asserted that higher education needs to become more concerned with the development of beliefs and values necessary to positively affect society in being less materialistic, competitive, selfish, and more generous and cooperative.

Almost a decade after Astin's article much is still being written by educators calling for educational institutions to reexamine and defend their ultimate purposes. The January-February 1997, issue of Change magazine contained articles about higher education and civic life. The American Council on Education (Ikenberry, 1997) began a dialogue with the higher education community as to purpose and values beyond knowledge acquisition and career preparation. The challenge to higher education was from within, as well as, a broader public agenda.

The Summer-Fall 1997, edition of Educational Record focused on examining the role of higher education in students' values formation which enables students to grow and develop into caring and contributing individuals in their local and global communities. The contributing authors to the edition discussed broad and specific issues impacting college campuses and character development, such as service learning, collaborative learning, problem-solving, and the power of peer culture. The consensus was that higher education had always been committed to imparting knowledge, but must now facilitate the student's use of that knowledge for society's good. Corrigan (1997) observed that higher education focused on the means of education, such as credit hours, degrees, and schedules, while the ends such as social progress and needs, partnerships, and meaningful research were ignored. These endeavors were a mechanism to community building and accountability, not an end within themselves.
Statement of the Problem

Higher education institutions are concerned about their role in society and the ability to respond appropriately to critics. There are increasing demands for accountability as a result of pressure from societal issues influenced by trends in demographics, enrollment, economic, and social forces (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). Higher education continues to be held accountable for demonstrating leadership in social areas such as, race and gender equality, age discrimination, accessibility for the disabled, misuse of research funds, and the abuse of alcohol and drugs on the campus.

Some institutions have responded through strong leadership, conducting an institutional self analysis, and reassessing its mission and purpose in terms of values and the implications for students (Sax & Astin, 1997). They observed that higher education was being faced with the demand to return to its original mission of "developing a well-informed, critically thinking, and civically engaged citizenry" (p. 25). Civic or character education was being heavily influenced through the ways colleges and universities related to its publics and responded to their problems (Matthews, 1997). Through leadership, modeling, curriculum, and a clear mission and purpose, institutions are providing examples to students, either positively or negatively (King, 1997). Positive examples exhibited by institutions are providing students with opportunities to develop integrity and character, preparing them for leadership, while negative examples distort the purpose of education and fails to fulfill the mission of higher education. Therefore, the problem for this study was to compare the values systems of a four-year private institution and a four-year public institution.
Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to conduct case studies providing a description of how two higher education institutions addressed the role of values for their institutions. The study attempted to provide insight and understanding into the implicit and explicit values of the institutions through a values audit process. The methods of transmitting those values internally and externally were examined, as well as, implications for students, faculty, and staff. There was also an analysis as to what evaluation process was used to ensure compliance or alignment and to gauge that alignment between educational practices and the institutions' mission and purpose. The study examined the established and appropriate reward system for recognizing and assuring compliance or alignment.

Significance of the Problem

The significance of studying the role of values at two primarily different types of institutions can provide valuable information to educational leaders, such as presidents, administrators, and faculty. Information and insights into the institutions' value system and how they are communicated throughout the institution could lead to self awareness and replication at other institutions. Experiences observed, learned, and shared are extremely beneficial to educators, as well as, society. Organizational analysis of issues and strategies to solving problems are basic to any discussion of higher education, especially if about itself.

Kimbrough (1985) observed that educational administrators have a responsibility that denotes the carrying out of an obligation or duty, being answerable or liable for legal
review. Therefore, this obligation or duty related significantly with trustworthiness, reliability, accountability, and answerability. According to Kimbrough, "... the sole purpose of ethical behavior is not merely a nicety that educational administrators ought to observe just to be good but it has economic consequences as well" (p. 3). Therefore, any significant understanding or insights gained can be beneficial to the higher education profession.

If higher education is to succeed with accountability and credibility, then institutions must conduct a values audit and make realignment where necessary. This process begins with determining their current status. Therefore, any information or strategies regarding possible solutions to the credibility issue for higher education will add to the overall literature. There was merit in raising the awareness of educators and the general public regarding the issue of values in higher education. Kimbrough (1985) stated that the "excesses both in the arbitrary use of authority or in failure to exercise authority effectively, therefore, represent failure to meet acceptable ethical standards" (p. 9).

**Research Questions or Guide**

In order to address the issues of values at the two higher education institutions, the basic research questions from Wilcox and Ebbs (1992a) were used as a guide for obtaining relevant information:

6. What are the essential values stated by the institution?

7. How are these values communicated through the institution?
8. What evaluation process was employed to ensure compliance by institutional members?

9. What reward system was in place to recognize compliance?

The researcher attempted to examine the following questions adopted from Dalton and Petrie's (1997) list of common components of character education activities that are consistent with findings from the review of literature conducted for this study:

1. How are the implicit/explicit values of the institution defined? What are they? Are they written? Where could they be located? How were they communicated through the institution?

2. How are the implicit/explicit values in the institution focused in the curriculum? Where? How taught?

3. Is there an academic honor code?

4. Is there a written institutional code that defined rights, duties, and responsibilities of faculty, staff, and students?

5. Is there a written institutional creed or statement that articulated the expectations of faculty, staff, and students?

6. What incentives and programs are offered for participants in community service and community building activities?

7. How are new students, faculty, and staff oriented and introduced to campus values, resources, traditions, and role models?

8. How is the campus governance structured that allowed for participation and responsibilities by faculty, staff, and students?
Definitions and Terms

The terms values, ethics, moral behavior, and culture are confusing and many times used interchangeably as is evident in the review of the literature. For the purpose of this study the following operational definitions will be used. The terms are discussed more generally in Chapter Two, the Review of Literature.

1. Culture in higher education was defined by Kuh and Whitt (1988) as "... the collective, mutually shaping patterns of norms, values, practices, beliefs, and assumptions that guide the behavior of individuals and groups in an institute of higher education and provide a frame of reference within which to interpret the meaning of events and actions on and off campus" (p. 12-13).

2. Ethics, according to Walters (1988), referred to the study of the good and bad or a theory and system of moral values that defined duties or responsibilities governing human behavior. Wilcox and Ebbs (1992a) defined ethics as the "normative analysis of the moral agency of individuals and institutions and the values they seek" (p. 4).

3. Moral behavior is the "interpersonal dimension of our behavior: how we treat one another individually and in groups (and increasingly, other species and the environment)" (Wilcox & Ebb, 1992b, p. 254).
4. **Values** are defined by Morrill (1980) as "standards and patterns of choice that guide persons and groups toward satisfaction, fulfillment, and meaning" (p. 62). Higher education institutions may value academic excellence, diversity, ethical character, tradition, or any aspect of life that facilitates the decision making process and moral life on campus (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992b). Furthermore, awareness of and sensitivity to the institutional values enhances the valuing process by merging knowing and doing.

5. The **values audit** is a comprehensive, collaborative process of determining differences between explicit and implicit values and the decisions they generate (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). The values audit systematically examines beliefs, goals, standards of choice, and the manner in which they are institutionalized. The values audit can be a formal or informal review of an institution's policies, procedures, practices, and official statements that examines congruence and alignment in what is said and done relative to the vision, mission, and values of the institution. A values audit may be conducted through self-study or by an external agent similar to an accreditation review.

**Limitations**

This study was designed to examine and describe the values system at two educational institutions. It was not designed to be an in-depth study generalized to all institutions of higher education. It is further limited by the researcher's knowledge and participation at one of the institutions. The researcher has been a student and employee at one institution for 26 years, while having minimal observation and interaction with the
other institution examined in the study. On the other hand, these limitations could be perceived as an opportunity to provide a richer perspective.

**Delimitations**

The research was limited to two institutions within the northeast Tennessee region. The two institutions were selected by the researcher due to size differences; diversity of mission and purpose; presidential change within the last two years; shared geographic location; and experienced enrollment and resources growth within the last year. The first institution, East Tennessee State University, is a large regional four-year public university that had undergone a change in leadership four times within the last ten years. The second institution, Milligan College, is a small, four-year private, church affiliated liberal arts college that experienced stable leadership for numerous years before changing presidents in 1997.

**Assumptions**

It was assumed that professionals, including students, agreeing to be interviewed would provide professional insights and honest perceptions to the questions posed. It was further assumed that professional ethics and values were observed by the researcher and participants. Also, it was assumed that the researcher would have access to information or documents that reflected the institutions' explicit values. The underlying assumption for the study was that values are the power behind decision making and leads to decisions and policies in all areas of the institutions.
Overview of the Study

This study was organized into six chapters. Chapter 1 included the introduction, statement of the problem, purpose of the study, significance of the problems, research questions, definitions and terms, limitations, delimitations, assumptions, and an overview of the study.

Chapter 2 provided a review of related literature. The major topics discussed were Overview of the Terms; Values and Higher Education; Values and the College Student; Values and Organizations; Values and Leadership; and Values Audit.

Chapter 3 included the research design and methodology: Research Design, Sampling, Data Collection, Data Analysis, and Summary.

Chapter 4 presented the findings of the first case study, East Tennessee State University. Each research question or guide was discussed.

Chapter 5 presented the findings of the second case study, Milligan College. Each research question or guide was discussed.

Chapter 6 included the summary, conclusions, and findings as compared to the literature and recommendations for further study.
CHAPTER 2

REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

This chapter presented literature relevant to the study of ethics, values, moral behavior, and culture in organizations and specifically higher education institutions. These terms are many times used interchangeably in the literature; therefore, a brief overview of these terms is included in this chapter. The chapter also includes literature pertaining to Values and Higher Education; Values and the College Student; Values and Organizations; Values and Leadership; and Values Audit.

In most definitions of ethics, there was a reference to the concept of "obligation," particularly as it related to professional responsibility (Blau, 1988). In business, there are obligations to clients, stockholders, customers, and society, all making demands upon the organization and the individual employer (Jansen & von Glinow, 1985). With competing demands, ethics within an organization may be an attempt by management and employers to do the right thing (Froelich & Kottke, 1991).

Pfeiffer and Forsberg (1993) defined ethics as the study of justification of ethical value judgments. An ethical value judgment was deciding between right or wrong, good or bad, better or worse, virtue or vice, or what should or should not be done. Justification or ethical principles provided reasons or evidence for truth or falsehood in a given judgment.

Haas (1997), chairman of the board and chief executive officer of Levi Strauss and Co., viewed organizational ethics as a function of the collective attitudes of the
people. He based organizational ethics on six ethical principles: honesty, promise
keeping, fairness, respect for others, compassion, and integrity. He stated that these
ethical principles should be integrated with other organizational values, such as diversity,
open communications, empowerment, recognition, and team work.

A working definition of ethical theory, purposed by Brady (1988), stated that
ethical judgments are largely based upon two premises: utilitarianism and Kant’s
formalism. Utilitarianism denoted the greatest good for the greatest number, while
formalism depended on common human intuition and judgment processes. Utilitarianism
referred to the tendency to assess ethical situations in terms of their consequences for
people. Formalism represented the human tendency to assess ethical situations in terms
of their consistent conformity to patterns or rules or some other formal features.
According to Brady, Kant’s formalism supported the idea that motives rather than
consequences are the basis of ethical decisions. Ethical decision-making emerged from
the act of effective reflection about routine decisions (Brown, 1990).

Kimbrough (1985) stated that ethics "refer to the study of values concerning how
we ought to live" (p. 1); although in formal studies of ethics the term is used
"interchangeably with moral, philosophy" (p. 1). Kimbrough (1985) stated that
"character refers to what we observe as the sum of behavioral qualities that lead to
definition of good or bad" (p. 13). These referred to an integrated, complex set of
emotional, intellectual, moral, and personality traits. Consequently, educational
administrators must be perceived as being impartial, fair, reasonable, competent, and
having balanced judgment.
According to Kimbrough (1985) the deontological view of ethics was that behavior, judged right or wrong, was independent of consequences because people are obligated to do what is right. Kant (1964) would say that good moral people do their duty or obligation because it is right, not for praise or recognition or any other reason. Kimbrough noted the two types of normative theories: consequentialism and deontological. Consequentialism was defined as any type of ethical theory where right and wrong were based upon the consequences of an action. An example of utilitarianism was that one should do what will always produce the best or maximum consequences or outcomes. The intrinsic character or motive was not important, only the effect or consequence. Deontological emphasized the character of the act itself, not its effects. Acting out of self interest and exploiting others was wrong. Some actions were always considered wrong, no matter the consequences.

Kimbrough (1985) defined situational ethics as doing the right thing, not based upon total adherence to moral law. Compromises or difficult decisions were made in light of the highest ethic--love--which could be in conflict with moral law. Ethical relativism questioned whether one moral code is more right than another. The moral code for a society was right or correct for that society. Kimbrough described ethical egoism used by proponents to rationalize one's own self interest or personal welfare and profit.

Some general theories of moral motivation relating to ethics or values and the research conducted on each theory are the following: (Rest, 1983; 1985).
1. Evolution had genetically infused altruism in people causing them to behave morally (Wilson, 1975).

2. The belief in and fear of God motivated people to behave morally (e.g. Aronfreed, 1968; Eysenck, 1976).

3. There was no internal motivation to act morally, only social behavior that is reinforced or modeled (Bandura, 1977; Goldiamond, 1968).

4. Moral behavior was the result of one’s own understanding of cooperation and self benefits as a by-product (e.g. Dewey, 1959; Piaget, 1965).

5. The dedication to or reverence for something greater than ourselves brought about moral motivation (Durkheim, 1961; Erikson, 1958).

6. Moral motivations resulted from empathy or altruistic feelings or beliefs (e.g. Hoffman, 1978).

7. Moral commitment or motivation was influenced by living in just and caring communities which led to a realization of the benefits of such a place (e.g. Rawls, 1971; Kohlberg, 1980).

8. Moral action was the result of the realization that one was a moral agent and was concerned for self integrity (Blasi, 1982).

These eight theories lacked substantial and significant research to support them, but indicated a diversity of views and made for interesting debate.
Values and Higher Education

Traditionally, college and universities have created, possessed, and disseminated knowledge within society which is the source of power (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). Consequently, institutions have a moral responsibility to facilitate the well being of society. According to Wilcox and Ebbs (1992a), higher education has a moral imperative to conduct an ethical analysis of itself. There is an inherent obligation of conscience to be self-reflective regarding various powers and responsibilities.

These obligations are reinforced by governmental requirements for institutional self-assessment to ensure economic cost-effectiveness (Caplan, 1980). Little doubt exists that "institutional self-assessment provides the threshold for moral consciousness in the college or university" (Lenn & Lenn, 1990, p. 348). Self-assessment by colleges and universities occurs in various ways, such as funding agencies requiring outcome assessments and formal evaluations of students' learning (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). Furthermore, regular self-studies, strategic plans, and outcome assessments are required by accrediting agencies and governing boards. In 1990, 82% of all colleges and universities reported such assessments (El-Khawas, 1990).

Wilcox and Ebbs (1992a) reported a direct link between assessment procedures and the institutional mission as reflected in a mission statement based on a set of accepted values. The institutional mission and a process of decision-making including all constituents based upon shared values can produce effective outcome assessments (Kean, 1987). Students' learning assessments, including self-studies and program evaluations, depend upon institutional measurement against a common standard and usually the
mission statement or value system (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). The primary form of assessment, according to Lenn and Lenn (1990), was "self-evaluation that is oriented toward renewing a clear sense of purpose" (p. 342). Wilcox and Ebbs (1992a) stated that by building moral dimensions into communities, the well-being and social responsibility of self-assessment are increased. Ethics or ethical behavior may be replacing assessment as the national focus of discussion regarding higher education's role in society.

Ethical behavior and effective leadership were integrated and inseparable (Butcher, 1997). Furthermore, decisions need to be made in an ethical way, which is an obligation, not just an option. According to Butcher, ethical standards were living, fluid ideals, not monuments. He challenged leaders to set the moral example and not waiver for profit or personal gain. Gardner (1990) stated that college presidents, as leaders, can function as symbols of moral unity within their institutions. There appeared to be much pressure and expectations for leaders of organizations, businesses or higher education, to set the tone and agenda for developing the values and ethics necessary to confront the scandals and lack of trust shown toward the organization by constituents and others.

Higher education has, as a moral imperative, advocated for a high standard of activities or patterns of behavior (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). Individual learning and research, examples of these activities or patterns, represented values in higher education. Other values, such as personal growth and the common good, were the result of these activities or patterns. Historically, higher education has functioned as moral enterprises (Bok, 1990) and were self-serving institutions that encouraged students to seek personal
interest and careers (DePalma, 1991; Laney, 1990). Higher education has lost sight of
the reason for their existence, which is, to teach and promote scholarship (Butcher, 1997).

Faculty and student behavior generally were governed by formal codes and policy
statements (Schurr, 1982). However, no definitive organized association regulated
membership requirements nor governed ethical norms. Kitchener (1985) suggested five
ethical principles necessary for higher education: respecting autonomy, doing no harm,
benefitting others, being just, and being faithful. Essential to the institution was
respecting peoples' autonomy and individual rights to make their own decisions as long
as there was no infringement or harm to others. To benefit the community, the institution
had an obligation to promote the health and welfare of others. By its nature, the purpose
of education was to be just and fair, not necessarily treating all people the same. Being
faithful to this purpose depended upon being trustworthy, keeping promises, and being
respectful as recommended in Kitchener's (1985) five ethical principles. He contended
that through adoption of these ethical principles an effective model for leading an
organization was established. These ethical principles, when consistent and relevant,
were a good foundation for ethical actions and decisions.

While Kitchener's model may be functional and appropriate in some
administrative areas, it can be directly influenced by political issues which causes conflict
(Upcraft & Poole, 1991). Two types of conflict were individual values versus
institutional values and professional expectations for strong management versus moral
leadership. The moral dimension of a situation had to be ascertained and understood in
relation to the origin of choices to be made, then the political and moral aspects of a
decision can be the basis for compromise and resolution (Upcraft & Poole, 1991).

The ethical state of the academic environment had to be confronted on at least two
basic and interrelated levels: individual development (faculty, staff, and student) and
institutional climate (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). Understanding and responding to student
development provided data for making policy decisions. The institution’s mission was
fulfilled as student learning was enhanced. Personal and social issues such as racism,
sexism, academic dishonesty, chemical and substance abuse could be adequately
confronted in a community where ethical and moral values were understood and shared
by all. In assessing ethics and values, both campus and curriculum were important to the
moral life of the institution (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). Through combining both
dimensions and the establishing of a community, a common goal and purpose could be
realized.

The literature describing the immorality of individual actions or policies reflected
pervasive problems in higher education, such as, the lack of community and a shared
sense of values giving guidance and purpose (Bellah et al., 1985; 1991). A learning
community embodying the ideal higher education culture which strived to counteract
individual alienation and intellectual or segmentation, as related to academic
specialization and special interests, would be an effective response to these problems
(Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a).

The learning community was characterized as a moral community (Mentkowski,
1984) and critical to its establishment was the role of administrative leadership at all
levels (Carnegie Foundation, 1990). Leadership, as defined in the Carnegie Report, was ensuring broadly shared and high standard decision-making, occurring at all levels of the organization. Certain types of leadership, conducive to high morale fostered the development of a community. Rice and Austin (1988) concluded that strong leadership is needed for high morale, assuming leadership styles (participatory or hierarchical) are compatible with high morale.

The learning community did not ignore the value of research or the freedom of inquiry, but as a moral community, there was a quest to formulate them into an ethical model and mutual responsibility (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). The learning community reflected a specific ethos, grounded in values which maintain a suitable context for ethical analysis.

Many educators were not equipped with knowledge about ethical discourse and how to apply legal knowledge to practical situations (Chapman, Sorenson, & Lobosco, 1988; Goodlad, 1990). Prospective leaders in school administration should be challenged to give more critical thought to ethical and legal concerns and responsibilities (Bull & McCarthy, 1995). The curriculum should address legal and ethical questions from different perspectives when discussing complex educational issues and problems. Curriculum was an instrument used to examine the implicit values of the institution (Astin, 1989). Does the curriculum reflect social and economic issues facing society or the faculty’s specialized discipline or research interests? The implicit curriculum encompassed teaching methods and the way professional colleagues were treated by each
other. Generally, it reflected competition instead of cooperation within the institution (Astin, 1989).

Values and the College Student

Sandeen (1985) contended that colleges or universities can influence students’ attitudes, conduct, and beliefs formally in the curriculum and informally through academic requirements; faculty and staff relations; emphasis on policies and procedures; and admission and graduation standards. He further argued that when heavy emphasis was placed on research and scholarship, the faculty became disinterested and less responsible for promoting values development in students. As the role of faculty changed, then came the emergence of the student personnel or affairs professional to assume the role of promoting values development. There had to be a comprehensive and integrated effort on the part of the institution to promote values development that permeated the institution from top to bottom (Sandeen, 1985).

Dalton (1985), in Promoting Values Development in College Students, stated that most higher educational institutions were committed to promoting the awareness and commitment to values as part of their mission, and one of the most important educational outcomes. He said there were few examples of student development intervention strategies that were aimed at promoting values development in students even though increasing attention had been given to its importance. Dalton defined values education as the educational efforts aimed at promoting the role of values in student development. He
defined moral development as the educational endeavors designed to enhance students’ ethical reasoning and understanding.

Chickering (1969), in his book *Education and Identity*, asserted that higher education should assist students in values clarification. Also, educators should facilitate students’ analysis of their own ethical obligations to others, the environment, and their professions. Chickering stated that the most significant contribution made to students by educators is to enhance the role of values in their lives. Dalton (1985) argued this was a priority for higher education and should be conducted from a proactive position.

Astin (1977) and Sandeen (1976) found that faculty and student interaction can be the most important positive aspects of the college experience relating to student satisfaction. Students can mature intellectually and socially when guided by faculty that knows and cares for them as individuals. Dalton (1985) contended that moral example can be one of the most significant factors in a student’s development. Heath’s (1968) studies indicated that students’ relation to staff who serve as moral examples promoted values development. Perry’s (1970) research supported Heath’s findings by showing that educators influenced students’ values commitment by being open with their own values, doubts, and personal commitments. Dalton (1985) contended that moral example has the power to influence values directly through personal commitment and action. This can be accomplished through role modeling. Heath (1968) also reported that challenging and confronting others’ values and lifestyles was a significant factor in values awareness and development. Chickering’s (1969) studies reinforced the finding that challenging or disrupting an individual’s thinking pattern can facilitate the integration of conflicting
values within a proper supportive environment. Being forced to decide between conflicting alternatives assisted students in moral awareness and development through the use of hypothetical dilemmas (Kohlberg, 1975).

Another factor having significant impact upon students’ moral development was the manner in which the institution administers rules, procedures, and physical and human resources (Dalton, Healy, & Moore, 1985). The approach used by the institution to monitor the environment conveyed or transmitted certain values and standards to students. Dalton and Petrie (1997) emphasized the importance of higher education institutions facilitating character education activities for students as central to their mission. They included all aspects of the institution as vital components in developing students of character, ready to assume a leadership role in society.

In a study of students’ response to an ethical dilemma faced by a salesperson, Grant and Broom (1988) found a relationship between business ethics attitudes and family income, fathers’ occupation, and type of university. The students’ perceptions of ethics regarding particular ethical dilemmas indicated that those from low income families thought strictly ethical or unethical; high-income students thought in terms of immediate monetary return; and middle-income students tended to compromise. Higher ethical standards were found in students from families where the father was employed in a blue-collar job. Students graduating from a small state university tended to have stricter ethical attitudes, while those graduating from large state universities or a private religious university tended to have more diverse ethical attitudes.
In comparing business and non-business majors, Hawkins and Cocanougher (1972) found business majors having more tolerant attitudes toward questionable business practices than non-business majors. Shuptrine (1979) found similar results in a university setting in a different part of the country. DeConinck and Good (1989) examined the differences in perceptions of ethical behavior of sales practitioners and students enrolled in sales classes. Sales practitioners indicated a greater concern for ethical behavior in sales as compared to students.

The longitudinal research conducted by Astin (1977) on college students showed an increasing trend toward materialism and hedonism coupled with a decline in altruism and social consciousness. According to Dalton (1985), this trend prompted student personnel staff to refocus their energy, interest, and involvement in values education. Levine’s (1980) studies supported Astin’s results as he characterized college students as morally cynical and self-centered, reflecting their dismay with society’s values and institutions, even colleges and universities. Levine’s studies showed an increasing number of cheating incidents taking place on campus, along with more acceptance of cheating behavior.

A report by the Carnegie Council on Policy Studies in Higher Education (1979) found an increasing number of ethical problems in higher education, such as, faculty plagiarism and false or misleading advertising in college catalogues, which has a great impact upon students (Dalton, 1985). In research conducted by the Hastings Center (1980), it was found that colleges and universities were doing little, if any, teaching of ethics. Data analysis from the report revealed that, "There is in higher education a sense
of moral drift, of ethical uncertainty, and withering away of some traditional roots and
moorings" (p. 2). The report was critical of colleges and universities for espousing their
commitment to values development in catalogues and convocation, but not including it in
the curriculum or extra curricular activities (Dalton, 1985). Even though improvements
have been made over time, Dalton and Petrie (1997) encouraged the institutionalization
of the commitment to values education in partnership with the community.

According to Dalton (1985), in many institutions courses in humanities and liberal
arts were dropped for professional and technical curricula. Hall (1979) contended that
higher education has become too passive in regard to moral education. Muller (1982),
president of Johns Hopkins University, concluded that higher education had failed in
providing values development to students and seemingly assumed no moral obligation to
do so. The January-February 1997, issue of Change magazine and the Summer-Fall
1997, edition of Educational Record contained articles challenging higher education
institutions to respond to societal needs through character and civic education at all
levels. There was a sense of urgency for this response, as well as, suggestions for
improvement, which were most of the suggestions advocated in the late 1970s and 1980s
previously discussed in this section.

Values and Organizations

In Organizational Ethics: Paradox and Paradigm, Ritchie (1988) defined
organizations as sets of relationships with rules, expectations, and outcomes outside of
individual ethics. He argued that studying people in groups and organizations was
different from studying them individually. He contended that leaders develop people and people were led. The problem was who decided in what way they were led or changed and by what process. Ritchie concluded that leaders alone cannot control organizational ethics, but it must be managed through involvement at all levels. In addition, organizations must not depend solely upon rules and policies. Instead, leadership and membership must both respect and support ethical relationships.

In a study examining how environmental conditions affect ethical and unethical behavior, Hegarty and Sims (1979) found that an established organizational policy regarding ethical behavior positively influenced ethical decision-making. Organizational culture and climate set the tone for the individual's behavior (Cullen, Victor, & Stephens, 1989). Most ethical pressures and conflicts came from supervisory pressure (Brennner & Molander, 1977).

Wright (1988) asked the questions: (1) Must there be ethical individuals in order to have an ethical organization? (2) Did good systems produce good people, or do good people produce good systems? (3) Were there absolute ethical standards to which we as individuals must adhere? Wright concluded that organizational ethics depended upon personal ethics. Also, individuals must become better persons, if there was to be better organizational governance. Wright further suggested that good systems do not produce good people, rather, good people produce good systems (1988).

In discussing ethics within organizations, Covey (1997) referred to a "true north" compass reading as a symbol for natural laws or principles that should govern an organization. The natural laws or principles were universal, timeless, self-evident, and
based upon an ultimate responsibility to a higher authority. Covey insisted that being values-driven was not enough. Organizational governance should be driven by external natural laws called principles. The organizational leader was the key. People in leadership positions should have vision and positive energy based upon these principles, which when shared and followed, had a positive effect on the organization.

Covey (1997) further discussed the difficulty in keeping people aligned with these principles because of distortions in individual and collective judgment. According to Covey, some of the causes of these distortions were the building culture or internal environment distorting the compass reading; a projector (subculture) or any particular group having their own definition of true north; and a magnet, which can be a powerful emotion, strong personality, compelling philosophy or significant emotional event. Any of these circumstances or forces could cause distortion but when combined could cause dizziness or "ethical vertigo," as Covey described it. A healthy organization must have the value system aligned with correct principles.

Ferguson (1997) pointed to four lessons that organizations must learn during the ethics process: (1) compliance and commitment were not the same, (2) commitment to ethics was attained through face-to-face communication, (3) ethics was a continuous and permanent commitment, and (4) leadership and ethics started at the top. Individuals within the organization would trust management as long as leaders reflected the shared values in their behavior (Johnston, 1997).

Goldberg (1997) insisted that ethical violations must be addressed immediately, firmly, and fairly, or else the ethical culture and climate were suspect. The beliefs.
values, and morals by which the organization existed was called ethical governance. This governance was crucial to the way control, accountability, responsibility, and authority worked within the organization (Goldberg, 1997). The ethical governance of the organization molded its internal culture and external image.

According to Goldberg (1997), W. Edwards Deming espoused the concept that the job of the organizational leader was to facilitate an environment of trust. Goldberg outlined a plan of action to institutionalize ethical governance. This plan included publicly stating an ethical position; the leadership believing in and upholding standards; having an established code of ethics and ethics officers; providing continuous education and training programs supported by leadership; including ethics in the performance reviews, promotions, and compensation process; and implementing clear procedures for confronting violators and violations. The plan had to be established at the leadership level and driven down and across the organization with shared commitment at each level.

Mathews (1988) concluded from studies of ethics in corporate life that society depended on sanctions and internalization of norms to ensure compliance with legal and ethical standards. Leaders must foster a climate where illegal and unethical behavior was unimaginable. She suggested two methods of intervention. The first method was the devising, instituting, and maintaining structural changes, such as, an ethics committee to focus on all areas. Ethical standards must be established and training provided throughout the organization. The second method was the design, utilization, and evaluation of contingency reinforcement that fostered ethical behavior within the organization. Mathews found that corporate cultures that facilitated ethical and legal
behaviors were characterized by trust, concern for the individual, and positive reinforcement of prosocial behavior patterns. All these attributes could be applied to a university setting.

After examining ethical problems in business, Wartzman (1987), in a Wall Street Journal article, theorized that in a typical corporate environment any individual is susceptible to becoming dishonest and ignoring his or her responsibilities. Kelly (1992) indicated that a leader's failure to discuss ethical conduct allowed for interpreting it as unimportant or the acceptance of any conduct.

Peck (1983), in People of the Lie, indicated that doing wrong could be attributed to laziness or narcissism of individuals. Kelley (1992) contended that both characteristics were in each individual, however, followers generally were morally lazy, while leaders suffered from self-importance, a barrier to moral judgements. Leaders made decisions by weighing alternatives and their effectiveness at a level of morality they deemed acceptable. Followers had to trust the leader's decisions based upon personal expertise, legitimacy, and trust afforded the leader.

Social learning theory suggested that institutional and personal moral behavior can be molded by organizational interventions for reinforcement (Counelis, 1993). A university's mission and goal statements should be written as standards and someone assigned to be accountable for implementation. Explicit ethical behavior standards could help in decision-making. An ethics committee or ombudsperson was viewed as useful intervention strategy (Counelis, 1993).
Bowie (1988) suggested that philosophers would agree that ethics required emphasis on the individual employee within the organization. He thought Kant and Aristotle would say only human beings are motivated by moral rules and through their actions placed value on things. Human beings have unconditional worth separate from any circumstances that confer value. According to Bowie, if this is true, then human beings should not be used as a means to an end. Kant would argue that people were an end, not a means to an end. Bowie applied Kant's philosophy to business and concluded that people should not be treated as equipment, but rather should be respected for their individual worth.

Bowie (1988) emphasized that people engaged in rewarding and meaningful work were able to exercise good judgement and to be more creative. Employees should have more autonomy and participate in goal formation and implementation through teamwork. The goal of management should be to provide service and purpose to employees through meaningful work. This goal was reflected in the values and practices of the organization. Bowie suggested this was accomplished through de-emphasizing competition, lessening commitment to individualism, focusing on collective action and cooperation, abandoning hierarchies, emphasizing participation with responsibility, and reviewing necessary management skills, possibly emphasizing liberal arts. These actions were crucial to an organization's commitment to foster an environment which emphasized the value of individuals within an ethical organization.

In Ethics and Responsibility, Walters (1988) emphasized the ethical responsibility of individuals in the study of business ethics. The roles, relationships, and responsibility
of everyone was key to organizational ethics. In colleges or universities, the students, faculty, staff, and administrators were ethically responsible for a productive, humane, and pleasant organization. But can ethical responsibility be taught? Walters pointed to Japanese management theory and experience and answered, "Yes."

According to Japanese theory, efficient management was dependent upon the sense of ethics and personal responsibility in the attitudes instilled into each employee (Walters, 1988). Walters concluded that Americans tended to depend on legal responsibility to teach ethical responsibility. However, ethical responsibility tended to practice the proximity principle which stated that individuals were more inclined to respond to issues and events closer to their own lives.

Strategic planning was a process providing a structured opportunity for faculty, administrators, staff, and students to work collaboratively and constructively within the values system necessary for institutional effectiveness and overall integrity (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). Strategic planning in the future must emphasize the learning community as the institutionalization of a model responding to values and ethical concerns in higher education (Gabelnick et al., 1990). Batten (1994) summarized the relationship of an organization's values and expectations by stating,

organizational policies, procedures, processes, and programs must be individually rooted in the organization's philosophy, which is the basic repository of corporate vision and values, and which, in turn, pervades every part and person in the organization. It is important to note that in the absence of a coherent and cogent philosophy, mediocrity and sense of drift abound. (p. 61)
Values and Leadership

Bennis and Nanus (1985) suggested that leaders were being questioned, challenged, and examined as never before by external and internal forces of the organization. They further stated that leadership was probably the most studied but least understood subject in the social sciences. Bennis and Nanus (1985) defined managers as conductors, being in charge or having the responsibility to accomplish certain tasks or goals. They defined leaders as influencers, those who guided or gave direction, set the course of action or opinion. However, Bennis and Nanus suggested the organizational lubricant was trust, which implied accountability, predictability, and reliability. This was the solidifying factor maintaining organizational integrity. Organizational integrity was dependent upon the organization’s ability to have an identity, a sense of who and what it is.

According to Bennis and Nanus (1985), the leader within the organization set the tone for the ethics or norms that were exhibited within the behavior of the organization. Leaders could set the tone by modeling or demonstrating commitment to ethics, selecting and surrounding themselves with ethical people, communicating a sense of purpose or mission for the organization, encouraging and reinforcing ethical behavior, and communicating the organizational values to all constituencies, internally and externally (Bennis & Nanus, 1985).

The key factor in acting with integrity was to learn to listen to our conscience and to our own responses and act with courage (Covey, Merrill, & Merrill, 1994). The ability to act with integrity necessitated one learning to pause before responding. This pause
allowed integrity to emerge from the human ability to ask appropriate questions, listen without excuse, and courageously act. DePree (1992) stated that "integrity in all things precedes all else" (p. 10).

The key to decision-making within an organization was effective business ethics (Axline, 1996). Unless all decisions were based and grounded in ethics, they would probably later result in trouble. Axline (1996) stated that ethics was the denominator in leadership and organizational performance. Leaders should ask whether the quality and motivation processes were limited or benefitted by the organization’s and leader’s ethics? Ethics was a proactive way of thinking and acting, not a set of codes in a manual (Axline, 1996).

DePree (1992) stated that regardless whether a leader espoused a personal philosophy, his or her values and beliefs were evident in his or her behavior. DePree talked about two requirements of the leader: "the need to give one’s witness as a leader-to make your promises to the people who allow you to lead; and the necessity of carrying out your promises" (p. 17). DePree further iterated there was tremendous power in the promise of a leader. Promises made by leaders could strengthen and enable people, whereas broken or contradictory promises could cripple an organization. DePree advised leaders to promise only what was worth defending. He stated that, "the process of leading is the process of fulfilling commitments made both to persons and to the organization" (p. 23). DePree warned that promises not kept lessens credibility with the followers who ultimately determine the success of a leader.
DePree (1992) stated that the organization expected its leaders to define, record, and demonstrate the values and beliefs of the organization through a clear statement of vision and strategy. The leader designed and set the plan and priorities for the organization at all levels and ensured accountability and continuous renewal. The beliefs and values of its leaders could signal who and what matters within the organization. Therefore, according to DePree, an organization's cultural harmony, future, and health was fragile and must be carefully cultivated and protected by the leader to ensure effectiveness.

DePree stated that the "people, relationships, values, and beliefs are most important to a corporation and fittingly, the most fragile components" (p. 72). Ethical leadership must be nourished by justice, providing an equal playing field or distributing the results equally. Justice required of the leader an obligation to pay something back, guide our lives, and temper our communication. DePree (1992) encouraged leaders to celibacy or making room for what is important, which is, God. Leaders had stewardship over precious resources, carefully guarding our behavior, serving as role models, and fostering an environment which allowed quality time for family and others.

DePree (1992) asserted that ethics and leadership consider the common ground, that is, the needs of the followers must be aligned with the true interest of the leaders. There must be a commitment by the leader to the common good, and the leader must show evidence of the struggle and bear the pain that accompanies this commitment. DePree saw leaders as being: visible; understanding the context in which people work; demonstrating the organization's belief and values; communicating often, consistently,
and articulately; and standing the test of change. He stated that "good leadership includes teaching and learning, building relationships, and influencing people as, opposed to exercising one's power" (p. 77).

DePree (1992) further stated that "integrity is the linchpin of leadership. Where integrity is at stake, the leader works publicly. Behavior is the only score that's kept. Lose integrity, and a leader will suddenly find herself in a directionless organization going nowhere" (p. 220). Leadership was critical to institutional awareness of values in higher education (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). The learning community reflected the delicate nature of that responsibility. The complex ethical issues facing higher education would be more effectively confronted by using strong leadership. Models of ethical decision-making helped facilitate effective leadership in the midst of difficulties facing higher education. Commonalities in these models were the process of issue definitions; analyzing alternatives based on intuitive evaluation or on ethical rules and principles; action plans; and then, implementation based upon sound, deliberate judgment.

The institutional president had the primary leadership role in ethical and academic responsibilities, which can be complicated by faculty expectation of shared governance (Bensimon, Neumann, & Birnbaum, 1989). Effective shared governance required the use of more than one organizational model to respond to situations and multiple realities facing higher education. Leadership focusing on collaboration, using dialogue, emphasizing shared values in a mission statement, and creating an environment of trust helped to contribute to integrative processes and solutions (Fisher & Tack, 1988).

If leaders (presidents) were to function as symbols of moral unity within their
institutions, they must exhibit the necessary leadership (Gardner, 1965). Gardner (1990) defined leadership as "the process of persuasion or example by which an individual or leadership team induces a group to pursue objectives held by the leader or shared by the leader and (his or her) followers" (p. 1). Leadership became "ethical" by providing for the common good, being responsive and compassionate, and working within a model of shared beliefs about standards of appropriate behavior. Effective leadership, contrasted with management (Bennis & Nanus, 1985; Burns, 1978) or combined with management (Gardner, 1990), was characterized by a focused vision; ability to see the "big picture"; effectively communicate and garner commitment; cultivating trust; and by facilitating the process of renewal relating to values, goals, energy, and human capabilities (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a).

Some leadership studies indicated two types of leaders: transactional and transformational (Burns, 1978). The transformational leaders were characterized by integrity, deeply held values, and substantial experiences (Dill & Fullagar, 1987). A transformational leader created a vision, secured others' commitment and support, and institutionalized a change based upon the vision (Burns, 1978). Transactional leadership was characterized by the acceptance of and working within the current structures (Burns, 1978).

The transformational models emphasized communicating values in meaningful ways that empowered the followers (Dill & Fullagar, 1987). When comparing the culture and experience with higher education needs, a five-step process emerged for developing transformational leadership: create readiness, overcome resistance, communicate a
vision, foster commitment, and institutionalize implementation (Cameron & Ulrich, 1986).

According to Wilcox and Ebbs (1992a), the moral and ethical vision of a higher education institution must be fostered and protected by all of its community members. College and university presidents, by their position, must be keenly sensitive and committed to ethical consideration that confront an institution. This sensitivity and commitment was even more apparent in a learning community seeking to recognize and value its diverse populations and complex issues. The president was generally accountable for all that occurred within the institution and must assume obligation to provide and promote ethical, as well as, academic leadership (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a).

Leadership is a moral act encompassed with a vision and commitment to action (taken or not taken) that communicated a message about the values of the leadership (Kouzes & Posner, 1987). Therefore, a president’s actions conveyed information about his or her leadership, whether through everyday interactions, how time is spent, the questions he or she asks, reactions to critical incidents, or decisions regarding who or what receives recognition or emphasis. The president could set the moral agenda by ensuring that ethical issues are recognized and discussed (Perlman, 1990).

Enarson (1984) suggested that due to the need for an ethical dimension to the presidency in higher education, there was an "ethical imperative" to espouse the values and mission of the institutions. The president must convey the information that the moral authority of the president and the university’s moral dimension were connected by the moral direction envisioned by the president (Laney, 1984). In several papers written by
college and university presidents, they referred to the need for personal courage and for consistency in their own moral values and ethical beliefs (Fisher & Tack, 1988).

According to Grant and Broom (1988), a college or university president must effectively communicate the expected values and have a clear vision of the institution's ethical culture and be able to "make it live in the imagination of all the members of the community" (p. 197). A characteristic of a higher education institution that generally had differentiated itself from other organizations was a shared responsibility for governance. However, recent literature reflected a changing role for business and their leaders. In Ethics and Excellence: Cooperative and Integrity in Business, Solomon (1992) suggested that business was a social activity involving community members, interacting for the attainment of common purpose, goals, and a stated mission, such as, the production of quality goods and/or services to produce a profit (Mintz, 1996). He further stressed the importance of virtues in business to act as guides and motivators of behavior in working for the betterment of the community.

Increasingly, college and university presidents were leading with a style that emphasized meaningful interactions in a collaborative empowering manner, maximizing individual potential (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). By empowering the process and the individuals participating, the president must invoke trust, inclusiveness, role and positional reflexivity, and depth of inquiry, that is, asking the right question (Brown, 1990). The basis of a trusting relationship was the belief that others have integrity; however, the leader's ability to meet commitments and keep promises was more critical than other members in establishing a high level of trust (Gardner, 1990). The leaders'
trust was vital to foster the process of ethical reflection and analysis of value judgements and assumptions used in the decision-making process.

Drucker (1964), in *Managing for Results*, suggested that the important question is not how to do things right, but finding the right things to do and allocating resources and efforts to do them. Bennis (1989) added that doing things right is less important than doing the right thing. Wheatley (1988) suggested that this ethical inquiry into one’s behavior was a strong motivator. In combining ethics and motivation, Wheatley concluded that ethics was a means whereby an individual was motivated to transcend organizational circumstances and become productive contributors. Rather than a control or safeguard, ethics provided vital and enabling energy to the organization.

DePauw (1997) described the mental battle over finding solutions and using basic principles in decision-making as being ethical fitness. In the midst of an ethical dilemma, the leader must use a disciplined conscience, a keen sense in the differences between right and wrong and the courage and ability to decide what is right and live by it. Norman R. Augustine (1997), chairman and CEO of Martin-Marietta Corporation, stated that for all the great leaders he has known, ethics came first. By sacrificing for ethics in the short-term, the leader invested for the long-term good of the organization.

Haas (1997), chairman of the board and chief executive officer of Levi Strauss and Co., suggested that leaders and management must model high ethical standards that became part of the organizational culture. He related three approaches an organization could use to address ethics; neglect or lack of ethical programs; compliance based programs with rules and regulations for prevention, detection, and punishment; and
values-oriented programs based on principles and combined functional values with individual responsibility and accountability. Haas indicated the latter approach to be the more desirable. Ferguson (1997) pointed to ethical practices as good business practices. In the midst of change, ethics was a solid and lasting basis for organizational success. The method used to address ethics reflected organizational behavior, as much as, quality, caring for the individual, competition, and earnings growth. Questionable ethical behavior generally resulted in questionable business performance (Johnston, 1997).

Pennington (1997) stated that the lack of trust in our leaders is a major problem facing our society, especially organizations today. Corrupt leaders reinforced the notion that no one can be trusted. All effective leaders emphasized results, while leaders driven by integrity, also, focused on relationships. An integrity driven leader valued trust and respect earned through character, competence, and service. Pennington (1997) outlined five areas that leaders must master to earn the trust of others: (1) exhibit character and behavior that denotes honesty, trustworthiness, loyalty, justice, patience, and duty. (2) surround themselves with competent people who continuously strive to improve, (3) effectively communicate and show concern for individuals within the organization. (4) consistently uphold the standards, even during difficult times, and (5) have the courage to deliver on their promises. Pennington defined integrity driven leadership as the "art of influencing the actions and outcomes in a way that builds trust and achieves results" (p. 7). Three action steps in developing this capability is through focusing on who and what we are; communicating for understanding; and encouraging others' success.
Blanchard and Peale (1988), in their book *The Power of Ethical Management*, described ethical leadership as setting, through example, the tone for honesty and truth for the organization. They listed five principles of ethical power for individuals and organizations. These principles were: (1) purpose is the goal for which to strive, (2) pride achieved through success, (3) patience in holding to ethical values for the long term and through difficult times, (4) persistence in having commitments and living by them, and (5) perspective in assessing the culture of the organization through information gathering, sharing, and reflection. These principles must be part of the mission, values, and vision of the organization and be supported and exhibited by the leadership.

Pfeiffer and Forsberg (1993) described three characteristics of ethical principles which were: individual importance; importance to all people; and the belief in applying the principles to all matters of intent. They recommended the RESOLVEDD strategy for ethical decision-making within organizations: (1) R - review all aspects of the case, (2) E - estimate the implications of the case, (3) S - solutions are generated and listed, (4) O- outcomes are explored for each alternative, (5) L - likelihood of main solutions impact on individuals involved is described, (6) V- identify values upheld and violated by each solution, (7) E - evaluate each main solution, its outcomes, impact, and values upheld and violated, (8) D - describe, state, clarify, and justify the best solution, (9) D^2 -define the decision against objections to the main weakness. Using the RESOLVEDD strategy for ethical decision-making based on ethical principles strengthened the justification of ethical value judgments.
When problems or opportunities confronted leaders, a decision was made based on power, whether coercion, utility, or principles (Covey, 1990). The leaders’ decision would encompass their character, interactive skills, capacity to uphold values, record of integrity and trust, and ability to resist using force. Leaders who desired to improve their principle-centered power must make a long-term commitment. Covey provided 10 suggestions for improving a leader’s honor and power. These suggestions were: (1) persuasion or sharing reasons and rationale, (2) patience or the commitment to process and people over time, (3) gentleness or avoiding using harshness, (4) teachableness or being aware of limitations, (5) acceptance or withholding judgment, (6) kindness or being sensitive, caring, and thoughtful, (7) openness or acquiring accurate information and perspective of people, (8) compassion and confrontation or acknowledging mistakes and allowing for correction with genuine care and concern, (9) consistency or holding to values, personal code, and character, and (10) integrity or congruency between words, feelings, and actions for the good of others. According to Covey, a principle-centered leader use principles in the form of values, ideas, norms, and teaching to empower and enable individuals, while providing a vision and direction for the organization.

As related to a university, the president’s authority as ethical leader combined with the responsibility for the university’s operations (Perlman, 1990). The president set the tone through his or her choice of public topics and private conversations and by giving public trust and being held accountable. According to Perlman, the president was responsible for: (1) establishing policies and standards of behavior that are widely shared, (2) facilitating an accountability model, (3) establishing procedures for
confronting violations, (4) questioning the integrity of supervisors, (5) exhibiting autonomy, (6) establishing an ethical audit, (7) providing for due process, and (8) providing opportunities to clarify and reorganize positive contributions.

The college and university president had an ethical dimension due to his or her being a teacher and educator (Perlman, 1990). The president must make decisions regarding investments or use of funds, personal responsibility, curriculum, budgets, buildings, land, endowments, personnel, and constituents, which all lend themselves to ethical dilemmas. Perlman warned that the president must encourage good behavior, punish bad behavior, and facilitate ethical understanding, while guarding against self-righteousness in himself or herself and others.

Values Audit

An effective means of developing and fostering a learning community was the values audit (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). The values audit was a comprehensive process of determining differences between explicit and implicit values and the decisions they generate. The values audit united the community but was not an end in itself. It was, however, an essential element in the establishment of learning communities. Continual support and commitment by all community members was needed to sustain growth and development of institutions (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992b).

A values audit was used to build a moral dimension providing the institution with understanding of differences in its stated mission and goals. The community's perceptions of the diversion in actions of administration, faculty, staff, and students from
institutional documents could be improved. The values audit could facilitate the enhancement of life in the learning community (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). The outcome of an institution’s assessment of values should maximize sensitivity toward consensus building and the processes of setting values (Smith & Reynolds, 1990).

The values audit was a participatory process that fostered a sense of community due to the emphasis on the shared culture or system of values or value conflicts (Smith, 1984). The values audit was an important analysis of the ethics within an organization or institution. The values audit assisted in assessing and adhering to societal expectations regarding higher education teaching values. For larger institutions, the development of a values audit must include the many subcultures among administration, faculty, staff, and students working and caring more effectively.

The two normative means of understanding and classifying values, principles of consequences and obligations, gave guidance to decision-making and focused on the importance of values, while the moral agency (ethics) of colleges and universities was comprehensive (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). They indicated three areas of higher education deserved focus in the study of ethics: the professoriat, leadership, and campus culture. A literature review in these areas revealed several ethical problems ranging from athletic scandals to faculty plagiarism. Ethical categories, such as equity, fairness, and honesty, allowed for moral or ethical judgments to be made regarding these problems (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a).

According to Wright (1988), organizations typically had procedural codes of ethics and relied on legal interpretation to define conduct. Wright further stated the
university curricula had incorporated ethics through the use of case studies, or studying classic books on moral thought. Ethical dilemmas were presented and students analyzed the case based on their personal standards without a suggested right or wrong (Wright, 1988). Even though, there may be a realization for the need for ethical standards, there was an unwillingness or avoidance in accepting or rejecting an ethical paradigm.

Ethical guidance for administrators had taken a variety of forms (Wright, 1988). Krislov’s (1974) Representative Bureaucracy suggested ethical administration can be attained through institutional arrangement. Dvorin and Simmon (1972) contended that administrators could accomplish desired ends through current intellectual work. Rawls’ Theory of Justice (1971) and Norton’s Personal Destinies (1976) attempted to create theoretical basis for reform. Others have offered pragmatic reasons alone as justification for the acceptance of a code of ethics (Wright, 1988). This reasoning was based on the notion that we live in a litigious age and no one would want to go to jail.

Blanchard and Peale (1988) recommended using ethics as a guide in all decision-making within the organization. Blanchard and Peale suggested the use of the "Ethics Check" questions by leaders in all decision-making matters. The "Ethics Check" consists of the following questions:

(1) Is it legal? Will I be violating either civil law or company policy?
(2) Is it balanced? Is it fair to all concerned in the short term as well as the long term? Does it promote win-win relationships?
(3) How will it make me feel about myself? Will it make me proud? Would I feel good if my decision was published in the newspaper? Would I feel good if my family knew about it? (p. 20)
By using this guide for decision-making and adhering to the five principles of ethical power, leaders and managers could facilitate ethical organizations.

Bennis and Nanus (1989) suggested that leaders articulate the vision and provide direction to their institution or organization. Leaders who espoused clear values and exhibited congruent behavior impacted significantly on the organization. Therefore, creating, rethinking, or revising an institution's mission statement provided a mechanism, whereby, essential values, aspirations, and tensions may exist, also known as, values audit (Wilcox & Ebbs, 1992a). A mission statement reflecting shared values articulated what was meaningful and important to the organization. Such a mission statement could support feelings of personal effectiveness; foster loyalty to the institution; facilitate collaborative goal setting; encourage ethical behavior; and provide the support and framework for faculty, staff, and student development (Kuh & Whitt, 1988). These characteristics would also exist in smaller institutions.

Summary

The review of related literature consisted of six general areas relevant to the study of institutional values: Overview of Terms; Values and Higher Education; Values and the College Student; Values and Organizations; Values and Leadership; and Values Audit. The literature clearly supported the distinct role that values play internally and externally to the institution. Values were primary in fostering effective and efficient institutions that were aligned with their mission and purpose. The leader was the key element in setting the tone by which values would permeate the institution.
CHAPTER 3
RESEARCH DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

Overview of the Methods

This chapter described the research design, sampling, data collection, and data analysis used in conducting this research study.

Research Design

All research should be conducted in an ethical manner that ensures valid and reliable data which increases knowledge and understanding (Merriam, 1998). Qualitative research attempts to search for truth (Eisner & Peshkin, 1991) and to find answers to the "how" of an event or circumstance (Denzin & Lincoln, 1994). Merriam (1988) stated that "case study research, and in particular qualitative case study, is an ideal design for understanding and interpreting observations of educational phenomenon" (p. 2). Case study research has been used interchangeably with qualitative research, fieldwork, participant observation or ethnography (LeCompte & Preissle, 1993; Merriam, 1998).

The ethnographic case study was chosen as the research model for the investigative process for this study. Merriam (1988) described the ethnographic case study as "more than an intensive, holistic description and analysis of a social unit or phenomenon. It is a sociocultural analysis of the unit of study" (p. 23). Merriam further stated that being concerned with the cultural context distinguishes ethnographic case study from other qualitative research.
LeCompte and Preissle (1993) stated that, "Ethnographies recreate for the reader the shared beliefs, practices, artifacts, folk knowledge, and behaviors of some group of people" (p. 3). Guba and Lincoln (1981) stated that a case study provided "thick description, is grounded, is holistic and lifelike, simplifies data to be considered by the reader, illuminates meanings, and can communicate tacit knowledge" (pp. 375-376). They further stated that case study weighed "information to produce judgement. Judging is the final and ultimate act of evaluation" (p. 375). Case study has been described by MacDonald and Walker (1977) as "the examination of an instance in action" (p. 181). Yin (1984) stated the efficacy of the case study approach when, "a 'how' or 'why' question is being asked about a contemporary set of events, over which the investigator has little or no control" (p. 20).

The ethnographic case study design matched the exploratory and descriptive nature of this study because it focused on inquiry around a unit of analysis which could be an individual, program, institution, group, event, or concept (Merriam, 1988). Because values at two institutions were studied, the researcher used the cross-case method of study. In cross-case studies, each case was treated as a separate comprehensive case which involved collecting and analyzing data for both cases (Merriam, 1988). Each institution was treated as a case study, then a cross-case analysis was conducted between institutions noting similarities and differences.

An advantage of a cross-case analysis as described by Miles and Huberman (1984) was that, "One can establish the range of generality of a finding or explanation, and at the same time, pin down the conditions under which that finding will occur"
Yin (1984) stated that a cross-case analysis attempts "to build a general explanation that fits each of the individual cases, even though the cases will vary in their details" (p.108). Another significant reason for using the cross-case analysis is that it allows the researcher to examine "processes and outcomes that occur across many cases or sites" and to understand "how such processes are bent by specific local contextual variables" (Miles and Huberman, 1984, p. 151). In this study, the contextual variables would be the two different types of institutions in terms of vision, mission, values, purpose, size, and structure to determine the values systems at each. These contextual variables are described and discussed in later chapters.

**Sampling**

The two institutions selected for unit of analysis in this study were Milligan College and East Tennessee State University. The two institutions are "naturally bounded groups who share a common geographical location" (LeCompte & Preissle, 1993, p. 62). Both institutions are located in the northeast region of Tennessee, fewer than 10 miles apart in distance. A qualitative sampling technique used by the researcher was nonprobability sampling, whereas, "There is no way of estimating the probability that each element has of being included in the sample and no assurance that every element has some chance of being included" (Chein, 1981, p. 423).

Sequential sampling or selection strategy (LeCompte & Preissle, 1993) was used due to its open-ended and exploratory characteristics and allowed for establishing and examining new phenomena as it developed and evolved. In discussing the sequential
selection strategy, Glaser and Strauss (1967) used theoretical sampling as a means to develop and construct a theory to match the data. During the data collection, theoretical sampling "guides collection of successive data sets, and each pattern found in a set generates the next question to be explored. Answers to successive questions constitute alternative explorations to be discarded or tested, verified, and installed into the mosaic of patterns the researcher is assembling" (LeCompte & Preissle, 1993, p. 252). The researcher selected several types of data relevant to the study of values for comparing and contrasting. The similarities and differences were examined, and as the data unfolded other questions and phenomena were explored.

Data Collection

Permission to conduct the research was obtained through the researcher’s doctoral advisory committee and the Institutional Review Board at East Tennessee State University. The presidents of each institution selected for the study were contacted in order to secure permission to conduct the study. Appointments were scheduled based upon availability and convenience of the presidents. The researcher provided the presidents with a brief description of the study and research questions or guide to be used. The purpose of the study and methods of data collection were discussed with the presidents. Permission was obtained to visit on the campus; interview faculty, staff, and students; observe and participate in campus events; and analyze documents as appropriate. Both presidents were enthusiastic, open, and supportive of the study and requested feedback upon completion of the study.
There were four ethnographic techniques described by Merriam (1988) used in the data collection phase of the research study. The four techniques used were face-to-face interviewing, document analysis, researcher's notes, and participant observation. These data gathering techniques provided the most effective means of conducting a sociocultural interpretation of the data (Merriam, 1988). In each technique, the researcher emerged as the primary instrument for data collection.

The use of the semi-structured interview method allowed for obtaining in-depth data; asking questions of a personal nature; obtaining more accurate and honest responses; following up on incomplete or unclear responses; and direct contact with participants (Gay, 1987). The researcher used open-ended interviewing to gather non-observable information regarding the perspective of the participant (Patton, 1990). Interviewing allowed the researcher to obtain meaningful information by "listening to many individuals and to many points of views that value-resonant social contexts can be fully, equitably, and honorably represented" (Guba & Lincoln, 1981, p. 142). Active listening techniques, such as, being neutral, nonjudgmental, reflective, and sensitive to verbal and non-verbal cues were employed by the researcher to ensure accuracy of understanding. An audio recording was made of the semi-structured interviews, with prior permission of the participants, and a verbatim transcription was made from each recording.

The semi-structured interviews were exploratory in nature, and while using the research questions stated in Chapter 1 as a guide, the wording or order of the questions or issues was undetermined prior to the interview. As data were collected and themes
emerged through the documents, observations, casual conversations, and interviews, questions were adapted as deemed necessary and appropriate. Individuals selected to interview and questions asked were based upon the previous information collected through documents, casual conversations, and observations. Unstructured interviews or casual conversations were used for data collection where appropriate as the researcher was a participant observer. Notes were made by the researcher to document "the ideas, behavior, and non-verbal cues" (Guba & Lincoln, 1981, p. 182). The researcher discussed the data collected and themes emerging with the debriefers. Individuals selected for semi-structural interviews were identified as having the appropriate information, clarification, or insight needed to answer the research questions stated in Chapter 1, as well as, being able to provide feedback upon previously collected data.

The researcher requested and obtained documents such as public records, personal papers, and artifacts (Merriam, 1988) that supported the verbal information given or provided further explanation. The researcher was not limited to this method of inquiry as information was obtained from other sources: library, newspaper articles, observation, and artifacts. The written information examined included official statements and speeches; websites; catalogues and brochures; handbooks; official reports; public announcements; newspaper articles; committee minutes; strategic planning goals; and any policies or procedures applicable to the research questions or issues. The researcher noted the authenticity of the documents; purpose of the document; who prepared it; for what and why prepared; its history; and use (Merriam, 1988). The researcher collected,
reviewed, and categorized every document possible that provided information relative to
the study questions and issues.

The researcher used observation as a means of data collection described by
Merriam (1988) as, "the best technique to use when an activity, event, or situation can be
observed firsthand, when a fresh perspective is desired, or when participants are not able
or willing to discuss the topic under study" (p. 89). The researcher desired to observe the
institutions firsthand and obtain a fresh perspective on the study of values in higher
education institutions. The researcher had been a student and employee at East
Tennessee State University for a combined 26 years; therefore, was a participant
observer (Merriam, 1988) at that institution. At East Tennessee State University, the
researcher functioned as a participant in many decision-making groups and was able to
observe events and discuss them with other participants.

At Milligan College, the researcher became an observer participant due to the
observer's activities being known to the group and participation was secondary to
gathering information (Merriam, 1998). The researcher was able to interview, observe,
and interact with different individuals and obtain much written information, but the level
of information provided was controlled by the participants. At Milligan College, the
researcher had limited observation and participation and relied heavily upon the
perception of others. These perceptions were obtained through casual conversations and
semi-structured interviews.

Patton (1990) emphasized the balance needed between the insider
and outsider:
Experiencing the program as an insider is what necessitates the participant part of participant observation. At the same time, however, there is clearly an observer side to this process. The challenge is to combine participation and observation so as to become capable of understanding the program as an insider while describing the program for outsiders. (p. 128)

The researcher did not become a group member at Milligan College, as was the case at East Tennessee State University; however, adequate observation and interaction occurred to provide rich description and perspective. Guba and Lincoln (1981) stressed the role of participant observer:

Institutions where motives, attitudes, beliefs and values direct much, if not, most of human activity, the most sophisticated instrumentation we process is still the careful observer - the human being who can watch, see, listen . . . question, probe, and finally analyze and organize his direct experience. (p. 213)

Data Analysis

The data analysis for the study followed a qualitative descriptive method and occurred simultaneously with data collection (Merriam, 1988). The exploratory and descriptive method of analysis used is called inductive analysis (Patton, 1990). According to Patton (1990),

inductive analysis means that the patterns, themes, and categories of analysis came from the data; they emerge out of the data rather that being imposed on them prior to data collection and analysis. The analyst looks for natural variation in the data. (p. 390)

The data were consolidated, reduced, and interpreted according to the recurring patterns and themes. These began with the first casual conversations, observations, document analysis, and interviews and continued until the emerging patterns at each institution were at a saturation point with no new information being obtained (Lincoln &
The steps to implement further data analysis included data reduction, unitization, categorization, and verification.

**Data Reduction**

The audio recordings, transcripts, logs, and researcher's journal were reviewed and analyzed by the researcher. All written documents obtained were analyzed by the researcher by the use of content analysis which "is a systematic procedure for describing the content of communications" (Merriam, 1988, p. 116). Altheide (1987) stated that qualitative content analysis searched for insights in which "situations, settings, styles, images, meanings and nuances are key topics" (p. 68).

**Unitization**

The researcher began the process of unitization or coding as described by Lincoln and Guba (1985) which is separating items of information into single units or codes for interpretations. Miles and Huberman (1984) stated that "codes are efficient data-labeling and data-retrieval devices" (p. 64). Carefully reviewing and coding the data allowed for patterns and themes to emerge that could answer the original research questions or issues. This process provided a structural framework for data analysis.

**Categorization**

After unitization techniques were conducted, the patterns and themes emerged for grouping into categories. The broad areas of categorization may represent similar characteristics, such as situations, settings, behavior, and a method providing useful data
(Hittleman & Simon, 1992). As the process of categorization developed, theories or propositional statements began to formulate (Lincoln & Guba, 1985; Patton, 1990). A within-case analysis was conducted for each case and categories identified followed by a cross-case analysis using these categories. The constant comparative method of data analysis was employed during this process to link categories or formulate new ones.

**Trustworthiness**

Trustworthiness of research had traditionally been verified through internal and external validity, reliability, and objectivity (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Guba (1981) proposed to replace "credibility" for internal validity; "transferability" for external validity; "dependability" for reliability; and "confirmability" for objectivity. Lincoln and Guba (1985) sought to operationalize the trustworthiness criteria as an alternative research method to validity and reliability. They suggested five major techniques:

... activities that make it more likely that credible findings and interpretations will be produced (prolonged engagement, persistent observation, and triangulation); an activity that provides an external check on the inquiry process (peer debriefings); an activity aimed at refining working hypotheses as more and more information becomes available (negative case analysis); an activity that makes possible checking preliminary findings and interpretations against archived "raw data" (referential adequacy); and an activity providing for the direct test of findings and interpretation with the human sources from which they have came - the construction of the multiple realities being studied (member checking).

(p. 301)

According to Lincoln and Guba (1985), prolonged engagement and persistent observation provides scope and depth to the research, therefore, each must persist until all relevant information is obtained. Both techniques were used by the researcher at both sites, however, more so at East Tennessee State University than Milligan College. For
the purposes of the study, the process of observation, participation, and interviews by the researcher occurred over a longer period at East Tennessee State University—approximately six months. Whereas, at Milligan College, the process occurred over a two-month period. This was a limitation of the study; however, sufficient data were collected. The process of the collection continued until no significant new data were obtained. The third technique to establish credibility, triangulation, was used through the use of multiple sources and methods to obtain information (Denzin, 1978). Multiple sources of information were identified and cross referenced, such as, documents, speeches, committee minutes, interviews, and observations. Also, different sources of the same information were discovered throughout the research. The different methods used for triangulation were interviews, observations, and document analysis.

Referential adequacy refers to the accumulation of recording material archived for further analysis or review. A tape recording was made and transcribed for all semi-structured interviews. Documents were obtained and catalogued for review by the inquiry auditor.

Member checking was conducted in the study. This is a process, whereby, "data analytic categories, interpretations, and conclusions are tested with members of those stake holding groups from whom the data were originally collected" (Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 314). Member checking may be accomplished formally or informally by providing summaries to members who provided that information or shared with other members for comments or reactions. Both methods were used in this study to ensure the researcher had "successfully produced a reconstruction of the respondents' constructions"
(Lincoln & Guba, 1985, p. 351). Themes or issues that emerged from the data were shared with interviewees for comments and reactions. Observations by the researcher were discussed with faculty, staff, and students at both institutions in casual conversations and semi-structured interviews.

Peer debriefing increased the internal validity or credibility as defined by Lincoln and Guba (1985). The debriefers further helped to ensure the integrity and professionalism of the researcher and data. According to Lincoln and Guba, the peer debriefer should be about the same age as the researcher, familiar with qualitative research techniques, knowledgeable about the research topic, not an authority figure, and should maintain a written record of the consultations with the researcher. The debriefer looks for any personal bias by the researcher that may affect the data analysis.

Two colleagues of the researcher acted as debriefers for this study. Dr. Nancy Dishner and Dr. Carolyn H. Brown. Dr. Dishner, Associate Vice President for Admission and Enrollment Management, serves as Adjunct Professor in the Department of Educational Leadership and Policy Analysis at East Tennessee State University and represents the larger university perspective. She has served on several doctoral committees, has an academic interest in the research topic, and is scheduled to teach a class in higher education ethics. Dr. Carolyn H. Brown, Associate Dean of Faculty at King College, Bristol, Tennessee, has served as auditor and debriefer for other doctoral dissertations and provided the private school perspective. Both individuals have several years of administrative experience in higher education and have knowledge of the complexity of an institution at all levels. The peer debriefers were selected to provide
feedback, clarification, check for personal bias by the researcher, and to ensure the professionalism of the researcher.

Transferability (Lincoln & Guba, 1985) or external validity is difficult to establish. The external validity of the study was enhanced through the use of two case studies and the cross-case analysis (Merriam, 1988). The transferability of the study was further strengthened by providing a rich, thick description "so that anyone else interested in transferability has a base of information appropriate to the judgment" (pp. 124-125).

According to Lincoln and Guba (1985), reliability, or their preferred terms, dependability and confirmability would be established through several of the techniques employed to ensure credibility. The techniques most useful to this process are the inquiry audit, triangulation, and the researcher's journal or notes. An audit trail that described how the study was conducted and the findings derived from the data was made available to the auditor. The inquiry auditor was responsible for verifying the accuracy of the interview transcripts and document analysis, as well as, the data analysis and interpretations. Ms. Jane Jones, doctoral student in the Department of Educational Leadership and Policy Analysis, served as the inquiry auditor for this study. She was provided access to all materials, notes, tapes, and transcriptions used by the researcher.

Summary

This chapter described the qualitative case study analysis used to obtain ample and relevant data necessary for the purposes of this study. The study design described in this section was Overview of the Methods, Research Design, Sampling, Data Collection,
Data Analysis, and Summary. Data analysis, findings, and conclusions are presented in Chapters 4, 5, and 6.
CHAPTER 4

CASE STUDY I - EAST TENNESSEE STATE UNIVERSITY

Introduction

This chapter provides a description of the findings, as the result of semi-structured interviews, casual conversations, participant observations, and document analysis at East Tennessee State University (ETSU). There were 14 semi-structured interviews conducted with faculty, staff, students, and alumni using an audio recorder that provided for verbatim transcripts. Each of the interviewees gave approval to the researcher for use of their name [with a few limitations] with any quote used in the study report. The only limitations placed on the researcher were that quotes would not be taken out of context and member checking be conducted with the interviewee. There were numerous unstructured interviews or casual conversations conducted with faculty, staff, and students regarding the questions and issues addressed in the study and emerging themes. Opportunities for participant observation by the researcher were: President's Council meetings and retreat; cultural diversity task force; standing committee meetings; and other university functions and events.

Document analysis was conducted of minutes from President's Council, Senior Staff, Academic Council, Staff and Faculty Senates, press releases, newspaper articles, reports, websites, handbooks, recruitment materials, catalogs, and other official University documents. Each research question will be addressed in view of the information collected and reviewed from all sources and methods of data collection.

62

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Background information, vision, mission, values, and goals of the case study site, East Tennessee State University, are provided for a frame of reference and set the context within which the data collected is analyzed.

**Background**

East Tennessee State University "is a state supported, comprehensive, regional university in the State University and Community College System of Tennessee and is governed by the Tennessee Board of Regents" (ETSU, 1998g, p. 5). It was founded in 1911 and the main 366 acre campus is in Johnson City, Tennessee. ETSU began as a Normal School designed to train teachers for the rural areas of Tennessee. In 1925, the school became East Tennessee State Teachers College and opened a training school, University School, in 1928. By 1943, the name was changed to East Tennessee State College and, subsequently, acquired university status in 1963 (ETSU, 1999b).

ETSU's enrollment is approximately 12,000 students with 660 full-time faculty (75% holding terminal degrees) and 1,776 full-time employees. Off-campus locations are East Tennessee State University/University of Tennessee at Kingsport; Nave Center in Elizabethton; East Tennessee State University at Bristol; and East Tennessee State University at Greeneville. The University consists of seven colleges (including a medical school) and two schools offering 125 programs of study leading to the following degrees: associate, bachelor's, master's, educational specialist, doctor of medicine, doctor of education, and doctor of philosophy. Fifty-three percent of the student body are 20 years of age or older and less than one-fourth of the students live on campus. ETSU has two
Centers of Excellence and seven Chairs of Excellence that enhance the teaching and service efforts of the University. The University is accredited by the Commission on Colleges of the Southern Association of Colleges and Schools and holds many other program specific accreditations (ETSU 1998b).

ETSU’s current statements of vision, mission, values, and goals were approved by the President’s Council on December 2, 1998, placed in the *1999-2000 Planning Document* (ETSU, 1998e), and distributed to members of the President’s Council. The vision, mission, and values statements are the foundation for the University goals and strategic objectives and are as follows:

**Vision Statement**
To be the university of choice in the region and to become the best regional university in the nation.

**Mission**
Educate students to become responsible enlightened, and productive citizens in a diverse society;
Conduct scholarship that improves the human condition;
Serve business, education, government, health care systems, and community; and
Enhance the cultural environment of the region.

**Values**

ETSU pursues its mission through a student-centered community of learning reflecting high standards and promoting a balance of liberal arts and professional preparation, continuous improvement, and based on core values where:

PEOPLE come first, are treated with dignity and respect, and are encouraged to achieve their full potential;
RELATIONSHIPS are built on honesty, integrity, and trust;
DIVERSITY of people and thought is respected;
EXCELLENCE is achieved through teamwork, leadership, creativity, and a strong work ethic;
EFFICIENCY is achieved through wise use of human and financial resources; and
COMMITMENT to intellectual achievement is embraced.

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Goals - 1999-2000 President’s Planning Priorities

Goal: Educate students to become responsible, enlightened, and productive citizens in a diverse society.

Planning Priorities
Accreditation and Program Reviews
Enrollment Management
Graduate Program growth
Expansion of off-campus sites
Instructional equipment
Develop physical activities center and programming
Faculty/Staff Development

Goal: Conduct scholarship that improves the human condition.

Planning Priorities
Increase scholarly productivity
Develop physical activities center and programming

Goal: Serve business, education, government, health care systems, and community.

Planning Priorities
Expansion of off-campus sites
Increase scholarly productivity
Develop physical activities center and programming

Goal: Enhance the cultural environment of the region.

Planning Priorities
Enhance performing arts capabilities

Goal: Improve stewardship and institutional effectiveness.

Planning Priorities
Salary equity and other salary considerations
Meet NCAA Gender and Diversity Certification Requirements
Provide effective evaluation based on data
Manage by data to remove barriers to improvement

Goal: Provide resources to meet institutional needs.

Planning Priorities
Enhance financial resources
Enhanced physical work environment
Equipment needs
Information Technology

Goal: Establish partnerships and cross-functional collaboration to achieve Goals 1 through 6.

Planning Priorities
Develop cross-functional and interdisciplinary collaboration
Expand external partnerships
Research Question 1: How are the implicit/explicit values of the institution defined?

What are they? Are they written? Where could they be located? How were they communicated through the institution?

A review of the documents and interviews indicated that during Dr. Roy Nicks' tenure as President (1993-97), the University initiated a series of meetings over a six-month period in 1994 with a facilitator from Eastman Chemical Company to incorporate continuous improvement into University processes. Members of the President's Council which consists of individuals reporting directly to the President; Academic Deans; Presidents of Faculty and Staff Senates; and the President of Student Government Association participated in these meetings. In a November 1998 personal interview, Dr. Wayne Andrews, Vice President of Student Affairs, reflected on the process:

We [President’s Council] learned that in this whole continuous improvement effort we needed to define our mission statement more clearly. We needed to have a statement of vision, a set of core values, and we needed to have an understanding of what our key processes were within the institution and how all that worked together. Specifically, related to the values, once we had a mission statement defined, we had several discussions about values and what are institutional values and what do we believe in as a leadership group and how does that get transmitted through the institution. We had identified some possibilities for some values that people thought were appropriate. And then, actually, a small group of us went off line and developed what we called a strawman of a statement of values, and we brought those back to the larger group. It was a small group, five, or six, seven people that actually wrote the value statements that are on the wall there [pointed to framed poster on wall]. We cleaned them up, and we brought them back to the larger group, discussed and debated, fine tuned them a little bit more. But, out of that process came the statement of values as we have come to know them. . . . The idea was born that one of the ways to transmit that information was to put them on a poster like we did, frame them, and make sure every member of the President's Council had a copy, pass them out to anybody that would like to have them on campus. Ask people to put them in offices because unless people understand what we are expressing as values, unless they
are present in the public, then, we wouldn't have a commonly shared view of what they are. So that is where it started.

The value statements developed through this process are found printed on posters, displayed in most buildings and many offices, found on wallet sized cards, and contained in many publications. According to the December 14, 1998, minutes of the Senior Staff meeting, based upon a suggestion by an employee, approval was given to print the vision and mission statements on the back of university business cards. ETSU’s adopted value statements are stated previously in this chapter.

In the same interview, Dr. Andrews further described the values formulation by stating:

We [President’s Council] talked about what is the order, and if we present these values does it matter what order they are in. I remember that discussion very much because I tend to be very people oriented, and I was quite forceful . . . but I thought the value of people should come first . . . that is what that value says, people come first and should be treated with dignity and respect and encouraged to achieve their full potential. I think that should lead the way to all the other values. Of course, the second one relates to the first, relationships are built on honesty, integrity, and trust.

During the series of meetings with Eastman representatives, the President’s Council, according to Dr. Andrews, reached consensus on the values and their order with "little discussion about should we change those values. They are almost unanimously embraced every time we talk about them. The people [faculty and staff] really believe we made the right choices there."

In a November 1998 personal interview, Dr. John Quigley, Past President of Faculty Senate, indicated he was a member of the small group that formulated the values statements. He said they developed a list of items they thought were “important values,
discussed those more thoroughly. I think there was ample opportunity for feedback.” He further stated, “I don’t think that we felt at the time, people come first. I think that was something . . . that needed to be the case, needed to be the first statement of values.”

Along with the posters and cards distributed throughout the campus, other methods of transmission of the values were employed, such as, meetings and word of mouth. According to Dr. Andrews' interview and several references made in past Senior Staff and President's Council minutes, Vice Presidents were asked to share the mission, vision, and values with others in the University. There were a number of workshops conducted, such as, a two day retreat at the Bristol Center for all deans, department chairs, and unit level managers, that was according to Dr. Andrews, " . . . where we went, through a fairly elaborate discussion of mission, vision, values, and key processes." Several sessions were facilitated with selected secretarial staff, SGA, and other leadership groups. Dr. Andrews further described these attempts as getting . . . out of the ivory tower and get it down into the campus community and test the ideas. We disseminated a lot of information. We asked for feedback, and we got some feedback, some positive and some negative. The not so positive feedback tended to be things like we are saying we believe in these values, but we are behaving differently over here doing something specific and that kind of thing. But, I think overall people were generally accepting and enthusiastic about what was presented to them.

The two main methods of values transmission cited by many individuals interviewed and documents reviewed and emerged as: continuous improvement and ETSU Pride. These terms appear to be synonymous with the value statements and expressed as implicit values of the University. In a November 1998 personal interview, Dr. Stanton described continuous improvement:
It was one of the best things to have happened to the University, and I think it will live on, hopefully, forever, the continuous improvement process. . . . Over the course of several months, probably, literally thousands of personal hours were put into the process. And when we came out, when we finished the learning process, we implemented it. I think it has become a way of life for the campus. I tell people there is no area that is sacred or to be spared from scrutiny and asking a group to try and improve upon it. We either look at new opportunities or new programs or activities or to look at how we improve those already under way.

President Stanton further stated that he thought “people for the most part, probably not all, but for the most part people were brought into it and believe in it and been spending their time on task forces to accomplish their goals.”

In a November 1998 personal interview, Dr. Linda Doran, Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs, said,

I think continuous improvement is a culture shift, and it takes a long time. It can not just occur in the administrative offices. It has to be something that engages everyone at the institution. I know when we started all of this we learned some new language like cross-functional teams. That’s just a kind of a corporate way of saying involving everybody at the institution. . . . I think it is a very fine strategy for ETSU because it does involve a lot of people in the decision making process. . . . It is going to take a while to truly become part of our culture, and I think it is on its way. . . . This is just a personal observation, I wouldn’t want to carry continuous improvement forward as the only operational strategy, but I think it is a good context in which other things can occur.

When asked to reflect on observations by several individuals interviewed that continuous improvement has not filtered throughout the organization, Dr. Doran responded by saying, “I think it is probably pretty accurate. I don’t think it is because anybody has failed to involve everybody, faculty, and others. I think it . . . takes a while for us to start living it, and ultimately that will happen.” Dr. Doran commented further on how some of the same people that can make things happen are placed on committees.

She said that
Some continuous improvement activities invite participation in a different way than others might. I think there are plenty of faculty and staff . . . category of people that would be very willing to serve on continuous improvement committees. But, maybe, we just haven’t, or not we, but maybe they just haven’t been invited, and I think that should occur.

The ETSU Pride campaign was noted by most interviewees as having a positive value for the University. The ETSU Pride logo seems to have been adopted as an official trademark or an implicit value as it continues to appear on ETSU documents and symbols. In response to a question by the researcher as to the precipitant for ETSU Pride, Dr. Stanton related,

I was bothered by the fact that I did not see pride, true pride in association with ETSU. I felt we had some outstanding programs across our university, and I thought we had some outstanding faculty . . . our students on the whole were quite outstanding. Yet, there was no sense of belonging or sense of pride in what we had. . . . As I was being interviewed for the presidency, I took a sign about ETSU Pride, that I did not invent, that came from the Alumni Association two years before. But for whatever reason, really had not caught on. I felt this sign expressed my sentiments about this university. ETSU is a university we need to be proud of, and so, I took that sign with me from interview to interview. To each group, I pledged, if I was selected that one of the themes, probably the main theme, my administration would be one to instill the sense of pride in the programs and the people that we have. . . . The first year of Pride Week about two hundred leaders participated and the second year, you have about a thousand, then you have proved you have grassroot support for ETSU Pride. We see that continuing each and every year as a focus of pride week, but some of the signs that were put up during Pride Week are still out there today, and will probably stay out there all year long.

While there seemed to be general agreement that the value statements themselves are good and noble, institutionalization of the values was questionable. There was much discussion by interviewees as to the lack of implementation and integration of the values throughout the institution. As Mary Jordan, Affirmative Action Officer, related in a November 1998 personal interview:
I guess being part of the original continuous improvement or whatever it was that we [President's Council] called ourselves. When we, strategic planning . . . got together and did the goals and the values . . . looked at the purpose and mission was that we did it at the presidential council level. . . . It was expected to be deployed down through the ranks. . . . One of the concerns I have is that when you do that, then you leave it up to each manager, or management person to deploy that in their areas. . . . Some take that very serious, others don't take it as serious. . . . I am not sure that all of that got down to the basic levels, the grassroots level. . . . The model of continuous improvement, or at least the models that Eastman talked to us about, is that you also get feedback from your grassroots, and it filters up into, you know, the decisions. . . . I do know for a fact there was very little input from the grassroots level. I think most of the input came from President's Council, and if, it was deployed for any other comments or input, it came from mid-level and not grassroots. . . . It was like we got the ball rolling, but it never, we never finished.

In Dr. Quigley's interview, he said,

I think there are areas within the University where they [values] are totally accepted. I see it, but then, I think there are other areas where they are just . . . words to the people. They are not going to mean anything. I don't see any diversity in my college, for instance, I have seen that in other areas as well. Oh, I think we strive for excellence and want to be efficient, but I think the three . . . where we have fallen down the most are people, relationships, and diversity.

Dr. Quigley further explained,

I think that we should always be moving to, toward those values. . . . I'm not being negative about the University by saying that I don't think they are embraced, but I think that we have a long ways to go to get them so that they really become a part of our culture and a part of who we are.

Dr. Quigley summarized in these statements sentiments heard repeatedly during the course of this study, in interviews and casual conversations. He also related, as did others, that he had heard comments from faculty about the lack of input into the values statements from the grassroots. In many casual conversations with faculty and staff about
ETSU's values, the researcher noted numerous comments about their lack of input into the values statements. A female faculty member expressed much of the sentiment by saying,

I think everyone would say that those [values] are laudable, and the right kinds of value statements for this university. Probably individually, everybody would agree to them, but I think there is this feeling that it came from on top, and you know, here it is that's being dictated to us. They [faculty and staff] were not a part of the process. And so, if you're not a part of the process, it is hard to buy into it.

There was general consensus that more input and discussion should have occurred throughout the institution during the formulation and implementation of the value statements.

The University values involving people, relationships, and diversity seemed to emerge as the ones that most concern the interviewees as stated by Dr. Quigley. A graduate student interviewed said that,

We [University] have to be willing to hire a diverse administrative staff, a diverse faculty, bring in a number of diverse students, have a diversified core curriculum, and diversified activities. What I am saying, is even though, that is a value or standard of the University is to be diverse and appreciate diversity, unless, it is implemented across the board, then it is not really . . . the University is not really implementing it.

In Dr. Stanton's interview, he mentioned wanting more feedback on diversity. He stated,

Now, I sense on the whole that we are o.k. We are promoting and doing a good job, but I don't really know that. I know that from time to time issues come up and some of them connected with . . . a month of the year. There is a kind of polarization of things to be there between groups, whether it is during gay pride time or during black history month or whatever. I don't really know how committed we are to diversity on this campus. I know what my commitment is, but at the same time, are we doing a good enough job as we need to by that value.
statement. People don’t generally come in here and talk to me about that kind of thing. I have my own sense. . . . I do get a number of e-mails and letters on the value statement about people. . . . I have a number of those that come in under people or relationships.

Dr. Stanton said he awaits the recommendations [due spring 1999] of the Task Force on Cultural Diversity, appointed to study campus diversity from the student perspective. The researcher is a member of the task force and while recommendations have not been formulated, there has been much discussion, debate, data gathering, and analysis. The recommendations and strategies, if adopted and implemented, may help in integrating diversity throughout the campus in a very positive and productive manner.

In terms of attracting and hiring minorities, there was general agreement with Mr. William Coleman, Assistant Vice President for Human Resources, who said in a November 1998 personal interview:

In some areas we have done a better job of recruiting and retaining, in other areas, it appears to be very, very difficult for us to attract minorities, particularly in our diversity effort and especially blacks. It is very difficult, in this area of the country where minority population is low, to recruit locally, to compete locally, and obtain persons of color or religious diversity and with our salaries. It appears that it is very difficult for us to compete nationally, to bring in talent from outside our economic region. I do think that there are some individuals, departments, and divisions that do expend an admirable effort, in most or many of their searches, to try to ensure that they get a good diversity representation within their pool at least. There are others, and this may be a function of the type of work or the degree speciality, that have not succeeded at bringing in persons of diverse background. . . . There are some persons who are not as cognizant of our diversity goals or of the value of diversity in our working environment and in the exposure that our students would get, so therefore, they are not as energetic in seeking diversity in their hiring pools or in their departments as others are.

Mary Jordan expressed her frustration with the lack of support related to hiring by saying,
I am not the affirmative action program. I am the monitor. I am not the person to do everything, and I am not sure I get that message across. I am not sure that other people hear that is part of their responsibility. I am the monitor. I am the one to try to make sure we are doing the process right or whatever. The responsibility lies on the people that are on that council [President’s Council] and on down. I don’t really feel that people have taken on that responsibility. I feel like all the responsibility is on my shoulders. I think we are running our searches the way we say we should, and I think we are, at least on the surface, making attempts. I think there are some inherent kinds of things that we need to deal with, but the program is not my program. It is not my total responsibility and that is why I really feel frustrated. It is almost like, if we can get by Mary Jordan, we are o.k., and that is not the way it should be.

Information published and distributed to the public can reflect implicit and explicit values of the institution. The 1998-99 Viewbook (ETSU, 1998h) published by the Office of Enrollment Management contrasts the 87 years of tradition and history of ETSU. The inside cover lists four features of the 87 years of tradition from 1911-1998 which are implicit values of the institution: (1) Excellence in academics, athletics, and student activities; (2) Teaching as our first priority; (3) Safe and attractive campus; (4) Unparalleled value for your educational dollar. These statements spell out E.T.S.U. and project the image that ETSU is about excellence in all its programs; teaching is valued and comes first, even though, it is a larger university; the campus is safe and attractive even for a larger university; and the quality of the institution is worth the cost.

Throughout the booklet, there is a wide variety of snapshots of the campus, people and activities. The themes contrasting 1911 to the present in the book are these:

We'll give you room to grow.
29 - 12,000 students
a few literary societies to 215 campus organizations and various activities
Sherrod Library to new library (p. 3-4)
We’ve Done Our Homework

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
East Tennessee State Normal School, a two-year program to train teachers vs. our 125 programs offering careers in diverse fields
residence halls vs new 2 or 4 bedroom apartment complex (p. 5-6)

We Also Take Time to Play
features a brief history of the athletic programs growth (p. 7-8)

You’ll be Prepared
14 caring, dedicated faculty vs. 700 caring, dedicated faculty with the same spirit and enthusiasm for learning began in 1911
1951 - first master’s degree awarded
1982 - first MD degrees awarded
1997 graduates indicate 97% were employed and 58% were earning in excess of $25,000 per year
1,800 associate, bachelor’s, master’s, and doctoral degrees awarded annually
Now ETSU graduates are ready to meet the challenge of the future (pp. 9-10)

The Viewbook attempts to highlight positive growth for the University from its beginning. Growth is defined in quantitative measures of excellence that emerged through observation and document analysis as implicit institutional values. Many, if not most, University documents use quantitative measures for providing description of ETSU.

Research Question 2: How are the implicit/explicit values in the institution focused in the curriculum? Where? How taught?

The introduction paragraph to the University’s explicit values statement reflects that, “ETSU pursues its mission through a student-centered community of learning reflecting high standards and promoting a balance of liberal arts and professional preparation, continuous improvement, and based on core values.” Parallel to the formulation of this value statement, the University adopted a revised General Education Program, “applicable to all first-time ETSU students pursuing a baccalaureate degree who

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
enter the university in fall 1995 or later” (ETSU, 1998g, p. 42). This revised General Education Program, as stated in the undergraduate catalog, was designed to fulfill the University’s mission to “educate students to become responsible, enlightened and productive citizens in a diverse society” (p. 42). The philosophy and goals of general education as stated in the Undergraduate Catalog 1998-99 (ETSU, 1998g) states the philosophy and goals of general education as,

The purpose of general education is to provide a common experience in order to ensure that students acquire skills, knowledge, and the ability to think critically and to perceive interdisciplinary relationships. Students should develop qualities of thought and character that foster and support a lifetime of learning, full and rounded lives, meeting expectations of the workplace, and the desire for quality living in a complex and changing world. (p. 42)

The expectation and underlying premise of the general core curriculum is that a collection of the prescribed courses will equip students with basic proficiencies and expose them to other areas of familiarity necessary for an educated person living in a complex and changing world. These areas of familiarity focused throughout the curriculum relate to the University’s implicit and explicit values and, according to the Undergraduate Catalog 1998-99 (ETSU 1998g), are to ensure the following:

1. that students understand selected basic scientific principles and technological accomplishments which have shaped our culture and others, that they through in-depth awareness of at least one field of science - to understand that science is the process used to discover the fundamental laws of our natural world, and that they also come to understand the power and limitation of the scientific method, of qualitative thinking, and of technology;

2. that students understand major components of our nation’s heritage - people, ideas, and a wealth of cultural diversity -
and how that heritage intersects with and informs our own lives both today and for the future;

(3) that students understand how the arts and humanities inform our ability to perceive and appreciate beauty, understand the relationships between art and other elements of culture, and perceive the complex fabric of assumptions that undergird a society at any point in time and place;

(4) that students identify their own beliefs, ethical bases for decision-making, values, and sense of social responsibilities by using the humanities and literature to experience from other perspectives some of the great thinking about personal identity, social relationships, and social and personal responsibility; and

(5) that students in the interest of social and ethical responsibility are exposed to varied value and belief systems and the historical and cultural processes that produce them and are also able to think critically about how individuals are influenced by institutions (political, economic, cultural, or family in our own or other cultures) and how institutions might be directed toward constructive ends. (p. 42)

The philosophy and goals of the ETSU’s general education program have two primary goals as stated in the Undergraduate Catalog 1998-99 (ETSU, 1998g):

First, they seek to ensure that students who earn the baccalaureate degree possess those basic proficiencies that denote an educated person and one suitable for employment. Second, ETSU’s general education aims to ensure that graduates understand information and modes of investigation that will permit them to continue to learn, to see relationships and verify learning experiences, and to find their own voices. This understanding will enable students to adapt to change, to appreciate cultural variation, and to show respect and suspend judgment toward others when exploring different viewpoints and alternatives to problems. (p. 42)

An outside reviewing committee submitted a narrative report in March 1997 after a self-study was conducted and followed by an on-site visit. The ETSU General Education Review Final Narrative Report (ETSU 1997a) stated that the University had...
met all standards set forth by the Tennessee Board of Regents. The narrative report cited as strengths the broad participatory study and a shared commitment to improvement through professionalism and mutual respect exhibited by the administration, faculty, and staff. The narrative report stated that the General Education Program, “furthers the approved mission of the University by reflecting documented needs of the work force while preserving the traditional utility of a liberal arts education in ensuring cultural awareness, adaptability, and a commitment to life-long learning” (p. 1).

Other strengths cited in the review committee’s narrative report were increased opportunities for common learning; the level of faculty preparedness reflected a commitment for a quality teaching and learning environment; faculty development opportunities were available and being used; comprehensive evaluation of teaching effectiveness; increased number of intensive course offerings; an on-going assessment program; increased availability of computers for students; general education objectives and requirements are widely communicated; advisement is taken seriously; and the negotiating of clear articulation agreements with community colleges has been successful and commendable. Some of the challenges for the University that were reflected in the narrative report dealt with issues such as the need for increased or reallocation of funding; refinement of programmatic objectives and student outcomes; refinement of course offerings; need for fundamental change in traditional academic disciplines and administrative structures; traditional pedagogy still dominates; providing training in using new instructional technologies; incentives for faculty to improve delivery systems; and
find ways to convey the general education program's mission, purpose, philosophy, goals, and objectives to the students.

Two of several recommendations cited in the narrative report (ETSU, 1997a) were “further integration of disciplines in order to create broader and more inherent perspectives, especially in the areas of Science, Arts and Artistic Vision, Institutions and Society, and Identity, Ethics, and Social Responsibility” (p. 5). Secondly, “seek additional cost-effective opportunities for expanding interdisciplinary learning” (p.5). Dr. Doran lauded the general education curriculum for “putting a strong emphasis on internationalism, on global issues, and diversity matters.” She cited other efforts in the curriculum that are addressing issues of values as it relates to diversity, such as the international studies minor, an interdisciplinarian effort to prepare students for the future.

Through interviews, observations, and review of committee minutes and reports, there emerged several initiatives integrating values into the curriculum. The major initiatives seem to be the Kellogg III grant, service learning, interdisciplinary classes and programs, community partnerships, and specially designed classes.

Kellogg Grant III

In many different meetings and fora observed by the researcher, the Kellogg III grant was referred to numerous times as an opportunity to "transform the university." In a November 1998 personal interview, Dr. Andrews stated that

The Kellogg grant opportunity came to us because the people at the Kellogg Foundation said “you all at East Tennessee State University have done an absolutely, marvelous job in the health side of the University in transforming how you teach health care professionals by involving them in community”. . .
Kellogg I and II were all about getting the Public and Allied Health, Nursing, the Medical School out into the community, taught in the community, taught with community resources and university resources.

The Kellogg Foundation was interested in ETSU working in and with communities through programming or projects, such as, child care, crime, leadership for youth, and youth recreation. Students, faculty, and staff would work with the participating communities on the perceived needs of the community. In a November 1998 personal interview, Dr. Linda Doran, Associate Vice President of Academic Affairs, stated that the, “Kellogg grant is really institutional wide, and it is geared to help us think through transforming curriculum to engage students in service learning, in outreach, in living out our values in our communities.”

Service Learning

There is currently an Introduction to Service Learning class (HUMT 1020) for students of any major, according to a brochure from the Office of Student Life and Leadership describing the Service-Learning Program (ETSU, 1998c). The class is a three-credit class with a 30-hour service commitment that is described as an experiential, values-based course that meets oral and writing-intensive requirements. There are service learning courses through art, education, nursing, and social work. In a December 2, 1998, presentation before President's Council, Dr. Deborah White, Assistant Vice President for Student Life and Leadership, outlined a plan and the cost for ETSU to take the lead position in becoming the premier school in the state for service learning. There was consensus of the Council that ETSU should pursue funding from state appropriations
for a grant to establish a center for excellence at ETSU. The President's Council voted to support and pursue the establishment of a Center for Excellence in Service Learning at ETSU.

Whether it is a major organized effort to incorporate service learning into the curriculum, there are various efforts being made. In a November 1998 personal interview, Dr. Linda Doran, Associate Vice President for Academic Affairs, indicated a task force has been recently appointed to study the strategies to integrate service learning into the general core curriculum. The President's Council minutes dated December 2, 1998, stated that, "Dr. Bach praised our service-learning program as a bridge between Academic Affairs and Student Affairs to help build a greater sense of responsibility among our students." There is administrative support for these initiatives as evidenced by the decision to pursue a center of excellence for service learning. There are partnerships developing on campus and within the community to accomplish these initiatives.

Interdisciplinary Initiatives

A review of the minutes of Academic Council for the last two years indicates several new interdisciplinary initiatives integrated into the curriculum. When asked if these interdisciplinary initiatives were being encouraged by the University, Dr. Doran responded by saying, "Yes, I would definitely say so. It is something that is being strongly encouraged. It is something that makes a lot of sense. It avoids duplication of spending." Colleges of Public and Allied Health, Nursing, and Business have developed several cooperative classes or programs that will assist students in broadening their
opportunities and perspectives. The Kellogg's I, II, and III grants and a new health care management graduate certificate are examples of interdisciplinary opportunities and initiatives. Dr. Doran also cited a new liberal arts master's degree program as another interdisciplinary initiative. She said it "permits the student to really design a curriculum, and it draws very heavily on almost all of the departments in the College of Arts and Sciences."

Community Partnerships

Several partnerships are being developed, not only through Kellogg I, II, and III grants, but other grants through the City of Johnson City, state, and federal governments. An example is the ETSU Community Partnership Center which the researcher toured on November 18, 1998, with other members of the President's Council. This is an off-campus center using university resources such as faculty and students, in the community to address local and regional concerns and to provide integrated health and human services to the region. The Center coordinates services through the state's Families First Program; Welfare to Work; Community Outreach Partnership Center; Court Appointed Special Advocate Programs; Gear Up Youth Program; Enhancing Employability Project; and Service Learning Opportunities. All of these programs are designed partnerships between ETSU and local, state, and federal agencies to provide needed services to low income individuals and groups within the community.
Research Question 3: Is there an academic honor code?

The university has an academic honor code that is stated in the 1998-99 Spectrum (ETSU, 1998d), the student handbook:

East Tennessee State University is committed to developing the intellect and moral character of its students. To that end, all instances of plagiarism, cheating, and other forms of academic misconduct shall be punished in accord with Tennessee Board of Regents policy. Any knowledge of conduct of this nature should be reported to the proper authorities. Not reporting instances of academic misconduct represents a fundamental break with honor code policy, and although this offense is not punishable, reflects a callous disregard for yourself, your classmates, and your professors. (p. 31)

A Syllabus Attachment (ETSU, 1998f) is published by the Office of Admissions and Enrollment Management for distribution to students along with the course syllabus. The fall 1998 Syllabus Attachment contained a paragraph regarding classroom conduct with excerpts from the 1998-99 Spectrum (ETSU, 1998d):

Students are expected to conduct themselves in an orderly and civil manner while in the classroom and in their communications with instructors. The instructor has the primary responsibility for control over classroom behavior and maintenance of academic integrity, and can order the temporary removal or exclusion from the classroom of any student engaged in disruptive conduct or conduct violative of the general rules and regulations of the university. Disorderly conduct is defined as any individual or group behavior which is abusive, obscene, lewd, indecent violent, excessively noisy, disorderly or which unreasonably disturbs other groups or individuals. (p. 1)

Regarding the academic honor code, one student interviewed stated,

I think the university has a broad, loosely defined academic honor code published in the Spectrum section of the student directory. Probably, if you asked 9 out of 10 ETSU students they would say "no" there is not an honor code at ETSU simply because it is not included on course syllabi. It's not incorporated well into documents at the university, and it is not common knowledge.
Several students and staff interviewed during the study were unaware of the University’s honor code. The Student Government Association President, Mr. Russell Wilson had knowledge of the honor code. When asked, during a personal interview in November 1998 if he thought most students are aware of an honor code and what it is, he responded by saying,

Not like they do at private colleges. I went to a conference at Davidson College, and they were talking about their honor council... It’s not nearly as prominent or spoken about... as I guess it might be at some of the private, more smaller institutions or private institutions. That’s something a lot of those students take very seriously there... I think if people would ask what the honor code is here, people would just be like, you’re not suppose to cheat, but I don’t guess your teacher would get you in trouble.

The researcher asked Mr. Wilson if he thought students would support a change in the honor code to reflect as a violation the failure to report a known violation and hold each other accountable. He responded that

It depends on how it was presented. Probably, you know, if not, it is a pretty big problem if students wouldn’t support being honorable in their actions. Holding each other accountable that would take a while to get ingrained into the process. If you went from what we have now with very little knowledge or anything about it and just implemented what schools that have pursued their honor code for a long time... you would get a lot of negative feedback. But, if it were to be worked in, I think that would be something that students would take seriously.

Mr. Wilson’s comments could describe the process that ETSU has experienced and is currently going through as the ETSU vision, mission, and values statements are introduced. There has to be an adoption and integration process to occur overtime.

Another student interviewed said,
I think the University needs to make the values and standards of the university, the academic code, the honor system more clear and more evident to all students. At times, I think the University simply publishes something in the student handbook or includes it in a registration booklet and believes that the mass number of students reads that and understands it and incorporates it into their career at ETSU, when most times I don’t feel that is true. Personally, I think a standard course for all university students, a mandated course for all students to take, probably during their freshman year that not only deals with the transition to the University life and career planning and helping them get on track for college, but also deals with what this University is about. These are our values and our standards, this is how we implement them, this is how we expect you to implement them. Something across the board that tells students up front what we are and what we expect of them during their stay here and afterward.

The November 9, 1998, minutes of the Faculty Senate reflected that the Academic Matters Subcommittee was “contemplating recommendations for changes in the honor code.” A review of the University Judicial Committee’s annual report for 1997-98 indicated three academic related cases heard; two on disorderly conduct in the classroom and the third, a theft in a clinic situation. According to the policy related to academic misconduct, the instructor has the primary responsibility for control over the classroom behavior and can order suspension or exclusion or assign an “F” or a zero grade if deemed appropriate. The student would have the right to appeal the action of the instructor and a process is established by the University to conduct such an appeal.

The researcher acted as an advisor for the University Judicial Board on February 11, 1999, in the place of the Associate Vice President of Student Affairs. The University Judicial Board dismissed, from class, a student charged with classroom misconduct. The Board, consisting of three faculty and three students, found the student guilty of verbal abuse and using profanity in a threatening manner toward a professor in the presence of
other students. The Board unanimously voted for the sanction of dismissal from the class as a means of accountability, thus sending a message that classroom misconduct and disrespect for faculty and students would not be tolerated at the University.

Research Question 4: Is there a written institutional code that defined rights, duties, and responsibilities of faculty, staff, and students?

Students

There are statements or policies in the 1998-99 Spectrum (ETSU, 1998d), student handbook, that delineate some of the rights, duties, and responsibilities of students. An institutional policy statement preceding the disciplinary offenses reads that

University students are citizens of the state, local, and national governments, and of the academic community, and are, therefore, expected to conduct themselves as law abiding members of each community at all times. Admission to an institution of higher education carries with it special privileges and imposes special responsibilities apart from those rights and duties enjoyed by nonstudents. (p.15)

The handbook further states that

Disciplinary action may be taken against a student for violations of the foregoing regulations which occur on institutionally owned, leased, or otherwise controlled property, or which occur off-campus when the conduct impairs, interferes with or obstructs any institutional activity or the missions, processes and functions of the institution. In addition disciplinary action may be taken on the basis of any conduct, on or off-campus which poses a substantial threat to persons or property within the institutional community. (p. 16)

The University has adopted the Academic Advising Rights and Responsibilities for students and advisors that are found in the 1998-99 Spectrum (ETSU, 1998d). The Student Rights and Responsibilities states the student has the

1. . . . right to an advisor . . . responsibility to learn the name and location early in their first semester.
2. . . . responsibility to schedule appointments with his/her advisor and to keep them. . . .
3. right to expect advisor to thoroughly understand the university’s structure and its academic policies.

4. right to expect advisor will be familiar with the variety of degree offerings; the procedure for referral to and the types of support services available.

5. responsibility for decisions made seek assistance with the decisions to be made.

6. right to expect advisor to help plan a program of study.

7. right to expect the advisor to create an atmosphere of openness, caring and concern so meaningful communication and trust can occur.

8. responsibility to consult with advisor on a regular basis.

9. responsibility to follow through with appropriate action after the advising session.

10. responsibility to seek reassignment if differences between the advisor and student should develop.

Advisor Rights and Responsibilities

1. responsibility to know advisees’ names.

2. responsibility to keep all scheduled appointments.

3. right to expect the student to be knowledgeable about policies, procedures and requirements.

4. responsibility to gain the necessary knowledge and skills to effectively and accurately articulate specific degree requirements.

5. responsibility to provide accurate information about alternatives, limitations and possible consequences of academic decisions.

6. right to expect the student will clarify personal values and goals in advance of the advisement session and will be prepared.

7. right to be treated in a respectful manner and to become acquainted with advisee.

8. responsibility to maintain a complete and accurate file on the student.

9. right to expect the student to meet with the advisor at appropriate times.

10. responsibility to assist in that reassignment process. (p. 22-23)

These rights and responsibilities, as stated in the Spectrum (ETSU, 1998d) were developed as part of “a continuous, interactive process between an advisor and student which facilitates the development and achievement of the student’s overall goals” (p. 22).
These were developed as a continuous improvement initiative which places value on academic advising while holding student's accountable as well.

The University outlines in the Spectrum (ETSU 1998d), the student's Bill of Rights that are guaranteed by the Federal and State Constitutions or statutorily created legislation. These rights include the following: freedom of inquiry, speech, expression, peaceable assembly, and religion; freedom from unreasonable search and/or seizure of person or personal property, discrimination or harassment on the basis of sex, age, race, color, religion, national origin, or other protected status; right to privacy, and right to due process. The Tennessee Board of Regents has granted these additional rights: right to due process in disciplinary procedures; right to expeditious review of disciplinary sanctions upon appeal; and right to affiliate or establish with officially registered student organization if membership requirements or official procedures have been satisfied.

In regard to the non-discriminatory rights, the Human Equality Committee of Lambda Society (student organization for gays and lesbians) sent a proposal to the Faculty and Staff Senates requesting their endorsement of a non-discrimination policy based upon sexual orientation. At the February 9, 1998, Staff Senate meeting, the Senate voted to refer the matter to the Task Force on Cultural Diversity with no further action or recommendations. The Faculty Senate had discussions regarding the proposal at three different meetings. On January 26, 1998, the Faculty Senate minutes stated the motion was approved "that the information concerning the issue of sexual orientation currently under discussion be forwarded to the Task Force on Cultural Diversity by Jane Melendez, who is a member of the Task Force, and that she report to the Faculty Senate."
any discussion the Task Force may have.” The matter is currently under review by the Task Force on Cultural Diversity whether to recommend that the University adopt the proposal.

The 1998-99 Spectrum (ETSU, 1998d) states the student’s rights in regard to their educational records:

The Family Educational Rights and Privacy Act (FERPA) affords students certain rights with respect to their education records. They are:
1. The right to inspect and review the student’s education records within 45 days of the day the University receives a request for access.
2. The right to request the amendment of the student’s education records that the student believes are inaccurate or misleading.
3. The right to consent to disclosures of personally identifiable information contained in the student’s education records [with some exceptions].
4. The right to file a complaint with the U.S. Department of Education concerning alleged failures by East Tennessee State University to comply with the requirement of FERPA. (p. 29-30)

Faculty

There are no written institutional code that defined rights, duties, and responsibilities of faculty. In the Faculty Handbook (ETSU, 1999a, section 2.1) there are some general employment policy statements for teaching and research faculty entitled “Policy on Academic Freedom, Responsibility, and Tenure,” as revised on September 19, 1986, in accordance with and subject to Tennessee Board of Regents’ policies. Some rights afforded to faculty are that full-time faculty may be granted continuing employment as outlined in the tenure policies, and any termination has to be made in accordance to...
these policies; the terms of appointments for new faculty shall be submitted in writing to the faculty member; a new faculty member shall be furnished a copy of the **Faculty Handbook** (ETSU, 1999a) and informed of current standards; and faculty are to be updated on expectations for performance including requirements for promotions and tenure. The **Faculty Handbook** states that

ETSU endorses the 1940 Statement of Principles on Academic Freedom and Tenure of the American Association of University Professors as revised and refined since 1940, and also the Statement on Professional Ethics of the same organization, insofar as these are not limited by State law or the policies of the Tennessee Board of Regents.

The University recognizes the principle of academic freedom, pursuant to which: The faculty member is entitled to freedom in the classroom in discussing his/her subject, being careful not to introduce into the teaching controversial matter which has no relation to the subject. (section 2.1.2.1)

The faculty member is entitled to full freedom in research and in the publication of the results, subject to the adequate performance of his/her other academic duties; but research for pecuniary gain must be based upon an understanding with the authorities of the institution. (section 2.1.2.2)

The faculty member is a citizen, a member of a learned profession, and an officer of an educational institution. When the faculty member speaks or writes as a citizen, he/she should be free from institutional censorship or discipline, but should make every effort to indicate that he/she does not speak for the institution. (section 2.1.2.3).

The **Faculty Handbook** further states that,

implicit in the principles of academic freedom are the corollary responsibilities of the faculty who enjoy that freedom. Incompetence, indolence, intellectual dishonesty, serious moral dereliction, arbitrary and capricious disregard of standards of professional conduct... The right to academic freedom imposes upon the faculty an equal obligation to take appropriate professional action against faculty members who are derelict in discharging their professional responsibilities. (section 2.1.2.4)

The faculty member's responsibilities are to demonstrate effectiveness in teaching and other academic assignments; research, scholarly and creative activity; professional...
degrees, awards, and achievements; service of a professional nature to the institution, community, and state activities; membership and leadership in professional organizations; continual professional growth; and demonstrated willingness and ability to work effectively with colleagues in support of the institutional mission and goals.

Research Question 5: Is there a written institutional creed or statement that articulated the expectations of faculty, staff, and students?

ETSU has no institutional creed separate from the values statements and stated expectations in the student and faculty handbooks. Currently, there is no recently updated staff handbook, although one is currently being written by the Staff Senate in conjunction with the Office of Human Resources.

The Spectrum (ETSU, 1998d) outlines student’s legitimate expectations:
1. Classes meet as scheduled, and begin and adjourn on time
2. Course requirements are clearly specified
3. The instructor is prepared for class and possesses both oral and written communication skills
4. Paper project grades and test results are received in a timely manner
5. Information about progress in course work is provided
6. The instructor is qualified to teach the subject matter

Additionally, students have the right to expect

1. Accurate information concerning institutional services, regulations, policies and procedures, in published form
2. Representations in university governance system
3. Sound and accurate academic advice, information regarding courses required for graduation, and their schedule sequence
4. Reasonable notice of any changes in academic requirements or programs and assurance that such changes will not be made in a way that unduly impedes the academic progress of the student already enrolled

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
5. Flexibility in course scheduling (by dropping and adding) or withdrawing within university guidelines
6. Information about the various types of financial assistance available
7. Freedom to evaluate courses, programs and services, and provide input to appropriate segments of the campus administration. (p. 25-26)

In regard to a class attendance policy, the Spectrum (ETSU, 1998d) states that:

It is expected that a student will attend classes regularly and give the faculty member a reason for any absence. . . . Each department within the university has the right to set a maximum number of absences (including absences due to university activities and illnesses) permitted during an academic term. . . . At the beginning of the course each faculty member must provide a written statement governing attendance policy. . . . It is the student’s responsibility to ascertain the policy in that class. (p. 26)

The privilege of having access to the University’s network and its resources carries with it responsibilities for compliance. As stated in the Spectrum (ETSU, 1998d), “Everyone within the ETSU community who uses networked computing and communications facilities has the responsibility to use them in an ethical, professional, and legal manner and to abide by TECNET policies. Users should respect the privacy rights of others” (p. 28).

Research Question 6: What incentives and programs were offered for participants in community service and community building activities?

Students- Academic

There are opportunities for community service and community building activities through initiatives centered around the curriculum and academic credit as described in Research Question 2. Academic credit offers an attractive incentive for students. Based
upon the researcher's observations, there has been a significant increase in community
service opportunities, and the trend seems to be intensifying, either through partnerships,
interdisciplinary initiatives, or accreditation issues. The opportunity is available to
incorporate community service and community building activities into the general core
curriculum with exposure to all students. Also, increased research emphasis has potential
for further community service initiatives with which students may engage. These
opportunities allow students to develop leadership skills and gain experience while
providing much needed services. Certainly, these initiatives fall under the vision,
mission, and values of the institution of being a regional university servicing the
community, respecting people, and building relationships.

Students - Extra-curricular

There are service opportunities for students in over 200 student organizations that
exist on the campus. Many of these organizations work with Volunteer ETSU which
coordinates community service projects on and off campus. Examples of projects
supported by Volunteer ETSU are Adopt-a-School, Alternative Spring Break, Habitat for
Humanity Collegiate Chapter, and many other local service and community
organizations.

Student organizations are recognized for their participation in Volunteer ETSU at
a campus-wide reception where they receive certificates. In 1997 students recorded
56,200 service hours of community service. The University’s goal is to increase the
amount of participation and the number of hours students will contribute to community
service beyond the classroom. According to the Division of Student Affairs Indicators of Success (ETSU, 1998e), “over the next five-year period (1998-2002) the number of students participating in educationally purposeful programs/activities outside the classroom will increase by 20%” (p. 37).

Each year juniors, seniors, and graduate students are selected by a campus committee of faculty, staff, and students to be named to the Who’s Who Among Students in American Universities and Colleges. According to the ETSU Accent (ETSU, 1998a), a faculty and staff newsletter, the students are “selected based on their academic achievement, service to the community, leadership in extra curricular activities, and potential for continued success” (p. 18). The students are honored with a campus wide reception, plaque, and certificate.

The Campus Life and Leadership Office sponsors the Student Leader Hall of Fame and Unsung Hero Awards each year. These awards are given to student leaders who have demonstrated outstanding service to campus life through their organizational involvement. Faculty Awards are presented to students judged by faculty to be the most outstanding in each department based on academics, leadership, and service. The Residence Hall National Honorary recognizes students for academics and service to the campus, residence halls, and community. There are numerous honorary organizations on the campus that recognize students for community service.
Faculty/Staff

Each year Distinguished Faculty Awards, the highest honors bestowed upon university faculty, are presented to three faculty members who were chosen by their peers for superior achievement in teaching, research, and service. Each faculty member is recognized at an annual faculty dinner and awarded a medallion, a plaque and a $5,000 stipend from the ETSU Foundation (ETSU, 1998a).

The faculty member’s picture and biographic information are published in the ETSU Accent (ETSU, 1998a). Each college presents awards for outstanding teaching, research, and service each year. These awards are based upon various criteria as determined by each college.

Service to the University and community are factors in promotions and tenure for the faculty. Faculty must submit activity plans for service and are evaluated based upon their performance. In casual conversations with several faculty members, the researcher sensed a feeling by faculty that teaching and research were given a greater priority in promotion and tenure than service. Dr. Quigley agreed with this perception based upon his experience but had some hope of change based upon comments he had heard from President Stanton.

The Distinguished Staff Awards, the highest honor bestowed upon University staff, are presented to a staff member in each of the six Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) categories and a Career Award is presented each year. These recipients are nominated by staff members and selected by a subcommittee of the Staff Senate. Awards are based upon performance of assigned tasks meriting recognition and
inspiring other employees; positive attitude in working with others; commitment to the University community; and exercise of extraordinary courage. The awards are presented at the annual staff picnic, and each recipient receives $1000 from the ETSU Foundation with an appropriate certificate or plaque. Their pictures and biographic information were published in the September 30, 1998, *ETSU Accent*, Honors Edition (ETSU, 1998a). According to information presented by the Office of University Advancement at the October 1998 President’s Council Retreat, the ETSU Foundation spent $38,000 on faculty and staff awards that year.

Faculty and staff may participate in the ETSU Employee Giving Campaign each year. According to a November 20, 1998, memo from Mr. W.A. Coleman, Assistant Vice President for Human Resources and 1998 Campaign Co-Chair, distributed to all employees, the University community gave $83,953.92 to the umbrella charitable organizations approved by the Tennessee Board of Regents. The memorandum further stated “the theme for this year, ‘A History of Helping’ was well chosen. East Tennessee State University has a long tradition of generosity in supporting charitable causes.”

Research Question 7: How are new students, faculty, and staff oriented and introduced to campus values, resources, traditions, and role models?

Faculty/Staff

The Department of Human Resources sponsors a one-half day orientation for staff and faculty that consists mainly of benefits explanation. The Teaching and Learning Center sponsors an orientation for new faculty. There is no standard departmental
orientation for staff or faculty. Faculty are provided a Faculty Handbook that includes applicable information. The Staff Senate is currently working on a Staff Handbook that would serve as an information source.

Feedback from staff and faculty suggest that this is not adequate. In a November, 1998 personal interview, Mr. W.A. Coleman, Assistant Vice President for Human Resources, stated:

... there is so much they shovel at them for a short period of time that we have them. That could easily take one to two days, but I don't have the staff and most of the departments that are hiring are so anxious to get their people that it's difficult for us to hold them back for that half day. But, we strive very hard to make sure everyone gets that orientation and within their first week that they are here... They go into their receiving department or division, and we are not quite sure, there is no formal campus-wide orientation program at that level [department]... We're going to come up with a suggested departmental orientation which will certainly, and I don't know that this is the case, but will certainly be better than, ... "here is your typewriter, ... the restroom is down the hall to the right, you can get paperclips from Sally, and go at it"... We have a tendency to say that we need that person so badly ... we don't give them the benefit of a thorough orientation and familiarization, a buddy system, a way to make sure that person either is exposed to or has someone else that they can ask just how things work... I think that would give each, give new employees a far better acclimation and opportunity to know what the University is about and to see these values and to practice them and our first value is people. You should come to me as a person, not as a body to fill an empty slot. We should value them enough to give a warm welcome and a good orientation.

**Students**

Students attend an Orientation and Registration Program during the summer. Students under the age of 21 years attend a two-day program and adults over 21 years attend a one-day program. There is little, if any, significant emphasis placed on ETSU's vision, mission, and values.
International Programs sponsors a student orientation for all international students at the beginning of each semester. The Office of Multi-cultural Affairs sponsors a campus-wide reception for all students of color at the beginning of each fall semester.

A freshman male student indicated, in a causal conversation, he had read the values statement in the recruitment materials, and he summarized them fairly well. Asked whether he perceived their being upheld by the University, he responded, "not exactly. I hear a lot of talk about money... I read and knew about the rules, like no alcohol on campus. There is rules and regulations, but no code of behavior."

A graduate student interviewed suggested the University establish,

... a standard course for all university students, a mandated course... to take probably during their freshman year that not only deals with the transition to the university life and career planning and helping them get on track for college, but also, deals with what this University is about. These are our values and our standards, this is how we implement them. This is how we expect you to implement them. Something across the board that tells students up front what we are and what we expect of them during their stay here and afterward.

He further stated that this would help connect students to the University which he cited as a problem for the University. He also suggested that students, "are brought in with great hurrah and given this taste of tradition [at Orientation, Preview, and Pride Week] and made to feel like what it will be like during their college career, and then it drops off until they walk across the stage at graduation."
Research Question 8: How is the campus governance structured that allowed for participation and responsibilities by faculty, staff, and students?

The governance system of the University allows for participation by students, staff, and faculty. The faculty are represented by elected college representatives to the Faculty Senate. The Staff Senate represents the University staff through elected representatives on a percentage basis from each EEOC category and each college. The Student Government Association (SGA) consists of an elected at-large executive branch and elected representatives from each college. The college representatives are to be advisors to their respective college, as well as, comprise the Student Senate. Each of these senates has experienced some problems with attendance. Two immediate past presidents of the Staff and Faculty Senates interviewed for this study indicated there was ample opportunity for involvement by staff and faculty through these organizations, if the commitment and interest were there. Faculty and staff are represented well on all standing committees of the University, also, search committees, task forces, and continuous improvement teams.

The Student Government President, Mr. Russell Wilson, expressed the sentiment that usually a student is included; however, on standing committees, task forces, and other decision making groups, meeting times are not generally such that allows for student attendance and sometimes student representation is ignored. The lack of interest among students and schedule conflicts result in little or no participation by students in many areas where students could have a voice. He did express the opportunity to address student concerns with administrators and especially with the President. He further,
commented that sometimes input is sought or given after an issue has been decided or further along in implementation. Mr. Wilson expressed a concern that students are not involved throughout the decision-making process for whatever reason. Other conversations with students, some fairly involved and others not, indicated that there were opportunities for students to become involved in the campus governance and organizations, but not a lot of interest. The lack of interest in being involved was due primarily to the University being a commuter campus and students not feeling a part of the campus.

There are standing university committees and advisory councils consisting of faculty, staff, and students recommended by the Presidents of the Faculty and Staff Senates and SGA President respectively that act on matters of the University to make recommendations to the various Vice Presidents to whom they report. These committees range from virtual inactive to extremely active and meeting frequently. The Academic Council, chaired by the Vice President for Academic Affairs, consists of faculty, staff, and a student and reviews and makes recommendations to the President in all academic matters.

The Senior Staff is made up of individuals who report directly to the President. The President's Council is a broader based group consisting of the Senior Staff and individuals reporting directly to them, and including the Presidents of the Faculty and Staff Senates and Student Government Association. Through observation, a review of the minutes, and discussions with several attendees, the researcher concluded that these meetings tend to be more informational in nature. The majority of items on the agenda
are for information and do not require a decision of the group. The decision generally has been made through another process at a different level.

Research Question 9: How are the institutional leaders modeling the institution's values?

The overwhelming response by interviewees, when asked about the University President's, Dr. Paul Stanton, leadership, in terms of the values, was unquestionable. Dr. Stanton was characterized many times with phrases such as "person of integrity"; "cares"; "very open and accessible . . . accepting of others, very encouraging of different groups and organizations on campus", and "I see him as a person that would embrace these values in his life." In a November 1998 personal interview, Kathy Feagins, Admissions Counselor and past President of Staff Senate, captured the essence of many comments heard and observations made by this researcher when she said

One thing I have noticed about Dr. Stanton is he seems to treat everybody the same, whether he is talking to Dr. Bach or a student or one of the custodians. And, I have heard people say that about him who work closely with him, so I feel comfortable talking to him.

In a causal conversation with the researcher, a female administrator who had worked closely with Dr. Stanton for several years stated, "she knew that Dr. Stanton valued truth or integrity. You had to tell the truth. He had no tolerance for people who lied." Another high level administrator, reporting directly to the President, indicated he [President Stanton] models the value that "people come first, as evidenced through the First Mondays' program and his follow-up to them." The executive summary of a study conducted by Lewis and Clark Research (1998), an outside consultant company for preparation for a capital campaign, reported that
President Stanton is widely viewed as a strong leader who is articulating a vision for the University and the region. He is frequently described as "a man of highest integrity and solid character," "straightforward," "energetic," "personable," and "willing to make the tough decision." He is considered to be the right person to be serving as President at this time and possessing the wherewithal to be one of the best presidents of ETSU. He enjoys the enthusiastic support of the Board of Regents, Legislature, ETSU Boards, faculty, students, parents, and alumni alike. (p. 2-3)

Dr. Stanton commented, in a November 1998 personal interview, on how Presidents can set the tone as it relates to values by stating

... through modeling, through mentoring, through the way you lead your own life, how you demonstrate your tenacity and your beliefs ... a president, whether here or at another institution has to share and believe in the values of the institution, has to believe in its mission, has to believe in its vision. And then, you literally live that every meeting, every session you go into ... you do not waiver.

The researcher, in the same interview, shared with Dr. Stanton comments made about him by others such as being "a man of integrity" and asked him to respond as President, the leader. One could see the humility and appreciativeness on his face as he responded in a quiet voice that broke a time or two. He said, after a long pause,

Well, first of all, it is a humbling thing and something that I treasure that people say that about me [He paused with a bit of reflection] ... you know it comes back to certain tenants in my belief and some of them are religiously based and some of them just came out of the way I thought life should be led. First of all, I very much believe in the golden rule, do unto others as you would have them do unto you. ... I think that alone is a guide just better than in life, including integrity. You would not want somebody to lie to you. So, why would you lie to them? You would not want somebody to treat you like a rug or stepping stone or something. So, why do that to them? I do not want people around me I can not trust, but I also, know that people do not want to have to be reading two sides of Paul Stanton. We may disagree about what you believe and say it in terms of being true and honest. And, there is another side to that, and that is, the expression, that if you tell the truth, you are not having to always think back and recall what you said. Sure, I have changed my mind or opinion on more than one occasion, but never to my knowledge, actually lied to an individual or fake them out, if you will, or lead them in a direction that I would try to manipulate them...
into through untruth. It will always come back to haunt you. I will always remember the expression, "what a tangled web we weave when we practice to deceive." It gets so tangled you can't get out of it. You shouldn't get into that situation. So, if people think I have integrity, then I am extremely appreciative of it. But, I certainly try to live life that is honest and... prove to those around me, those I deal with.

After discussing the President's modeling the institution's values, interviewees were questioned about other institutional leaders, such as, vice presidents and deans. In casual conversations and interviews, there was generally hesitancy, long pauses, carefully chosen words, and non-committal on the part of most individuals as to their perception of other institutional leaders. The researcher concluded that various interviewees could cite issues of disagreement or concern with one or more of the leaders' perceived motives or commitment to the University's values. There was no single individual who emerged repeatedly throughout conversations, but rather general comments of uncertainty as to modeling of values by other institutional leaders.

Research Question 10: How were values compliance or alignment rewarded or recognized?

There seems to be a lack of a clear plan to recognize or reward value compliance. There are conduct policies and procedures affording due process applicable to students that are accused of acts or behavior that may be construed as violations of institutional policies that reflect upon the University's value statements. These policies and procedures are provided in the student handbook. Faculty and staff are afforded a process through established grievance procedures, stated in the Faculty Handbook (ETSU, 1999a) and the University policies and procedures manual, for situations where an individual
may be in violation of institutional policies which could reflect upon the University value statements.

Representatives from three offices on campus where non-compliance would be evident, were interviewed during this study: Assistant Internal Auditor, Ms. Edwina Greer; Affirmative Action Officer, Ms. Mary Jordan; and the Assistant Vice President for Human Resources, Mr. W.A. Coleman, who stated that

... most of the people here embrace a sense of value of the worth of human beings. ... I think that comes through with most of us ... yes, there are people, who because of one reason or the other, don't embrace our values or our standards of productivity or in some cases our standards or conduct. ... We have to deal with that. ... We really don't have a progressive discipline policy that is, step one... step two ... step three and step four. ... But, we do need it. We need some stages. ... I think most managers do not want to go from "we're happy together" to "you're fired." We need some stages that are formalized. ... A person just can't come around or won't embrace, or won't increase their output or whatever it is that they're not happy with, so that arises. On the other hand, we have to have ways of protecting the employees. ... TBR [Tennessee Board of Regents] has embraced a program now where ... terminations without cause are strongly discouraged. And so, every employee that is terminated will be offered the opportunity for a hearing ... to protect the employee against the capricious actions of a supervisor.

Mr. Coleman further explained that one of the drawbacks he sees is that supervisors may tend to be overly kind. They do not want to say bad things about an employee, so they put up with the irritation of a poor employee while recording only the positive and not the negative behavior. When the time comes that the supervisor wants to fire the individual, the documentation contradicts the request. While it is good, Mr. Coleman says, most managers on campus think highly of their workers on paper. there is the other side of not giving appropriate and accurate feedback.
When asked about rewards or punishment regarding values compliance, Mary Jordan said,

I don’t know that we reward people for being in line with the values, and I don’t know that we punish people for being out of alignment with the values. I just don’t know, to be honest with you. . . . I have seen people rewarded, but it has nothing to do with being in alignment with the values. In fact, sometimes they are out of line with the values. . . . If you think of monetary or you think of promotions and that kind of stuff, I just don’t know. . . . You almost have to take the values, and they have to be almost an evaluative or . . . in some level of an evaluative process to either reward or punish. I don’t really see that is built into our evaluation systems, come to think of it.

The evaluation process at the University currently does not reflect the employees’ compliance with the value statements. In an October 1998 meeting [attended by the researcher], a Staff Senate Committee revising the evaluation process met with Mr. James Bowman, Vice President of Business and Finance, to discuss proposed forms and process. Mr. Bowman commented that the evaluation process should reflect the values of the institution. He said that we should be evaluated based upon the values, and the values should be stated on the evaluation forms. There was consensus of the committee and each value statement was included on the evaluation form to be rated as other job performance criteria. The revised evaluation forms and process have not been fully approved at the time of this report.

An interviewed female staff member in the College of Medicine said,

I have on several occasions witnessed individuals who do not treat people with dignity and respect and are not reprimanded in any way. They continue their poor behavior, time and time again. It seems to go unnoticed by department supervisors. I am not sure if this behavior stems from ignorance in the beginning, and then, just becomes a habit of how to interact with others to demand respect or because there is not a system in place to call the hands of those who behave in this manner. I have heard excuses made by department heads or peers when someone
would complain of unfair treatment or inappropriate language. The behavior was justified by saying “oh, you just have to look over that person, that is just the way they are. They are from the old school, and that is just how they are, and they will never change.” In my opinion, this is an unacceptable answer. It is this kind of attitude that does not permit individuals to feel valued or that they come first, when they are not treated with dignity or respect, and are made to feel as though they may never reach their full potential in this type of environment.

Dr. Nancy Bartel, faculty member in the College of Business, said in a November 1998 personal interview that

I don’t think there is that critical mass that really says this is the way we need to treat each other, and what we should hold as our values and walk the walk and talk the talk. I think that when people misbehave - when they don’t treat people with dignity and respect, for instance, they aren’t called on it. There is no reinforcement of the way people should behave, and so, when you don’t require that to be a part of the system, it doesn’t get internalized.

Faculty are rewarded through a process of promotion and tenure with evaluations conducted in three major areas: teaching, research, and service. Faculty must demonstrate a significant degree of effectiveness in each of these areas. According to Dr. Quigley as stated in the Faculty Handbook (ETSU 1999a), teaching is the first or major responsibility of faculty with research being second; and service being third. He said most of his “colleagues believe that scholarly activity and research is more important than service.” He continued by saying that in his experience,

It is much more difficult to get promoted with a strong service record, than it is to get promoted with a strong research record. . . . I think we need to place greater emphasis in our reward structure on service. To Dr. Stanton’s credit, he has really talked a lot about doing that, so I think there is that support at least from him to do that.

Scenarios such as described above were related to or observed frequently by the researcher during this study. There seemed to be consensus among those interviewed that
this type of behavior was not the general rule, but enough isolated examples existed throughout the institution to warrant concern and investigation.

Research Question 11: What opportunities exists on campus for public discussion or debate about values?

As far as campus-wide opportunities to discuss or debate the institutional values statements, there have been no opportunities. A few opportunities for debate centering around values identified by the researcher: Spring, 1998 debate - “Do we have a duty to die?”; Black History Month Activities; Gay Pride Week; Take Back the Night; or Break the Silence. These programs dealt with specific issues of euthanasia, diversity, sexual assaults, and hate crimes to name a few. There are numerous programs presented in the residence halls and with other groups on these issues throughout the year. Occasionally, there are articles, editorials, or letters to the editor in the student newspaper which discuss these issues. There is a social issues class that has speakers on different issues, and these are free and open to the public.

Sometimes the problem or debate is about the role the University should play in talking and dealing with these issues. Dr. Andrews indicates the University should take a lead role. He stated during the interview that “universities are the marketplace of ideas. . . If we can’t come together in this marketplace and test some of these ideas and do it in a civil manner, then we are not a university. We are something else.”

While there appears to be more opportunities for debate or discussion in the public arena, there may be more opportunities for discussion and debate about the
University values in the myriad number of committee meetings, task forces, continuous improvement teams or whatever forum is used to make decisions. Many of these fora have input into setting the agenda for the University or executing the President’s goals and agendas. According to several interviewees, the University’s value statements are discussed in light of the decisions and plans being made. In the interview with Dr. Andrews he said,

I have been in a number of meetings where we have been talking about problems, opportunities, contentious issues, and people will actually say to one another, “we have an institutional value that says people come first, and maybe that doesn’t square with what we are doing or trying to do.” It has caused some of us, at times, to back up a step, and say “yeah, you know, you are right.” Maybe, we have got to do what is best for the person first and the institution second. So the thing that those values have done for me, and I think some others, is they have given us a framework where it is safe for us to say to one another, maybe we are not operating as close to the values as we need to be. And if we say these values are important, we are going to be judged, not by what we say, by what we do. We need to have our behavior line up with our values. I think that is the reason you have a statement of values because it challenges each of us to know what they are, to remind ourselves that, that is sort of the code that we are trying to aspire to. And that it is legitimate for us to say to one another in a kind and sometimes loving way hey, “you are out of line. That doesn’t have any resemblance to the value that we say that we have at this institution.”

Dr. Andrews further stated it was more common to hear these types of discussions since the University adopted the values statements. Kathy Feagins said in her experience that she sometimes heard someone mention the value statements during discussions. She said that

. . . usually when they are brought up, to me, it seems like a really good point. It is always a good reminder because I like our values statements. I think that is a good code to go by. So I think, it is good to bring that up and say, you know, this is what we have said and are we going to stick by it or what.
When asked if he heard people refer to the values statements in meetings where decisions were made, Mr. Coleman replied,

I hear that more and more. I really do. I hear that in the meetings that I sit in on. Sometimes, I hear it more as a chastisement. I’ll hear someone say, “Now wait a minute, we say that and now why aren’t we going to do that in this case?” But that’s good . . . it is being challenged . . . There are a couple of individuals that almost make it a commitment, I mean they are . . . when you start a discussion on a new program or a new hire, the first thing they will do is whip out their card [containing the vision, mission, and value statements] and say, “Where does that fit here?”

Mr. Coleman went on to say that when he went to professional meetings, he carried several cards containing the vision, mission, and value statements. At opportunities where values were being discussed, he brought out one of the cards to show as an example. Some of the other human resources personnel at other schools, according to Coleman, would be “kind of surprised that we had gone to the commitment of documenting and putting them in a convenient, portable way of showing people. So. I think it has had an impact and it makes, that we have committed, to me, makes this a better, more pleasant place to work.”

An area of the University that has and will continue to elicit much debate, and with the outcomes reflecting much about the University’s values is intercollegiate athletics. During the last three years, the University conducted a campus-wide study of its intercollegiate athletics program as part of the National Colligate Athletic Association Division I Certification process, according to the Self-Study Report (ETSU, 1997a). The self study was focused solely on certification of athletics and was designed to ensure integrity in athletics operations. Four basic areas were covered in this study: Governance
and Commitment to Rules Compliance, Academic Integrity, Fiscal Integrity, and Commitment to Equity. ETSU also examined how the activities of the athletics program relate to the mission and purpose of the institution.

The area of commitment to equity has provided the most concern for the institution as reflected in the certification Self-Study (1997a). The cost of compliance with the gender-equity plan is tremendous, and has drastic effects on an already financially strapped athletics program. The University must make some difficult decisions as to the future of the program with a mandate for more equality for women’s programs. President Stanton has appointed a task force consisting of university and community representatives to study the issue. The recommendations and decisions made will have far reaching and dramatic impact upon the University and will certainly make a statement about the University’s values.

Summary

In this chapter, the researcher attempted to provide a rich description of the themes and issues that emerged through the data collection at Case Study I - East Tennessee State University. The researcher used four techniques for data collection: casual conversations, document analysis, participant observation, and semi-structured interviews. Individuals selected for semi-structured interviews emerged as data were collected from casual conversations, document analysis, and participant observation. Data collection and analysis continued simultaneously until no significant new data emerged and the research questions or issues were appropriately answered.
CHAPTER 5
CASE STUDY II - MILLIGAN COLLEGE

Introduction

This chapter provides a description of the findings as the result of semi-structured interviews, causal conversations, observations, and document analysis at Milligan College. There were 11 semi-structured interviews conducted with faculty, staff, students, and alumni using an audio recorder that provided for verbatim transcripts, except for one. Each of the interviewees gave approval to the researcher for use of their name [with a few limitations] and any quote used in the report. The only limitations placed on the researcher were that quotes would not be taken out of context and member checking be conducted with the interviewee. There were numerous unstructured interviews or casual conversations conducted, along with observation opportunities at chapel, library, cafeteria, student center, basketball game, residence hall, and academic buildings. Document analysis was conducted on press releases, newspaper articles, website, handbooks, recruitment materials, reports, catalogs, and other college documents. Each research question is addressed in view of the information collected and reviewed from all sources and methods of data collection. Background information, vision, mission, values (Compass Points: Direction for the 21st Century) (Milligan College, 1998c) and goals of the case study site, Milligan College, are provided for a frame of reference and sets the context within which the data collected is analyzed.

111

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
Background

The Milligan College Profile (1998f) described Milligan College as a private Christian liberal arts college founded in 1866, affiliated with the Christian Churches and Churches of Christ, and governed by a Board of Trustees. The rural campus located near an urban area is situated on 145 scenic acres in Northeast Tennessee near the Virginia and North Carolina state borders. The College offers 27 majors leading to degrees, such as, Associate, Bachelor of Science, Bachelor of Arts, Bachelor of Science in Nursing, Master of Education, and Master of Science in Occupational Therapy. The College is accredited by the Commission on Colleges of the Southern Association of Colleges and Schools and the National Council for Accreditation of Teacher Education. The faculty consist of 70% with PhDs or equivalent, and the student-faculty ratio is 12 to 1. The fall 1998 enrollment was 927 (372 from Tennessee) which was a record high enrollment for the College. The students come from 37 states and 12 countries. Approximately 90% are on financial aid. The new student profile shows an average 24 ACT, 1100 SAT, and 3.30 GPA.

Milligan has consistently been named one of the best liberal arts colleges in the South by U.S. News & World Report and one of America’s Best Christian Colleges. The College is also recognized as one of the best buys in the U.S. by The Student Guide to America’s 100 Best College Buys (Milligan College, 1998f).

Vision

Milligan will be a premier Christian liberal arts college where Jesus Christ is exalted and excellence is the standard.
Mission

Milligan College provides opportunities for education in Bible, arts, and sciences which are shaped by a Christian world view in order to (1) create an environment dedicated to intellectual, spiritual, social, and physical development, (2) lead to selected professional and career possibilities, and (3) establish a community of inquiry, responsibility, and caring. Programs lead to associate, undergraduate, or graduate degrees, as well as provide for personal enrichment; they prepare men and women to participate in the necessary endeavors which will result in the accomplishment of the following objectives:

A Positive, Personal Christian Faith That Jesus is Lord and Savior.

The expression "Jesus is Lord and Savior" is to be understood in the historical biblical significance. Jesus, the Man of Nazareth, is God’s Son, therefore, both Savior and Lord of Life. The attainment of positive, personal Christian faith means the commitment of one’s life to this Jesus.

An Insight into the Impact of the Christian Scripture on Personal and Social Ethics.

This involves a recognition of the norms of human conduct that derive their sanction from the Christian faith.

The Capacity to Recognize and Assume Responsibility in Society.

The main functions of education are to arouse within the individual an awareness of indebtedness to one’s fellow human beings, to foster in each a desire to assume personal responsibility, and to prepare the individual to fulfill his or her obligation to society.

The Knowledge, Meaning, and Application of Sound Scholarship.

The student is led to develop a respect and enthusiasm for sound scholarship, such as will inspire each person to seek it with diligence and perseverance.

Preparation for Securing Self and Family a Comfortable Standard of Living.

This may be accomplished through training in personal and public health, courses of study designed to develop the quality of aesthetic appreciation, a background of basic liberal arts courses, plus the selection of a field of interest which will provide an adequate livelihood.

Participation in Wholesome Recreation Activities.

Participation in wholesome recreational activities is a worthwhile experience to the individual who participates. This may be accomplished through
intramural sports, intercollegiate sports, residence hall living, student union fellowship, and student-initiated recreational activities.

Milligan College does not list its value statement per se, rather, according to the President, Dr. Don Jeanes, the *Compass Points: Directions for the 21st Century* (1998c) developed through strategic planning would be its value statement. The vision and mission statements also reflect the institutional values upheld through the integration of value concepts. The *Compass Points: Directions for the 21st Century* as written and received from Dr. Jeanes during a November 1998 personal interview, states the following:

**Exaltation of Christ:** Milligan College aspires to honor God and exalt Christ by: upholding the centrality of corporate worship through weekly vespers, prayer and Bible study, and required chapel; incorporating Biblical study and Christian reflection in curricular and extra-curricular settings; participating in the life, mission, and reformation of the church universal while maintaining its historic connection to the Restoration movement; and modeling the ideal that every Christian is a minister and every career an opportunity for service.

**Education for Life:** Milligan College aspires to educate students for life by: developing the whole person, intellectually physically, spiritually, socially; recognizing the inter-relatedness of all disciplines of learning; providing a liberal arts foundation for all students with a wide variety of majors and programs in a climate of academic excellence; fostering creativity and artistic expression in music, theater, literature, and the visual arts; incorporating people from a wide variety of backgrounds, emphasizing unity in diversity; focusing primarily on undergraduate education, with selected graduate programs that enhance our mission; and advancing scholarship in the arts and sciences.

**Community of Care and Commitment:** Milligan College aspires to foster care and commitment by:
functioning as a caring and supportive family;
centering on students and their needs;
placing a high value on teaching and learning and on the teacher/student relationship;
nurturing faculty and staff commitment to Milligan students and Milligan ideals;
partnering with the local community in service and mutual support; and
fostering in students a sense of responsibility for self, society, and the global community.

Stewardship of Resources: Milligan College aspires to be a responsible steward of resources by:

- honoring God's creation through academic study, extracurricular activities, and practical action;
- respecting and celebrating the beauty of its natural surroundings;
- cultivating the human and financial resources entrusted to the college by students, staff, and supporters;
- following sound management principles under the lordship of Christ; and offering value in return for investment, providing quality education at an affordable price.

Goals

Milligan College will seek and maintain the highest academic quality.

- Maintain the level of selectivity of incoming first-time college degree students at least 3 points above the National and Tennessee average ACT scores.
- Maintain or reduce the attrition rate from freshman to sophomore year of 28%.
- Strive for a student/faculty ratio of 15:1.
- Assess viability of existing academic programs and consider the development of programs, both graduate and undergraduate, that will continue to prepare our students for the marketplace.
- Make Milligan College a desired destination for superior faculty.
- Develop a tactic for the integration of technology into the academic functions of the college.
- Receive and maintain accreditation for all applicable programs.

Milligan College will improve and maintain the quality of campus life.

- Implement a comprehensive program of spiritual development designed to address issues of Christian faith, character, worship, and service.
Expand Intercollegiate Athletics to include all varsity sports offered by a majority of the colleges in the Tennessee-Virginia Athletic Conference with scholarship funding in all sports equal to or above the average of scholarships offered by member colleges.

Increase the number of ethnic/international students enrolled from the current 4%.

Enhance communication between all levels of the college community.

Improve health and physical fitness services offered to the campus community.

Provide greater range of services.

Milligan College will gain and maintain financial stability.

Increase working capital to an appropriate level (presently foreseen as $750,000 to $1,000,000).

Build endowment to $20 million.

Increase funding for infrastructure.

Milligan College will develop and sustain the appropriate infrastructure to support the needs of the college.

Bring all existing facilities to an appropriate level of maintenance.

Develop and fund a plan to switch to a new and comprehensive administrative hardware/software system to tie together all offices on campus.

Plan for an enrollment of 900-1000 students.

Research Question 1: How are the implicit/explicit values of the institution defined?

What are they? Are they written? Where could they be located? How were they communicated through the institution?

A vision and mission statement has been in existence and use almost since Milligan’s founding. According to President Jeanes, Milligan College does not have a separate list of value statements or explicit values. The Compass Points: Direction for the 21st century (1998c), according to Dr. Jeanes, could be called its value statements or implicit values. These statements have recently been developed through the Strategic Planning Initiatives. The four major compass points have been adopted by Milligan: (1)
Exaltation of Christ, (2) Education for Life, (3) Community of Care and Commitment, and (4) Stewardship of Resources.

The vision, mission, and compass points are intertwined to sum up the character of Milligan College. The implicit values of the institution are integrated throughout these statements. All written materials reflect the vision statement. Dr. Pat Magness, Chair of the Strategic Planning Committee, said about the Compass Points “we always want our planning to bring out the best in us, to help us do even better the things we believe in, to help us be what we intend to be” (Pfeifer, 1998b, p. 2).

The implicit values of Milligan College are explained very readily by students, faculty, and staff, when asked during interviews. Many related that the implicit values are the sense of community that is easily seen and felt as one observes, interacts, or both with the campus community. They further talk about the inherent sense of a caring community that is often described by many as the "Milligan Family." During a November 1998 personal interview with Dr. Bill Gwaltney, Interim Dean of Faculty, he reflected that there was still

... something rather intangible I cannot define. The kind of ethos that they used to say is in the air, is in the water and gets into the blood of the people around here. And, I don’t know how to explain that, but Milligan has maintained an amazingly consistent educational attitude, program, and philosophy. And, somehow it goes on, even though, those that first defined it, who first defined it are no longer alive, much less active in the College. I still think of myself back in the days when I joined the faculty as a junior faculty member and the way in which my presence was valued. And, we again try to do that, and it is there. It is not a strategy that we developed, it is just the way things are. We value our incoming faculty as much as the old fogies.
Most students interviewed talked fondly about being cared for by the faculty. There is an assurance or confidence among the campus community that each person is valued as a member of the "Milligan Family." Many of the staff are alumni of the College, and many of the students are children of alumni, thus there is a definite heritage that passes through generations. Milligan College values its liberal arts education curriculum and its nondenominational status as most of the interviewees mentioned this during the interviews. There is a belief in a holistic approach to education, but being a religious institution, Milligan is very closely tied to the Bible that teaches the Christian worldlier. Mr. Mike Johnson, Vice President for Enrollment Management, in a student newspaper article titled, “Who Do We Think We Are At Milligan College,” was quoted as saying, “We try to make students see how things are tied together and related to each other, and create a broad based Christian world-view for the students. That’s our educational goal” (Pfeiffer, 1998b, p. 2). He further states that students applying to Milligan are informed that “The school is a small community and an academically challenging school with a demanding curriculum” (Pfeiffer, 1998b, p. 2).

The 1998-99 Milligan College recruitment booklet’s theme is “shaped by the master” (Milligan College, 1998h) On the inside page is a description of how a sculptor sees a masterpiece within a stone which is how “God has a vision for each of our lives,” (p. 1) and each person can be uniquely shaped for God’s purposes. It further reads, “For more than 130 years, Milligan College has provided an atmosphere where students can develop their God-given abilities and form futures based on a foundation of quality education and Christian values” (p. 1).
The theme throughout the recruitment booklet is that within each individual is a masterpiece, and Milligan can provide the environment for it to be discovered by the individual. A scripture verse related to this theme is found on most pages. Faculty are prominently portrayed and quoted as they are described as the catalysts (molders and shapers) for helping students to be molded and shaped. Teaching is a “mission” of the faculty, they are role models, mentors, and friends. Life-long friendships and preparation for leadership roles are the advantages of taking part in the richly diverse life offered through involvement in a variety of campus activities.

The recruitment booklet (Milligan College, 1998h) further delineates how the students can allow themselves to be molded and shaped through a “family-like Christian atmosphere on a beautiful campus.” The booklet states, “You’ll also discover a special environment that students and alumni find compelling, moving, touching, and beyond measure. It is in this environment that students are able to grow in their relationship with Christ as He forms and shapes their futures” (p. 8).

The booklet (Milligan College, 1998h) further gives examples of how “Milligan graduates are among society’s top molders and shapers today.” The booklet states that 85% of Milligan graduates are employed within six months after graduation and more than 80% of the pre-med students are accepted into medical school. The booklet explains that Milligan offers a “quality, first rate package of opportunities at an affordable price. In fact, Milligan’s tuition is below the national average for similar private institutions” (p. 12). This recruitment booklet, along with other materials, was developed this past year by an outside marketing firm.
The Milligan College Enrollment Management Team adopted the following vision statement for their office. The vision stated the team, “will change lives by serving others, nurturing dreams and inspiring students to become an integral member of the Milligan family.”

One interviewed student summarized much of what most said,

I think Milligan values a lot of things. As a liberal arts college, it values empowering students to make up their own decisions and to learn to think for themselves, to think critically. . . . I think sometimes we get the image because we are a Bible College or a Christian College, that maybe kids are, students here are forced to think a certain way. But, I don’t feel like we do that at all. They value individuals . . . faith . . . spiritual life . . . the well-being, spiritually, and physical of the student.

A student satisfaction survey conducted by the Coalition for Christian Colleges and Universities (1998) found that the satisfaction level of students at Milligan College is above average in comparison with 70 other Christian Colleges. Milligan students cited several areas of strength that were rated in the top quartile in comparison with other colleges:

- The faculty are knowledgeable in their field
- The campus staff are caring and helpful
- The quality of instruction I receive in most of my classes is excellent
- This institution shows concern for students as individuals
- My understanding of God is being strengthened by classroom and/or campus experiences
- It is an enjoyable experience to be a student on this campus
- The campus personnel with whom I come in contact demonstrate a Christian spirit
- Faculty care about me as an individual
- I find this college to be academically challenging
- My academic adviser is knowledgeable about requirements in my major
- I am able to experience intellectual growth here
- My academic adviser is approachable
- This is the kind of college I could recommend to my friends with confidence

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
My academic advisor is concerned about my success as an individual.
Students are made to feel welcome on this campus.
Faculty are usually available after class and during office hours.
Males and females are treated with equal respect on this campus.
There is a commitment to academic excellence on this campus.
This institution has a good reputation within the community.

Research Question 2: How are the implicit/explicit values in the institution focused in the curriculum? Where? How taught?

Milligan College does not have an explicit values statement that would be focused in the curriculum. However, there are implicit values that are focused in the curriculum.

An introduction to the implicit values are stated in the Milligan College Catalog (1998e) states:

It is a distinguishing characteristic of Milligan College that each course is taught with an awareness of how it fits into a biblical worldview. Such teaching is assured by the selection of a faculty in cordial sympathy with this view. A primary objective is to include Christian understanding and practice in the total of life's attitudes and activities. (p. 8)

According to Dr. Bill Gwaltney, as stated during a personal interview,

The philosophy of education that we [Milligan College] have operated under calling for emphasis upon values, Christian values, really goes back to our heritage, our religious heritage. We are a college associated with the disciples of Christ, Christian Church, Churches of Christ movement in this country. One of the oldest colleges in this country built upon this same philosophy of education is Bethany College in Bethany, West Virginia... and the concept of education of the total person, not dividing the person into categories. But, seeing religious education on a par with scientific education which they are not enemies of one another, they are not at war with one another, they are to be integrated. All areas of learning are to be integrated... we have here a curriculum and faculty organized on the basis of this conception that you don't divide learning into sub-areas that don't relate to one another.
All freshmen are required to take a class their first semester titled Introduction to College and Careers, according to Dr. Bert Allen, a faculty member and Director of Counseling and First Year Program during a November 1998 personal interview.

According to the class syllabus he provided, the course . . . is designed to acquaint each student with the history, mission, and curriculum of Milligan College. Activities and presentations provide guidance in understanding academic areas of the institution and how academic growth relates to various professions and careers. Study skills and support services are described which may enhance the student's academic progress.

Students interviewed for this study expressed positive comments about the class. Also, seniors are required to take the Christ in Culture class that focuses on Christian living in the workplace, what that means and how it can be done. Most students interviewed expressed their experiences in classes have been that teachers emphasize being a Christian and how that applies to the real world. There were some students who believed that Milligan should offer more Bible classes, and they thought Milligan was more of a Bible college than it is or may want to be. Certainly, Milligan is grounded in the liberal arts tradition and students agree that they are encouraged to make up their own minds about what to believe. Both faculty and students seem to take delight in discussing the emphasis on the liberal arts education and the freedom to make individual choices. Faculty interviewed and those the researcher had casual conversations with seem to be comfortable with the philosophy of Milligan and the freedom they have in teaching and interacting with students.
Research Question 3: Is there an academic honor code?

The Application for Undergraduate Admission to Milligan College (1998b) contains the mission statement in its entirety. The application, church reference form, and school reference form contains this statement regarding expectations and responsibilities for student lifestyles:

We at Milligan adopt specific rules on the basis of our belief that God's Word, as the final rule of faith and practice, speaks on many matters pertaining to personal conduct. Therefore, behavior that conflicts with Scripture is unacceptable. Historically, communities have also developed guidelines that help put into practice basic moral and social principles. Such standards serve as a guide toward worthwhile goals relevant to one's academic, spiritual, social, and physical well-being. Specifically, the student agrees to abide by a lifestyle commitment in which he or she refrains from the use or possession of alcoholic beverages and illegal drugs. The student also agrees to refrain from pornography, profanity, dishonesty, sexual immorality, unethical conduct, vandalism and immodest dress. Students are expected to observe the Lord's Day in worship and to seek to serve Christ in an atmosphere of trust, encouragement and respect for one another.

This statement sets the tone of expectations for students applying and entering Milligan College. All members of the Milligan Community are to exhibit Christ-like behavior in all their conduct. This is the standard by which everyone must live and be measured. In a November 1998 personal interview, Ms. Carrie Davidson, Admissions Counselor, stated that they attempt to recruit students who are looking for not only a "good education in a Christian environment, but... who will take advantage of all the different things that we have to offer here... be able to contribute things to the student life at Milligan College." A student interviewed said that Milligan was, "more about providing opportunities to grow than forcing people to grow up per se."
The 1998-1999 Milligan College Student Handbook states (1998i) (under Academic Integrity),

Academic dishonesty (the intentional misrepresentation of all or part of one’s work to deceive for personal gain, or assisting another to do the same) is a serious offense which undermines the bonds of trust and honesty between members of the college community and defrauds those who may eventually depend upon our knowledge and integrity. Since academic dishonesty is related to a student’s class work, the appropriate response is vested in the professors or academic administrator, as follows. Depending upon the nature and extent of the offense, the student may receive a failing grade on the work in progress, or a failing grade in the course. Incidents of flagrant academic dishonesty may be referred to the College Discipline Committee for resolution. (p. 16)

Research Question 4: Is there a written institutional code that defined rights, duties, and responsibilities of faculty, staff, and students?

Students

The researcher failed to find a written institutional code or honor code per se for faculty, staff, and students. There were written statements of behavioral responsibilities. Faculty, staff, and students are expected to uphold the values implicit in the vision and mission statements such as exalting Christ and being a Christ-like example in daily living.

The 1998-1999 Milligan College Student Handbook (1998i) states that

Membership in an academic community of Christians carries with it certain responsibilities. Because Milligan College seeks to provide a quality education in an appropriate Christian setting, it is assumed that a member is both committed to Christ and willing to grow and develop not only academically, but also socially and spiritually. Therefore, by virtue of their enrollment, students agree to accept the responsibilities of membership in the Milligan community. . . . Rules also help us to put into practice our basic moral and social principles. (p. 20)
The expectations and responsibilities statement goes on to give the basis for Milligan's rules which is belief in God's Word as the final rule of faith and practice. The handbook further states, "Behavior that conflicts with Scripture is unacceptable at Milligan" (p. 20). For this reason, many students choose to attend Milligan College. Specific acts such as drunkenness (on or off campus), stealing, use of slanderous or profane language, all forms of dishonesty, occult practices, and sexual sins are particularly cited as unacceptable behavior.

The student handbook (Milligan College, 1998), also, states,

Scripture condemns such attitudes as greed, jealousy, pride, lust, bitterness, needless anger, an unforgiving spirit and harmful discrimination. The Milligan community is obliged to renounce these behaviors and attitudes and seek God's forgiveness and help so that we may grow in grace and righteousness . . . . We do not pretend our rules are perfect. Neither do we expect everyone to agree about all our rules. We do ask an understanding of why we have rules, integrity in keeping them, a positive attitude, and the use of proper procedures in improving them. (pp. 20-21)

The student newspaper, The Stampede (March 20, 1998, and September 23, 1998), contained articles regarding thefts in the residence halls being on the rise and $3000 worth of electronic equipment being stolen from an academic building. According to students and faculty, events such as these are rare because there is a basic trust in everyone. The researcher observed that as students entered the cafeteria, book bags were placed unattended in the foyer. There is an expectation that they will be safe, because the attitude is that a member of the "Milligan family" would not steal. There is genuine surprise when theft does occur. The Stampede article (Jamison, 1998) quoted Mark Fox, Vice President for Student Affairs, as saying, "Milligan is a different type of
environment. We had hoped that with our high standards, things like this wouldn’t happen. Apparently that’s not true anymore.” The article further quotes Fox as saying, it was “disappointing to have to discuss these kinds of problems on a Christian Campus, where people tend to trust each other” (p. 1).

Faculty

Faculty rights, duties, and responsibilities are outlined in the 1998 Faculty Handbook (Milligan College, 1998d). The introduction statement to Faculty Appointments states,

The College considers the additions made to the faculty among the most important decisions made in the institution. Milligan faculty generally have long tenure; every effort is made to obtain and retain faculty who are committed to the mission of the College. (p. 47)

The handbook further reads that “appointments to Milligan Faculty are made without discrimination based on race, color, national or ethnic origin, political affiliation, gender, or age” (p. 47). Each faculty member is evaluated for promotions and tenure based upon “teaching effectiveness; evaluation of scholarship; service to Milligan College; professional activities; membership and leadership in professional organization; community service; and church participation” (p. 49). Also considered are professional degrees, awards, publications, and achievements. The faculty handbook outlines the policies, procedures, and criteria for promotions and tenure as well as due process procedures.
Staff

The Administrative and Staff Personnel Handbook (Milligan College, 1998a) outlines the policies and procedures pertaining to the employment of staff such as the rights, duties, and responsibilities. The employment relationship with Milligan is described as being “entered into voluntarily and employees are free to resign at any time, for any reason. Similarly, Milligan College is free to conclude the employment relationship at any time” (p. 4). The handbook further states that “Milligan College does not discriminate on the basis of race, sex, color, national or ethnic origin, or political affiliation.

Research Question 5: Is there a written institutional creed or statement that articulated the expectations of faculty, staff, and students?

Faculty/Staff

There was no written institutional creed or statement that articulated the expectations of faculty, staff, and students per se. There were statements in the various handbooks that could be described as expectations.

The Milligan College Administrative and Staff Personnel Handbook (1998a) includes a letter from Dr. Jeanes that reads:

We are honored that you serve with us in the ministry of Christian higher education. Milligan is a close knit community that inspires, encourages, challenges and nurtures. I believe you will be blessed by your work here. I am grateful that our faculty and staff are committed to our vision of academic excellence and the exaltation of Jesus Christ. Your work and service to the College have a direct impact on the academic and spiritual development of our students. The purpose of this Handbook is to acquaint you with the policies and
procedures of the College as they relate to your work. It outlines our responsibilities as employees of the College. A clear understanding of both of these will help morale and effectiveness. (p. ii)

In conversation after conversation with faculty or staff, there appeared to be a true embracing of Dr. Jeanes' challenge and expectation expressed in his letter. Several staff and faculty expressed the same sentiments that Melissa Ford, alumnae and Resident Director, did in describing her role at Milligan. During a November 1998 personal interview, she explained,

We aren't paid large amounts of money and you have to like what you are doing. You have to feel like it is a ministry, because you're not making . . . you can take your degrees, whatever you have and go somewhere and make a lot more money than you do at Milligan.

She further stated that especially faculty, "They like that environment. They like having that close contact with the students, knowing the students on a personal basis, being involved with them. They enjoy that." She talked about having a servants' heart and that is why the faculty and staff are at Milligan, to be a ministry to the students. There truly seemed to be an enthusiastic embracing of this concept by most all of the faculty and staff interviewed in this study.

The Milligan College Administrative and Staff Personnel Handbook (1998a) also includes the mission statement. The introduction to the mission statement reads,

"members of the Milligan College Administration and Staff share the opportunity and responsibility of forwarding the mission of the College. The duties they perform and the spirit in which they perform them find reason and momentum in this mission" (p. 2). Dr. Bert Allen, said in a November 1998 interview that he considers his tenure at Milligan as
a ministry. He can be interested in and work with students, and he can be visible in his faith and share with colleagues.

The Milligan College Faculty Handbook (1998d) includes job descriptions for the administrative staff of the College. The job description for the Vice President for Academic Affairs and Dean includes this statement, “provides a personal example of academic excellence and Christian character and encourages their development among the Faculty” (p. 8). The Vice President for Student Development’s job description has this expectation, “provides opportunities for the development of Christian character and spiritual maturity” (p. 16).

Before faculty are hired, according to the President and Interim Vice President for Academic Affairs, they are asked to respond to the vision, mission, and values of the College in writing. Dr. Nancy Bartel, who had been an adjunct faculty member, indicated that when she was interviewed, she was shown and asked about these statements. It was stated to her that these were important to Milligan and asked would she be comfortable embracing these. She indicated they were up front with her. She told them about her background and both felt comfortable; therefore, the relationship began.

According to the faculty handbook (1998d), qualitative requirements for promotion and tenure are the following: “Evidence of Christian character and commitment as shown by: (a) The impact of Jesus Christ and the fruits of His spirit in one’s personal life. (b) Participation in and support of Church activities” (p. 50). In a November 1998 personal interview, Mr. Bill Greer, Area Chair of Professional Learning in Business said that, “These qualitative requirements for promotion and tenure are
number one, followed by professional competency and student relationships, then
scholarly attainment, and lastly, loyalty to Milligan College through service in priority
order.” He further stated that “It is a little different presentation than you typically see in
university settings where you have the three big requirements [teaching, research, and
service].”

Students

The expectations for students were to embrace the vision and mission of Milligan. By embracing the mission of Milligan, a student could be “molded and shaped” or
transformed to be Christ-like thus exalting Christ. A student should become an educated
person prepared to live as a Christian in a secular world. There would be examples for
students to model from faculty and staff. Students, faculty, and staff comprise the
Milligan Family and are expected to participate and interact as a family

Research Question 6: What incentives and programs were offered for participants in
community service and community building activities?

Students

An objective stated in Milligan’s mission was to “arouse within the individual an
awareness of indebtedness to one’s fellow human beings, to foster in each a desire to
assume personal responsibility, and to prepare the individual to fulfill his or her
obligation to society.”
The class Introduction to College and Careers, has a three-hour community service requirement for each student. The course syllabus states that

The students and employees of Milligan College have a long history of service to the community at large through a number of area agencies and ministries. Examples include feeding the poor and homeless through the program sponsored by the West Main Street Church, providing tutorial assistance and mentoring to students in local schools, coaching girls and boys in sports programs in the Girls and Boys Clubs of the area, guiding programs for at risk students in local students, teaching in local congregations and schools, donating blood, helping in building and rebuilding projects in Southern Appalachia, visiting the elderly in local nursing homes, and traveling to distant places to perform short-term mission work. We challenge you to continue that tradition of giving to the community.

The student is required to provide verification of service performed and provide a written description of the lesson learned from the experience.

Many of the campus clubs and organizations conduct community service projects on and off campus. There is a Volunteer Milligan service organization that is part of the consortium coordinated by Volunteer ETSU. Jonathan Robinson, alumnus and Bookstore Manager, observed during a November 1998 personal interview that

There is an unspoken expectation that if you are gonna be at Milligan, that you are here because you chose to be here and that you are expected to give it 100%. And that, you are expected to be involved in the campus-community. I think that comes from perhaps the Christian background to the campus in that, there is the expectation of awareness of your fellow man and to reach out in some fashion to help or help better those who are worse off than you are. I think that plays a very important role in the growing process here at Milligan. There are a number, a large number of student organized outreach programs. There are a number of students here in the store that are involved in those. I’ve gotten involved myself in the last two years with one of those. But, there is a real, I think, real awareness I’ve seen, especially in the last three years of students that they need to not be absorbed in themselves, that there’s life outside of just going to class. I think that’s very, very important.
Students majoring in youth or family ministry participate in a ten-week full-time supervised ministry internship during the summer after the junior or senior year.

According to an article in the *Milligan Milepost* (Allen, 1998) “the student wins with the practical experience gained, the church or other ministry benefits from the youthful energy and fresh perspective of the intern, and the college enjoys the good will resulting from the internship program” (p. 1). One of the 20 student participants reflected, “Milligan College prepared me to face both the internship and my future ministry confidently, and I am proud to call Milligan my alma mater” (p. 1).

**Faculty**

The four qualitative criteria for promotion and tenure are related to the faculty member’s ability to establish student relationships, be a role model, professional development, and contributing to the Milligan Community. The *Faculty Handbook* (1998d) outlines the criteria and demonstrated behaviors for each:

1. **Evidence of Christian character and commitment as shown by:**
   a. The impact of Jesus Christ and the fruits of His spirit in his/her personal life.
   b. Participation in and support of Church activities.

2. **Professional competency and student relationships as evidenced by:**
   a. The ability to motivate students.
   b. The organization and presentation of subject matter through varied and innovative teaching.
   c. Sound and well-communicated evaluation.
   d. Attention to contemporary development in academic disciplines.
   e. Communicated concern for students.
   f. Competency in academic counseling.
   g. Respect for the ethics of the profession.

3. **Scholarly attainment as evidenced by:**
   a. Continued professional growth measured by:
i. Postgraduate study.
ii. Participation in professional association activities and societies.

b. Degrees earned.
c. Publication.
d. Wide reading.
e. In touch with the contemporary trends in the field.
f. Freshness as a thinker.
g. Knowledge of bibliography.

4. Loyalty to Milligan College as evidenced by:
   a. Acceptance of responsibility in areas of:
      ii. Committee service.
      ii. Extra-curricular activities.
   b. Interest in and support of College functions, including chapel/convocation.
c. Respect for relationship with colleagues.
d. Positive representation of Milligan College to the community.
   (p. 50-51)

A Milligan College News Release (1998g), announced that five Milligan College faculty were recognized with the institution’s highest honor which is an award for faith and love. The five recipients’ service to the institution were characterized by these two qualities, faith and love. These awards recognized for overall contributions to service to Milligan College and the surrounding community. The faith expressed their personal faith in Christ and the love shown to others as a result of that faith.

Research Question 7: How are new students, faculty, and staff oriented and introduced to campus values, resources, traditions, and role models?

The written tradition at Milligan is important as witnessed by the researcher on a visit to the archives located in the library. The oral tradition of Milligan College is an important part of the way their values are transmitted, and individuals are oriented to
them as they become members of the community. Introduction to the campus values, resources, traditions, and role models are made by individual to individual or by word of mouth much more than written in documents.

In an article in *The Stampede Online*, Pfeifer (1998b) relates how members of the Milligan administration, faculty, and students serve as ambassadors for the institution to the public. Many of these individuals have a long connection with Milligan either as students or as pivotal members of the campus community. Pfeifer describes,

> All of these people, together, help define Milligan and explain the college and its values to those who are on the outside. The essence of Milligan is wrapped up in their stories, their testimonies, their dreams and the information they pass on to others. (p. 1)

**Students**

As previously stated, students entering Milligan College are required to take a class, Introduction to College and Careers, that orients them to the history, vision, mission, and values of the institution. The application, recruitment materials, catalog, handbooks, and Website reflect the vision and mission, as well as, other statements that expresses an expectation of member of the "Milligan Family."

**Faculty/Staff**

Individuals applying for a position at Milligan College are given the vision and mission statement and are asked to respond to them. The College looks for highly qualified individuals, but they must be comfortable and be a "good fit." Faculty and staff are expected to be mentors to new faculty and staff. New faculty do not advise students
their first year, but rather becomes familiar with the campus environment themselves. Many of the staff and faculty have attended Milligan as students, therefore, the connection is already formed.

Students, faculty, and staff seem to be very anxious, willing, and enthusiastic about telling the "Milligan story." There is a warm appreciation and assurance in their voice as each one related their experience at Milligan College. There appears to be a good and healthy oral tradition about Milligan. Experiences are shared and passed on through individuals interacting within the College. Even many individuals who are not directly associated with Milligan, but acquainted with individuals who worked or attended related many of the characteristics and culture that the researcher had observed or had been described. There is an overwhelming respect for the institution and perception that the institution was academically sound.

Research Question 8: How is the campus governance structured that allowed for participation and responsibilities by faculty, staff, and students?

Students

The 1998-99 Milligan College Student Handbook (1998) states,

The Student Government Association (SGA) exists to formulate and execute a Christian student government whose duties are to stimulate communication and cooperation among students, faculty, and administration. It also helps to coordinate student activities, to participate in the determination of College procedures, to labor in the interest of improving academic standards and to develop a greater spirit of progressive citizenship. SGA holds open meetings and anyone can come and voice concerns. Voting membership consists of class presidents and representatives, the dorm presidents, a commuter representative and the executive council. (p. 7)
SGA is advised by Mr. Bill Greer, faculty member and Area Chair of Professional Learning in Business. A recent graduate related the following insight to the researcher:

The student government is elected by the students and opens each meeting with a devotion and prayer. During my senior year, I was elected student body secretary. In our executive sessions with the administration, we would always discuss projects that may better the student life at Milligan. We were never allowed to forget that the source of our budget was the students and that we should always strive to help them in any way we could.

Faculty

The 1998 Milligan College Faculty Handbook (1998d) states that

The College supports the principle of academic governance while at the same time recognizing that legal authority and judiciary responsibility for the College rests with the Board of Trustees. Academic governance indicates that matters of academic policy and procedure originate and develop within the Faculty of the College. Course and program approval begins at the lowest level within the faculty structure and is approved by the Area as the first formal step in this process. The Area Chair submits this proposal to the Academic Committee for action. Upon approval by this group (excluding courses which are acted upon by the Academic Committee), a proposal is submitted to the Faculty for approval, and in the case of new programs, degrees, or major revisions, is submitted to the Trustees by the President. The faculty governance system must take place in a spirit of collegiality, recognizing the ability of the faculty, including academic administrators and area chairs, to deliberate and make wise decisions on behalf of the College. (p. 13)

According to Bill Greer during a December 1998 personal interview, faculty have a voice in making decisions. He said

We have faculty meetings once a month on, once every, it's on a Friday once a month. And, we vote as a whole on new majors, new programs, changes in curriculum... The faculty have a say in this. The faculty votes on these programs. It's not just from on high.
According to President Jeanes, faculty and students are directly involved in strategic planning for the College, hiring, and other activities that may affect them. Faculty and student representatives are observers to Board of Trustees meetings, except when the board may be in executive session. There are College committees that provide input into many areas of the College. The Faculty Concerns Committee's purpose, according to the handbook, "is to provide an avenue for faculty to voice concerns which affect the welfare of the College community" (Milligan College, 1998d, p. 38).

Staff/Administration

The faculty handbook states,

The staff and administration of the College are considered part of the overall team or "family" constituting Milligan College. A Personnel Handbook treats the personnel policies, activities, and services of the school, and these persons function in general as employees with all the rights and privileges that apply to them. (Milligan College, 1998d, p.31)

There is no specific or formal governance group or structure comprised of staff. The staff handbook (Milligan College, 1998d) outlines the policies, procedures, benefits, and other related information.

Research Question 9: How are the institutional leaders modeling the institution's values?

The general feeling among faculty, students, and staff interviewed for this study is that most people at Milligan exhibit the values of the institution. They perceive that most of the faculty, staff, and students know and embrace the values of the institution before
becoming members. For those who do not fully embrace the values or it is not a "good fit" tend to self-select themselves out of the institution, if they can not become comfortable with the environment. It is expected that each member of the "Milligan community" role model the institution's values.

The top administration is fairly new to Milligan. The President, Vice President for Student Development, and Vice President for Institutional Advancement have been in their positions for two years or less. The Academic Dean is a retiring faculty member serving as an interim. Even with these and other staff changes, there seemed to be a feeling of calm and stable environment. When asked by the researcher to comment on all the administrative changes, a long-time faculty member responded with a surprise, "We had more change and instability than I had realized. Maybe we are in more flux than I thought." There has seemed to be a smooth transition, he went on to say. He thought there seems to be a confidence in the administration by the students and faculty that they were guiding the institution properly and making the right decisions for the College.

When asked about President Jeanes' leadership and care for the institution, the researcher heard the same perception from individual to individual. All were positive statements and insights that seemed to be grounded in respect and admiration for Dr. Jeanes as an individual, as well as, President. The students recounted, interview after interview, how Dr. Jeanes broke his ankle trying to capture the flag in the beginning of the year activities with the students. It was not that they were glad he broke his ankle, but how he did it, while playing with the students. It seemed to make him human and put
him on a playing field with the students. Their comments were warm and caring, and they seem to feel that he was doing a good job as president.

Melissa Ford, Resident Director and alumnae, described Dr. Jeanes as a very "hands on president." She said,

You see them [Dr. and Mrs. Jeanes] everywhere on campus, everywhere, especially Mrs. Jeanes. She has beautified the entire campus. . . . Their mind set is why would the students want to respect the campus, if it looks in a shambles to begin with when they get here. . . . We, also, have different things during the year, where, right before final exams, they have what they call Midnight Breakfast for the students. And, you will find the Jeanes up there [cafeteria] along with some faculty cooking breakfast for the students and serving it to them.

She talked about when there was a power outage on the campus last year for three or four days, "the Jeanes were there helping make sure these students got food."

Jonathan Robinson, Bookstore Manager and alumnus, described Dr. Jeanes as a

. . . hands on administrator. He is the type of person that I've seen that will jump in with both feet right up to his waist and dig in with everybody else. He is also, a very good PR person, a very good speaker. He's a minister, former minister, and I think that incorporates a lot of special talents in one person.

Jonathan also related the incident where Dr. Jeanes broke his ankle. He further stated

I see he and his wife on a regular basis out walking on the campus, with their morning walks or on Saturdays or in the evenings. They've got a five gallon bucket in their hands, as they walk, they pick up trash. Just a real . . . . they're both very approachable, very personable, in that, they want you to talk to them as a friend, not as he's the President and you're some little person on the hierarchy of man, so that makes you less a person. Their easy way to relate to, but a real hands on leadership style . . . . I think they have done a very good job of balancing academics with the needs, just the physical needs of the campus.
Another staff member, Carrie Davidson, Admissions Counselor and alumnae, observed some differences which are positive changes since Dr. Jeanes has been President. She observed during a December 1998 personal interview that

President Jeanes is here a lot more, I mean, he certainly does travel for the school, but he's on campus a lot more. . . . It's just a little bit of a different approach because he is here more. His strength is in administration. . . . I've noticed a little bit of difference in the procedures of things, and organizations, and he's definitely cautious. I think he plans conservatively. . . . He's just a little bit more hands on, that's probably been the biggest change.

These types of comments about Dr. Jeanes reflected a positive feeling and perception that he possesses the qualities needed by the campus. When asked about his own leadership style, Dr. Jeanes related these insights during a December 1998 personal interview,

I think my skill, and has been throughout my years in higher education, mainly the ministry. My skills are in administration and I do like a hands on. I try not to micro manage, but I do like to know what's happening and be involved. So, I'm gone about a third of the time, here about two-thirds. So, that is by design. Another one of my goals has been to build Milligan's support in Northeast Tennessee. We've always had support among our churches and a limited support among people outside of our churches, but I'm trying to build support in this area from Christian men and women who are leaders in the community and business, not necessarily from the Christian Church, but that they value a Christian liberal arts education. It's a source of support, but it's a whole lot easier to raise funds locally than it is traveling all over the Eastern United States. But, we were not lessening up in the other areas, but in the other areas, it's more among our churches. In this area, it's among churches and businesses and civic groups.

The former president was described as a greater orator, preacher, and motivator, but traveled about 75% of the time. He traveled on behalf of the College raising money that was desperately needed for the College. But, there seems to be pleasure in Dr.
Jeanes' leadership style. He is a Milligan alumnus, had worked at the College earlier in
his career, and had served on the board of trustees.

In casual conversations and semi-structured interviews, the researcher asked about
other institutional leaders and their modeling of the values. Most of the individuals
comprising the top administration were appointed to their positions within the last year.
The consensus of individuals interviewed seemed to be positive toward these individuals
due to their being selected by Dr. Jeanes and many having prior connections with
Milligan such as being alumni. The interviewees endorsement was not as strong as for Dr.
Jeanes due to the limited time of their appointments and not as much interaction or
availability to them as with Dr. Jeanes.

Research Question 10: How were values compliance or alignment rewarded or
recognized?

It appears from talking with faculty, staff, and students at Milligan, observing, and
reviewing documents that Milligan's philosophy is to communicate the values and
expectations up front to prospective students and faculty. However, not everyone may be
Christian or embrace the values of Milligan once they are there. There is a proactive
approach to avoiding non-compliance or nonalignment with the values.

Dr. Bill Gwaltney, Interim Dean of Faculty, explained it this way:

We don't impose any set of beliefs. The only commitment we request of faculty
and students is a faith in Jesus Christ. Now, of course we have had Muslim
students here, non-Christians here and we expect them, not necessarily to graduate
with Christian faith, but at least an understanding of Christian faith. We have
really never had anyone from a different religious background object to what we

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
do, because it is done on, here is an identifiable area of study that is based upon literature, history, and organized thought, theology, and philosophy. And, we think that anyone who comes to our school ought to be able to participate at least to that extent.

Dr. Gwaltney explained how the hiring process is critical to the success of Milligan and how it defines itself. He stated,

One thing that we very seriously attempt to do is to add faculty when that is called for, very, very carefully. We do look very seriously at people's academic credentials preparation. We have some of the country's finest graduate programs represented here on our faculty. We do look at that, but that's not all we look at. We look at a person's faith. What are your values? We ask every candidate to respond to our mission statement, our objectives. How do you see yourself associating with this kind of thought, with these values? So, we attempt to build a faculty that is very much committed to what the college stands for and that includes Christian faith. Now, we are not, we're not limited denominationally. We have various denominations from Christian tradition represented... people with differing religious viewpoints... But, again, we do expect people to be committed to a Christian lifestyle and sense of values, so one thing that we really work at very hard is being careful about faculty and administration that we employ as staff.

Bill Greer stated:

We look for a commitment to Christian values, an acceptance of Milligan's mission as a Christian institution, a belief in God and faith in Christ. That's important. That's an important element of Milligan's culture. Now every member of the faculty who comes in, is asked to respond to Milligan's mission in an essay. You write an essay responding to Milligan's mission. What you say in that essay is entirely up to the individual and obviously it's gonna be important to search committees to know how well that person is going to fit, if you will, into the culture. That's the primary way, I think, of evaluating that commitment.

In terms of being proactive in recruiting and selecting students who embrace the values of Milligan, Carrie Davidson, Admission Counselor had this to say:

I don't try to compare us too much to other schools because you know everybody has their own approach and I don't, I try not to come down, you know, I tend to be
sort of partial to what Milligan has because I went here as a student. It worked well for me. But, you know, everybody needs different things. So, I usually just try to be, like you say, be up front. We do afford our students quite a bit of freedom, but we also have some pretty specific perimeters set up in order to ensure as much as we can that they have a good environment. I think sometimes the students that are here think, "well, you know, some students get away with things that they're not supposed to". And, in their mind, they think, "Oh, this school is really, they could be more strict," or whatever, but it's impossible to find out about everything that happens. What they don't always think about is when something, when the administration does find out about something, what happens then, you know, the students that are given help and also held accountable for their actions as well.

Ms. Davidson continued by saying that,

I do really feel like we do have a good balance. And the student, you have to make your own decisions when you're here. You have to be responsible for yourself. But, if you struggle with that, there's people here that will help you. There's you know, the professors, a lot of the upperclassmen, and the faculty and staff are gonna be people who are gonna take seriously their responsibility as a mentor and as a role model for the newer students that come in. But, you are responsible for yourself while you're here and you do have to make your own decisions and there's always students here who don't make good ones. Also, on a small campus, you know, a few, a small pocket of students are making some poor choices, the troublemakers or whatever. And that's huge news on campus, everybody knows and that makes, you know, students think, "Oh, this is terrible,". . . because there five people are doing this or something . . . and everybody knows about it. So, it's such a big deal whereas it's really not a problem, if you look at the big picture.

Ms. Davidson gave examples where students made some bad choices, but someone at the college intervened by saying, "We want to help you" rather than, "Hey, you broke the rules, you're out." Residence hall staff and several students confirmed an incident where a student became pregnant and the campus community rallied around and helped support the young lady. There are situations were a student may be suspended for a period of time or leave on his or her own if there is not a "good fit" at Milligan. In
talking with a group of students about this issue, they summed it up in these terms: "I think the school really tries to be a school that lives what it believes in terms of how a Christian or Godly Christian should be and that includes embracing all different people and people that have made mistakes." Another student commented, "You don't have to ask around too long before you hear, you know, comeback stories. People who did stupid things as freshmen or even as juniors, you know, who, sort of return so to speak, you know, turn their lives around . . . were accepted within sort of mainstream of the school."

The first student added, "There are students that didn't come back, but I think that's more of an issue with them, that they felt uncomfortable coming back, rather than the school wouldn't accept them."

This statement seemed to sum up the feeling on the campus, first every effort is made to choose people to become part of the Milligan College family that can fit comfortable within the values of the environment. If by chance, there is non-congruence, the individual usually will self-select to remove themselves from the environment.

The reward for adhering to Milligan's vision and mission is that faculty, staff, and students comprise the "Milligan Family". This community of individuals dedicated to exalting Christ and following his example receives reward from the process or act of service to others within itself. Service to others in Christian love is the reward of each individual member of Milligan College.
Research Question 11: What opportunities exists on campus for public discussion or debate about values?

It seems inherent to the belief system at Milligan and one of their values is that Milligan students are getting a good liberal arts education taught from the Biblical perspective or Christian worldview. Beliefs are not forced upon students, rather students are expected to formulate their own views and beliefs. Students have the opportunity to be exposed to and discuss these issues everyday in their classes.

Dr. Gwaltney commented that

Our point of view is that we have nothing to fear from the pursuit of any legitimate discipline of study, and we are convinced that it all makes sense when put together. And so again, I come back to the term holistic as an attempt to see education and what we're doing here from that perspective. And of course that does involve values, the starting point you asked me about. Our particular religious expression is very nontraditional, noncreedal. It calls upon people to understand their faith for themselves.

Dr. Jeanes commented on the underlying philosophy of Milligan regarding the education students receive by saying, If you go back and look at our mission statement, we want to help our students to look at issues, to look at material, to critically develop their own point of view. We often have people . . . who apply to come here, if they don't know a whole lot about Milligan and they are not from a Christian church, they ask, “are you going to try to make my son or daughter think like you think?” That's not our intent. We try to present in our freshman Bible survey classes, in our chapels, we don't try to indoctrinate them we try to help them to think critically. But, we do believe in the lordship of Jesus Christ, and so, no, I don't think we try to indoctrinate people and say this is the way you have got to see it or believe it. Certainly, there are some basic cornerstones in the Christian Churches that we adhere to, and we believe in. But, again, probably forty percent of our students don't come from the Christian Church and, so we don't try to corral them into our way of thinking. But, to help them see the Bible as God's Word and Jesus as our Savior . . . you know on the basic Christian principles. When I use the word Christian, I am
talking about in a broader sense, not just in the Christian Churches. Our intent is not to tell them what to believe and what to think, but to help them to develop their own evaluation process because we believe that's the only way that you really can be effective when you grapple with things and come to a conclusion. You know, I want to be careful that this is not interpreted as anybody can believe anything and it's what ever they think it ought to be. That's not quite the same, but until you... I don't know how I want to word this... until you've grappled with your faith, struggled with it, and it becomes yours, instead of something your parents have handed down to you, I don't think it has any meaning to you. And, there are a lot of young people who... have developed, not have developed, they simply just have adopted what maybe they were taught. My parents were from a certain persuasion that's what I'm going to be... I think until they actually come and develop their own faith, and again it's a faith of the lordship of Jesus Christ, then they haven't matured... We try to help them to grow to maturity through the evaluation and study process. So, no, we don't try to indoctrinate them or this is what you have to believe.

Dr. Jeanes' comments summed up what student after student said to the researcher. Also, other staff and faculty interviewed shared this same perception of Milligan's philosophy and approach to educating students. So with this as the underlying belief and philosophy for the Milligan community, all other issues are confronted or addressed using this philosophy as the foundation or reference point.

Some of the issues that emerged during the study were appropriate forms of worship; type of music to use during chapel; lifestyle parameters or acceptable behavior; programmatic concerns; and athletic concerns seemed to emerge as the most prevalent issues. Discussion of these issues can occur in many different fora, such as, faculty meetings; SGA; cabinet; the student newspaper, the Stampede; small group discussions; and college committees.
Dr. Gwaltney reflected that one of the factors in how Milligan maintains itself is through the different points of views that are expressed by members of the Milligan community. He said,

We have a strategic planning committee that plans for the future, especially for the upcoming year, and we have wide participation in that by upper-level administration, by faculty, by staff, and so in that way we get a kind of view and there is student input into this to ... what should be the future course of the school? What programs should be increased or added or dropped or cut back? These kinds of decisions relative to the future of the school is something that's looked at broadly within the College. It's very collegial, rather than just have somebody sitting on top issuing commands downward. We don't function that way. [kind of bottoms up?] Yes. So, I think that's another factor in how we maintain ourselves, and so, sometimes it gets a little hairy because we have different views as to what we ought to be doing and people are very committed to their views, but in the long run, generally speaking, when we finally work it through we tend to try and form consensus. When we finally do work it through though we usually ... there is a kind of common commitment to whatever decision is reached.

Dr. Gwaltney's perception was fairly consistent with other faculty and staff interviewed. There seemed to be a real pride in this process of decision making.

As Milligan College embarks on the future and implements the Strategic Planning Initiatives, there will be emerging issues that will facilitate campus-wide debate, particularly from faculty due to their governance structure. Some of the emerging issues for debate or discussion are related to enrollment concerns and programs to additions or deletions. Enrollment has increased over the last two years, but how much it should increase is being discussed. Growth in enrollment will come about through added programs, because most of the current programs are at capacity, except for Nursing (Pfeifer, 1998a). The Nursing program has been undergoing some difficulty due to
accreditation issues. Due to the lack of students passing the board exams, the Nursing program is on conditional probation for accreditation. This has led to a decrease in the enrollment in the program. Because Nursing is a fairly expensive program, this leads to discussion as to the viability of the program in relation to cost of funding the program. According to an article in the Stampede, the administration is supporting the program financially and with moral support (Pfeifer, 1998a). If there is not a positive turn around, there may be more and more pressure to phase the program out.

As for future enrollment growth, Dr. Jeanes said that,

Whatever growth we have, I think needs to be planned growth. I am convinced, that if, we offer a quality education, that we continue to publicize and promote the quality here, then we will grow. We are close to an optimal level and that's the reason I say controlled or planned growth, because the worst thing that can happen is get... getting more students here than we can handle. When that happens, you know you soon develop discontent because you're not meeting this need, you're not doing this, its' overcrowded. I had to stand in line a long time then all of a sudden you've got bad PR.... You've got to deal with it. So, I see growth continuing. I don't think it's going to be phenomenal growth because like I said, we're at an optimal level. We've got to have a lot of things, and it might be better to just to try to do that with funded programs rather than debt. Dorms are full.... We don't have many offices, storage... classroom space is utilizing just about as much as we can. ... You starting looking at all of those areas that we need to add, personnel, student services, more faculty, more support staff... takes a lot of dollars... we want to try to do well what we do. I believe that will bring growth, but we are going to have to be careful that we don't let Milligan grow to the point where we can't handle the people.

As for looking at any new programs to add, Dr. Jeanes made these comments,

We talk about new programs, but we don't have any on the front burner at this point. In fact, Dr. Stanton and I have had conversations about needs, and he shared with me some of the things that State is currently pursuing.... We've talked about some of the things we might consider, and some areas where we don't want to be competitors.
These types of conversations between Dr. Jeanes and Dr. Stanton were confirmed by Dr. Stanton during an interview with him and also from statements he made during a December 1998 President's Council meeting. Dr. Gwaltney and other faculty shared and confirmed Dr. Jeanes' view regarding enrollment growth and new programs and the process for deciding about their implementation.

In the September 4, 1997, edition of the Stampede, an article quoted Mike Johnson, Vice President of Enrollment Management, as crediting the enrollment increase to new athletic and academic programs (Palmer, 1997). Men's and women's soccer teams and the new occupational therapy program are responsible for the increase. In fall 1998 enrollment increased to a new record, 927 (Pfeifer, 1998a). Men's junior varsity baseball and additional soccer players were added according to the article.

Adding athletic programs has some implications and could present issues for Milligan. According to Pfeifer's article (1998a),

Milligan has not sacrificed quality for quantity. Admissions has increased their standards in the past three years. Students applying must receive a 950 on the SAT or a 20 on the ACT and/or have maintained a 3.0 GPA in high school. Occasionally, certain circumstances allow for a bend in these rules, but that occurrence is rare. (p. 1)

Some students interviewed were concerned that athletes may not sometimes meet the admission or academic standards as other students. There was a hopeful feeling that they did, but it was a concern. At the same time, there was a generally positive feeling about more athletic programs, and the increased numbers of international students that were recruited, particularly for soccer. Even though there was support for these
programs, there was a concern and caution about maintaining the academic integrity of the College.

According to Ms. Carrie Davidson, the Admissions Committee is made up of mostly faculty, and they decide who is accepted to Milligan. Even though, there has been an increase in athletic programs, the "admissions committee doesn't cut them any slack," she said. Dr. Gwaltney said,

We have withstood the temptation to re-instate football because that would compound our problems, you know. There's always the temptation to try to hire, and that's about what it amounts to, a winning team, no matter what the person does academically and we have withstood that. These people who come here for athletics are expected to perform as any other student will in the class. We do give them . . . cut them a little slack here and there to participate. We try to work with them to provide them time away for their events, but they are expected to perform academically and many, many a syllabus will say, "absences are no excuse for not having covered material". If you're absent from a class, you're expected to somehow fill the gap.

Dr. Jeanes stated that,

We do maintain the same standards, academic standards for athletes. Sometimes they don't bring as high a ACT or high school GPA as say a pre-med student, but we don't have two levels of admission . . . we have the same progression, the same expectations . . . spiritual expectations. . . . I think with new athletic programs, it takes you a while to reach the point where you can become even more selective.

Various articles of the Stampede and letters of response on-line reflect a healthy debate among students and faculty regarding the music selected for chapels. A student committee selects the music and seems to prefer contemporary music, while some of the faculty would like more of the traditional church music. The faculty are not required, but rather encouraged, to attend chapel and many prefer to do so. However, it is a
requirement for students to attend. Other students and faculty prefer the combination of both styles of music. This debate probably will continue and will depend on the preferred style of the student committee who is advised by the campus Chaplain. A campus issue regarding “worship through the lifting of hands, hugging various people, and getting down on knees in reverence to God” (Kraft, 1998b) has caused some serious debate by students.

In a personal interview with a student journalism major, the researcher asked about an article she had written for the student newspaper regarding hate crimes. The daughter of a highly respected faculty member posted signs around campus speaking out about crimes toward homosexuals. This was in response to some widely publicized events around the country. The journalism student interviewed different students as to their reaction to the posters. She said,

It really was hard to find people that would stand up against homosexuality, just because they didn’t want to be perceived as really ultra-conservative or close-minded. . . . It was hard to find someone that would actually say you know this is wrong, and not that I wanted them to say that, but it just sort of portrays both sides. It was really interesting, I think, that very little controversy was raised by it.

The journalism student attempted through her article to stimulate discussion and debate regarding homosexuality and student views as Christians.

An article by Kraft (1998a) in The Stampede related how members of the Milligan College’s chapter of the Rotaract Club decided to withdraw from the March of Dimes Annual Walk America Campaign. Their decision was based upon their belief that they would be supporting abortion, which as Christians they oppose. The newspaper
frequently has articles such as these that examine campus issues. Students seem to be encouraged and supported in their efforts to debate social and campus issues.

**Summary**

In this chapter the researcher attempted to provide a rich description of the themes and issues that emerged through the data collection of Case Study II - Milligan College. The researcher used four techniques for data collection: casual conversations, document analysis, participant observation, and semi-structured interviews. Individuals selected for semi-structured interviews emerged as data were collected from casual conversations, document analysis, and participant observation.
CHAPTER 6
SUMMARY, OBSERVATIONS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

Chapter 6 contains a summary of each case study, discusses observations from the research guide or questions, relates conclusions, and provides recommendations.

Summary

The purpose of this study was to conduct case studies providing a description of how two higher education institutions, East Tennessee State University and Milligan College, addressed the role of values for their institutions. The study attempted to provide insight and understanding into the implicit and explicit values of the institutions through a values audit process. The methods of transmitting those values internally and externally were examined, as well as, implications for students, faculty, and staff.

There was also an analysis as to what evaluation process was used to ensure compliance or alignment and to gauge that alignment between educational practices and the institutions’ missions and purposes. The study examined the established and appropriate reward system for recognizing and assessing compliance or alignment.

East Tennessee State University

East Tennessee State University rewrote its mission statement and added a vision statement and a set of value statements approximately five years ago. This process was accomplished through a series of meetings by members of the President’s Council and Senior Staff and facilitated by an employee of Eastman Chemical Company. The purpose
of the meetings was to train the University leadership in the principles of continuous improvement which would then be employed as a strategy for improving processes and decision making within the University.

Data collected during the study indicates very little, if any, input from the grassroots of the institution during this process of formulating the vision, mission, and values. The leadership was charged, by then President Roy Nicks, to filter this information down into the organization. Posters and cards were the primary means of transmission used, except for selected meetings regarding the implementation of continuous improvement into the processes. During this time, the vision statement, "Becoming the University of Choice" and Dr. Nicks' slogan, "Students Come First" were being promoted as the banner for the University. A significant number of continuous improvement teams were formed to study the internal processes of the University. Much attention was given to internal processes and organizational development, in regard, to building morale and improving resources. Emphasis was also placed upon being a regional university, serving the region, and forming partnerships within the region. Dr. Wayne Andrews, then Executive Assistant to Dr. Nicks, spearheaded much of the effort along with the Strategic Planning Committee and the Continuous Improvement Team. Within a few months of each other, Dr. Nicks retired and Dr. Andrews assumed the position of Interim Vice President of Student Affairs.

In January 1997, Dr. Paul Stanton assumed the Presidency position and began promoting the slogan of "ETSU Pride" in response to his perception of a lack of pride, connection, and identification with the University by the Community. Celebrations
formed around the slogan, lapel pins, and t-shirts bearing the phrase were distributed to all employees. The phrase, ETSU Pride, began to appear on letterhead, stationary, clothing, recruitment material, and many other items bearing the name, East Tennessee State University. The University and community joined in celebrating events around ETSU Pride Week during August 1997 and 1998 to coincide with the openings of fall semester.

Under Dr. Stanton’s leadership the promotion of continuous improvement teams, tasks forces, and committees continued to study University processes and opportunities. Over 150 continuous improvement projects are outlined in the Strategic Planning documents for the University. At Dr. Stanton’s encouragement the vision of the institution has been expanded to “become the best regional University in the nation.” In the ETSU Today (1998), Dr. Stanton writes,

Granted, although we can compare ourselves with peer institutions’ in many quantifiable categories, there is no objective measure that would automatically tell us we have arrived at that position. But if each of us aspires to be the very best and to do the very best possible work in our respective fields, many of our publics, our constituents, will label us the best regional university in the country. And if we have achieved that in our minds and in theirs, we can legitimately consider ourselves the best. . . . Becoming the best regional university in the country is quite possible for ETSU, because in a number of areas, we are already perceived as the best. (p. 3)

As “ETSU Pride” is promoted, so are the terms partnership, collaboration, interdisciplinary, best, first, regionalism, major player, and external community. These terms are seen repeatedly in written documents and spoken often in meetings as observed by the researcher. In the statement of goals, cross-functional and interdisciplinary
collaboration and external partnerships are the means of achieving the University’s goals. The President has set a high priority on community and regional cooperation and partnerships with the University taking the lead.

Observations. Based upon casual conversations, semi-structured interviews, participant observation, and documents review, the following observations were made by the researcher:

(1.) The University is still attempting to integrate the vision, mission, and values throughout the organization, mostly through continuous improvement teams that consist mainly of top and middle level management with some faculty and few constituents from the student and support staff populations. ETSU Pride activities continue to increase and be emphasized. There is a perception by many that presently, there is less campus dialogue about the values of the institution and what they mean than when the value statements were distributed. Less dialogue or discussion of the values cannot be interpreted to mean a lack of acceptance, but is viewed as a very plausible explanation. There is, however, a perception that the values have not been fully implemented which can hinder their being fully embraced throughout the organization.

It is unclear as to who is responsible for facilitating continuous improvement or the integration of values throughout the organization, or if any one individual has that responsibility, as Dr. Andrews did at the beginning. It appears to the researcher that the entire leadership team (President’s Council) has that responsibility with some direction from the Strategic Planning Committee chaired by James Hales, Dean of the College of
Applied Science and Technology. There is general consensus that transmission and embracement of the values is assumed because "they are written down, and we have the statements." This phrase was repeated by several members of the President's Council at different times during discussions of the values at various meetings, such as President's Council Retreat, which was attended by the researcher.

The discussion centered around a suggestion to strengthen the value statements regarding people, relationships, and diversity, such as adding as a goal, how these values would be accomplished. Consensus could not be reached; therefore, a subgroup followed up with a recommendation to add a goal statement that read, "create a campus community where all members live by the stated University values." The consensus of the group, as observed by the researcher at the December 2, 1998, President's Council, was not to adopt the goal statement because there was a values statement already in place. The goal statement to "educate students to become responsible, enlightened, and productive citizens" was amended at the same meeting to conclude with the phrase, "in a diverse society."

There is no formal mechanism for information to flow upward. Informal means for information to flow upward would be meetings with the President such as First Mondays which are open to faculty, staff, and students. The Strategic Planning document outlines the President's Goals, and these are passed down throughout the organization. The different areas of the University must formulate action plans to accomplish these goals.
It is unclear as to where the formal decision making at the University occurs as President’s Council and Senior Staff meetings are primarily used for information dissemination. Most items are presented for information only. This became evident from observations, reviewing past minutes, and using member checking in receiving feedback from several participants of the Council. Occasionally, there will be an item that either bypasses the regular channels or may need support from the group to continue as an initiative or project. The continuous improvement teams usually make recommendations while decisions regarding their implementation are made elsewhere.

The principles of continuous improvement and strategic planning are not fully understood and integrated by the leadership, President’s Council and Senior Staff, as evidenced by observations, discussion among participants, and other feedback from members. As personnel changes, there is no formal orientation process for new members concerning continuous improvement activities. There appears to be some confusion among the top leadership, faculty, and staff as to what is continuous improvement. This was evidenced by discussion at President’s Council meetings and conversations with different members of the Council by the researcher. As had been discussed by the interviewees, implementation of continuous improvements and values transmission requires time, planning, guidance, and nurturing at all levels. This is not occurring on a consistent and systematic basis throughout the University.

(2.) While most interviewees concurred that ETSU’s value statements were noble and good, there is disagreement as to the degree to which they are embraced and institutionalized at the University. There is general agreement that Dr. Stanton, as the
leader, embraces and models the values. There is uncertainty as to the level of commitment to the institutional values by other members of the leadership team. The perception seems to be that some talk about it more and raise issues surrounding the values, but the level of confidence of the commitment is uncertain among individuals interviewed for this study. This perception is critical to the University if Bennis and Nanus (1985) were accurate when they said the leader set the ethics or norms that were exhibited within the behavior of the organization.

Three University values emerged as causing the most concern for individuals: diversity; people come first, are treated with dignity and respect; and relationships. Regarding diversity, much concern was expressed in terms of the University's commitment to diversity in the hiring practices. The question could be asked, "Is the University trying to meet the Geier goals (court mandate) or is it truly committed from top to bottom in providing a supportive environment for diversity?" There emerged a perception of a lack of uniformity and commitment to the diversity goals in segments throughout the campus. There is a perception that some areas and individuals champion diversity issues while others "pay only lip service." There exists differing definitions of diversity and what it encompasses as it relates to the University. For some interviewees, diversity means recruiting diverse faculty, staff, and students. Others see diversity as providing a supportive environment for differing minority groups. These are but two examples of the complexity of the term diversity; however, the consensus was that the University has much work to do in fulfilling the value statement related to diversity.
The Task Force for Cultural Diversity, appointed by the President, that is examining diversity from the student perspective will report this year on their findings and make recommendations. Their report may be crucial to how the University is dealing and will deal with the issue of diversity in the future. This may be a turning point for the University in terms of defining and addressing the issues of diversity that will reflect upon the values of the institution. Establishing the task force to examine the issues around diversity is an important statement to the campus of its significance to the President and the University. Implementation and follow through with the recommendations could be a great indicator as to the commitment and integration of diversity. Laney (1984) stated that the President must convey the information that the moral authority of the President and the University’s moral dimension were connected by the moral direction envisioned by the President.

Many people commented on the record, and even stronger off the record, regarding the lack of embracement of the value “people come first, are treated with dignity and respect.” There is much indication by responses from individuals that suggest there are “areas” or “pockets” of the University where individuals are not being treated with dignity and respect. There is concern that middle management or mid-level supervisors lack the training, commitment, and supervision themselves to effectively relate with their supervisees. Therefore, people were not being treated with dignity and respect by supervisors with little or no consequences for this type of behavior.

There does not appear to be effective strategies in place to assure that individuals hired or promoted have adequate supervisory experience. In addition, there is lack of
uniformity in accountability for supervisors. Different departments and areas seem to have their own methods and procedures sometimes, particularly with conducting performance appraisals or initiating job audits or recommending salaries. These issues are beginning to be addressed through the development and implementation of an evaluation system that will promote more training for supervisors; accountability for alignment with the values; addressing salary inequities; and opportunities for employee training and development.

For these things to occur, there will need to be commitment, implementation, and integration throughout the organization at all levels. There has to be the absence of what one interviewee termed and received agreement from others as, "a lack of divisional integrity." Even with the emphasis on teams each division may fight for its own interest while sometimes failing to look at what is good, fair, right, or consistent across the campus. This may or may not be done intentionally, but the perception is sometimes there. Yet, someone has to be the equalizer, making sure that each decision, regarding personnel or otherwise, is consistent and fair across the board. In an organization, this person is the leader, and at ETSU, it is the President. DePree (1992) stated that the "people, relationships, values, and beliefs are most important to a corporation and fittingly, the most fragile components" (p. 72).

(3.) There is a great deal of emphasis placed on being the "best," "first," "major player," "leader," "regionalism," "partnership," "well-positioned," and other image type of words. These words or phrases are being used a great deal in discussions of goals and objectives for the University. While this is a positive attribute for a university to exhibit
and can be considered a strength, it may also be, at times, a weakness. One staff member said, “We are trying to be all things to all people,” meaning the danger could be the University would be less than it ought to be when it tries to spread itself too broadly.

There seems to be few open discussions and debate as to how much change and growth the University can allow before quality suffers. There were many concerns regarding quality expressed more in side or private conversations than openly in meetings. There is a bit of fear or caution that the University may be attempting to initiate new programs or services at the expense of existing ones. There is a call for balance while not wanting to be perceived as having a lack of vision or not being progressive or part of the team. These are decisions the University must make, which will reflect a great deal about the values. Axline (1996) stated that unless all decisions were based and grounded in ethics [values], they would probably later result in trouble.

(4.) The ETSU value statements are preceded by the phrase “ETSU pursues its mission through a student-centered community of learning.” However, students are mentioned or discussed very little in most President and Senior Staff meetings. There is limited participation and involvement by students in decisions that affect them directly or indirectly. The focus is more external, which may affect students, but it is not discussed very much. While it may be an underlying assumption that partnerships will help educate students, which is a goal, it may not always be clear this is the focus.

There is always concern as to the emphasis that should be placed on research, teaching, and service. While teaching may be the priority, there are many faculty and staff who would say research is second and service is third. Publications and news
releases highlight research and the amount of dollars generated to the University for research. Research is important for the University in terms of dollars generated and assisting faculty with promotion and tenure and building their credentials for upward mobility. The mission and values of the University must impact this a great deal; therefore, careful attention must continue around tenure and promotion issues as to their alignment with the University's vision, mission, values, and goals. DePree (1992) said that the beliefs and values of its leaders could signal who and what matters within the organization.

(5.) The University has established, written, and distributed a set of rules and regulations; policies and procedures; and expectations for which faculty, staff, and students are to adhere. While they may be reviewed for revisions, updates, and inclusion in documents, they may serve more as formal codes, laws, or policy statements "written in stone," not to be broken or violated, for fear of punishment. They act more as a set of codes in a manual, than a proactive way thinking and acting or standards of behavior as Axline (1996) suggested.

(6.) With the increased and expanded emphasis on cross-functional collaboration and partnerships, ETSU has increased opportunities for students to become involved in community service, social issues, and interaction with diverse groups. The Kellogg Grants, interdisciplinary initiatives, service learning, and the general education core curriculum, as well as, other opportunities are positive responses to the University's mission and values. The mission of the University is fulfilled, as well as, the goals which can reflect the values of the institution. These types of partnerships and initiatives allow
the University to reflect its values while engaging students and faculty in meaningful and significant relationships where values promotion and development can occur individually, as Dalton and Petrie (1997) advocated as a vital component for higher education institutions. Through these processes, the University is going beyond espousing values development in the catalogues, but rather, encouraging the institutionalization of the commitment to values education in partnership with the community as advocated by Dalton and Petrie (1997).

(7.) A review of the literature suggested that the leaders and management must model high ethical [values driven] standards that become part of the organizational culture (Haas, 1997). Haas stated three approaches that organizations can take to address values related issues: neglect or have a lack of ethical programs; compliance based programs with rules and regulations for prevention, detection, and punishment; and values-oriented programs based on principles and combined functional values with individuals responsibility and accountability. The approach that seems to be more prevalent at ETSU is a combination of neglect and compliance based upon rules and regulations for prevention, detection, and maybe punishment. If there are proactive programs, incentives or rewards for values compliance, they are not clearly defined nor readily recognized by the members of the institution. There are selected and isolated recognition efforts for faculty, staff, and students; however, there is a lack of a comprehensive and coordinated strategy for rewarding compliance.
Milligan College

Milligan College’s vision and mission statement has seen few, if any, changes since its beginning over a hundred years ago. There are no written values statements per se that characterize Milligan; however, the vision and mission statements are integrated with the values of the College. The recently developed Compass Points: Directions for the 21st Century (1998c) can be considered the value statements. These are the factors and priorities that will accomplish the vision and mission of the College over the years ahead.

The values underlying the vision and mission are fully integrated and embraced at Milligan. They have been part of the culture for over a hundred years. Out of the vision and mission statements have emerged a set of expectations which each member of the Milligan College family must embrace and adhere, preferably, before becoming a part of the family. Members of the Milligan community are selected and retained on the basis of their embracement and compliance with the vision, mission, and implicit values of the College.

Milligan College is affiliated with the Church of Christ or Christian Churches, while maintaining their non-denominational stance for which they take pride. While this decision affords them some freedom and flexibility in the way the College operates, it does affect their funding base. Because Milligan receives no fixed sum of money from a governing church body, the College must establish and maintain a relationship with each individual church. Much of its support comes from churches in states such as Indiana, Ohio, Kentucky, and even greater distances. This presents a unique challenge to the
College to continue to communicate with and nurture this support such a distance from the campus. Not only money, but students are recruited from these churches. The past President chose to travel a great deal to these churches to preach, conduct workshops, and give a report on the status of Milligan. The current President, Dr. Jeanes, has taken the approach to hire a Vice President of Institutional Advancement to do a major portion of church fund raising. Dr. Jeanes will remain on campus about two-thirds of his time and build relationships with area churches, businesses, and civic groups. He wants to establish a stronger relationship for Milligan within the region.

Milligan has developed a set of goals or values, compass points through strategic planning, that will drive the institution for the next several years. Most of the items or goals listed have to do with the infrastructure of the College or internal strengthening of the College in all areas, such as, academics, students services, campus life, financial, and facilities. The emphasis seems to build on the present, strengthen the positives, improve the negatives, and develop new programs in a planned and systematic manner.

Observations. (1.) Milligan College has a long history with little change in its vision, mission, and implicit values. There seems to exist an environment that emphasizes shared values in a mission statement built upon trust that contributes to integrative processes and solutions. Fisher and Tack (1988) suggested this was an important model for organizational effectiveness and a critical component to addressing the challenges or multiple realities facing higher education. According to Wilcox and Ebbs (1992a), the moral and ethical vision of a higher education institution must be
fostered by and protected by all of its community members. The Milligan College “family” certainly seems to exhibit these qualities and selects students, staff, and faculty that will adhere to the same practices.

(2). Two areas of growth for the College over the last few years have been athletic programs, and professional and graduate programs. Adding and expanding existing athletic programs has helped to increase enrollment, especially international students. While increasing the international student enrollment, which adds needed diversity to the liberal arts institution, there could be some negative consequences. One, it is expensive for international students to attend Milligan; therefore, requiring additional scholarship money. Secondly, there may be a growing perception that Milligan is compromising the academic standards to increase the athletic programs. The accountability of resources and academic standards are two issues that are being carefully examined by students, faculty, and administration to make certain a good balance is maintained.

The development of additional professional and graduate programs is being closely monitored by the Milligan community. While a professional or graduate program can strengthen the academic mission of the institution, increase enrollment, and service the community, there is a danger that the nature of the College may shift, either strengthened or weakened, depending on the perception. Adding graduate programs or professional programs tend to bring adult or non-traditional students to the campus. The challenge is to integrate these students into the campus, where very little integration has been done in the past. The question is raised as to how much of the liberal arts studies
should be required of these students. Presently, graduate students are required to take the liberal arts curriculum. There may be increased pressure to drop this requirement, if enrollment becomes an issue.

There would be a debate whether Milligan should retain its liberal arts tradition or move away from that stance to accommodate an increase in enrollment of adult students. The philosophy of the administration seems to be that selected graduate or professional programs can be successfully integrated into the liberal arts tradition of the institution, if carefully selected and implemented. Expanding professional and graduate programs could increase enrollment; however, the cost of implementing and maintaining the program could be a challenge. Such is the case with the current Nursing program whose accreditation is in jeopardy. Nursing is an expensive program to maintain and with the threat of losing its accreditation, enrollment in the program decreased. Programs have to be self-supporting, if at all possible; therefore, the program is being monitored as to the feasibility of retainment.

(3.) The Milligan College administration desires to increase enrollment which would help keep tuition down and increase resources for the operating budget. The challenge is to plan growth within the limits of current facilities, and then, have a strategic plan for any additional facilities. The College’s goal is to increase the on-campus residency which is an integral part of their mission as a liberal arts institution. At present, approximately 60% of the students live on campus according to the Vice President for Student Development. There is increasing pressure from students to live off-campus. The College’s objective is to upgrade current residence halls and provide
additional space, even though, they are currently at capacity. An alternative currently being pursued is to convert married housing into single student housing. This would necessitate students attending Emmanuel School of Religion and living in married housing at Milligan to find alternative housing. Emmanuel has begun construction of a housing complex on its campus, so this could be accomplished. This is only a short-term solution, as additional and upgraded housing is needed to meet the demand.

(4.) The campus life at Milligan reflects two different orientations of students: students who tend to want a stricter environment in terms of rules and regulations, and students who seem to be satisfied with the balance of the current environment. There seemed to be a group of students who thought Milligan would be a stricter environment and would be more like traditional Bible colleges. These students tend to see Milligan as too “liberal” and some later transfer. There are students that enroll at Milligan expecting it to be Utopia, as one student referred to it. The expectation is that as a Christian institution, Milligan will be perfect. They discover that even in a Christian environment, there are imperfect individuals. They get discouraged and leave the institution. The administration, faculty, and most students seem to be pleased with the current philosophy and balance of practices existing on the campus. Even though there seems to be a good faith effort to promote an accurate and realistic picture of Milligan College, there are still perceptions and expectations that new students find incongruent upon their enrollment.

(5.) Students’ perceptions of the environment at Milligan are generally positive overall. The College has been reviewing with the students feedback generated from the satisfaction inventory conducted by the Coalition for Christian Colleges and Universities.
Issues mentioned that are being reviewed are parking, visitation, and other student services that could be offered. Improving campus life is one of the goals of the Strategic Plan and seems to be a high priority with the administration. There did seem to exist a feeling among students that the advantage they receive in a quality Christian liberal arts environment outweighs any lack of service or program. One student ambassador said she talked to prospective students

About the price of attending Milligan, the extra-curricular activities and about student life and the application process. She also tells prospective students that things aren’t perfect: the food isn’t always great, they won’t always get the classes they want or the professor they want. The small enrollment, does ensure that every student has an advisor. And since Milligan is a Christian School, Christianity is brought into the classes…. It seems like every tour I give there is a parent who wants to know about alcohol or drugs on campus. I don’t deny that it’s here. I tell them that it is a Christian school, but not everyone is a Christian. (Pfeifer, 1998b, p. 2)

(6.) Grant and Broom (1998) stated that a college or university president must effectively communicate the expected values and have a clear vision of the institution’s ethical culture and be able to “make it live in the imagination of all the members of the community” (p. 197). It may appear that the shared values, beliefs, and norms of the Milligan College family may have more impact upon the president and the leadership than the reverse. Milligan College can stand as an example where as Batten (1994) summarized the relationship of an organization’s values and expectations by stating, “organizational policies, procedures, processes, and programs must be individually rooted in the organization’s philosophy” (p. 61).

The rules and regulations; policies and procedures; and expectations are more than formal codes, laws, or policy statements at Milligan. They are a standard of
behavior or conduct that is expected of each Milligan member. It is a duty or obligation as a Christian to exhibit these standards or behaviors in all areas of life, on or off campus. Faculty and staff are expected to be role models, as well as, “molders and shapers” for this kind of Christian commitment. Faculty and staff view their role as a ministry, thus elevating their role and expectations of themselves and each other. The reward for compliance or alignment with the institution’s values are in fulfilling their call to ministry or the willingness and faithfulness to the mission of Milligan College. As Dr. Gwaltney said it is part of the ethos of the culture. It is what makes Milligan unique and distinct from other Christian or liberal arts colleges.

Conclusion

After conducting a careful analysis of the role of values at two different and distinct institutions of higher education, it is obvious that values play an integral role in the nature and character of the institutions. There are contrasting differences in the vision, values, and goals of the two institutions. The purpose of this study was not to determine a degree of goodness, but rather to provide description and insight of each institution and their nature and character. It will ultimately be up to the reader to formulate their own conclusions; however, the researcher will attempt to identify some of the major points or themes that seem to emerge.

Milligan College, whose vision, mission, and values are firmly planted into the culture, and has been since inception, have a strong sense of who and what they are and what they are about. The Milligan “family,” such as, students, faculty, and staff truly
embrace them and proudly upholds the torch as part of their selection into the “family.”

There is little diversity in terms of faculty and staff employed at Milligan. In contrast, East Tennessee State University has had a mission statement that has undergone tremendous change throughout its history and evolution, yet, has had a written vision and value statement for less than six years. There is still some confusion, vagueness, and a lack of integration of these into the culture. This lack of integration is a result of implementation strategies that are not comprehensive enough at each level of the institution, as well as, a lack of embracement of the values fully by members. Individuals hired at ETSU are selected for qualities and characteristics that may or may not reflect the University’s values.

ETSU Pride activities and continuous improvement may be good strategies for implementing the values, but may prove inadequate within themselves. There is some degree of a feeling of a lack of identity and connection to the University by students, staff, faculty, and alumni. This may be changing and the University, as many of the interviewees would suggest, may be headed in the right direction or basically has a good game plan. However, it can not happen without effective guidance, nurturing, and purposefully planning overtime. At Milligan, the word “pride” was not used to describe individuals feelings about the College, as it is considered one of the seven deadly sins. However, there was a sense of confidence and connectedness to the College based upon history, tradition, vision, and mission.

The institutionalization of values is not to be confused with a slick marketing or image building strategy that sometimes seems to be the case at ETSU. It is much deeper
and more significant than those things might entail. It is, however, a way of life for the individuals who are members of the institution. It is the passing down or the orienting of new members to the history, purpose, vision, mission, and values of the institution, that is, an accumulation of all the events that makes the institution what it is, and is the foundation and heart of what it is to become. In contrast to ETSU, Milligan tends to do a more effective job of telling the story of what it is about.

There are similarities between the two presidents, as several individuals pointed out to the researcher. They both are professional, "healers" with Dr. Stanton being trained as a surgeon and Dr. Jeanes as a minister. Each President had a prior history with his institution before becoming President: Dr. Stanton as Vice President for Health Affairs and Dean of the Medical College and Dr. Jeanes as alumnus, administrator, and board member. Both Presidents seem to be respected and active in the community. They are approximately the same age and refer to each other as friend. They assumed their President positions about the same time and are viewed as leaders with integrity and vision. The two Presidents seem to have respect for each other; and have had conversations about how the two institutions can work together without direct competition. There seems to be a good working relationship between the institutions as evidenced by the Presidents; a cooperative agreement among the institutions; and a committee of individuals from each institution that meets regularly to discuss pertinent issues.

While Milligan seems to have a good sense of who and what it is, ETSU's identity and sense of self seems to still be emerging as it defines, evolves, and expands its mission.
in the region and country. While Milligan is focusing inward into improving and strengthening the College, ETSU is focusing outward to the region and forming partnerships. Dr. Jeanes indicated that he expects to be on the campus about two-thirds of his time, but will work to improve community partnerships. There is speculation by some interviewees that Dr. Stanton spends approximately 60% of his time on external affairs, such as, regional cooperation, legislative issues, and community partnerships. Both approaches are needed for institutional development and advancement and reflect a value that each has placed on his role, but careful balance must be maintained.

At Milligan, it is quite evident that students are cared about, and teaching is central to the College’s mission and values, while at ETSU teaching, research, and service are emphasized. While students and teaching are very important at ETSU and much is being done to educate students, the relation of faculty with students is not as apparent. There are many factors that impact this such as class size, student interest, faculty activities, and rewards. There seems to be some initiatives through the general core curriculum, interdisciplinary opportunities, first-year programs, and advisement that will make improvements in this area.

**Recommendations**

Because only two institutions were analyzed for this study, generalizations to other institutions are not appropriate. However, there are some recommendations that could be made that may be applicable to Milligan College, ETSU, and to other institutions of higher education.
1. Because the vision, mission, and values of the institution are essential to defining the nature and character of the institution, there should be a careful periodic review of them. There should be broad participation and involvement in the formulation and communication of the vision, mission, and value statements throughout the institution. Debate and discussion should occur regularly and continuously as to the relevance, applicability, alignment, and compliance with these by the institutional members. The leadership must, as DePree (1992) stated, define, record, and demonstrate the values and beliefs of the organization through designed plans, priorities at all levels, ensured accountability, and continued renewal.

2. Effective and continuous communication strategies should be formulated and implemented to ensure awareness of the values by the institution’s members. New and prospective members of the institution should be made fully aware of the values and expectation(s) of the institution. Values compliance or alignment should be integrated into the recruiting, hiring, supervising, and evaluation process for faculty and staff through training programs.

3. An individual or area within the institution should be identified and given the responsibility to ensure continuous review, transmission, and evaluation of the vision, mission, and values of the institution. This individual or area would be responsible for providing organizational development activities that would ensure the integration of the values into processes and activities of the institution.

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.
4. The institution should conduct periodic self-evaluations or audits of the vision, mission, and values and the role they play within the institution. This can be accomplished much like a self-study or accreditation review. This process could be conducted on a periodic basis through the internal accreditation process and strategic planning. Programs, processes, and activities should be evaluated against the vision, mission, and values of the institution. An outside evaluator, similar to an accreditation review, would be helpful as part of the evaluation process. This is called the values audit of the institution. The values audit could consist of a review of all relevant documents, such as reviewed in this study; interviews; observations; and participation. A further recommendation for the audit would be to include a survey instrument to assess the organizational climate or culture and to conduct focus groups with faculty, staff, and students to allow for more identification and examination of sub-cultures. Such a continuous in-depth analysis should be included in the strategic planning process of the university.

Recommendations for Further Research

The findings of this study indicate a need for further research into the area of values and higher education. There are many dimensions of values that need further study and analysis. Whereas this study used a broad approach to examining values, a narrower approach could provide some very rich description of data. Qualitative and quantitative research studies could be used in various ways to obtain and measure
different phenomena related to values. Further in-depth research should be conducted in the areas mentioned in the review of literature for this study: values and higher education; values and the college student; values and organizations; values and leadership; and the values audit. Some questions that should allow for additional research are the following:

1. What is the influence of leadership on values and vice versa? How do values influence leadership?
2. What is the impact of values on student, faculty, and staff behavior?
3. How do values impact the decision making process?
4. What and how are values taught and what their implications in the curriculum?
5. How is values development promoted in college students? How does the college or university environment influence students’ values?
6. What appropriate models exist for rewarding values compliance or alignment?
7. What are the characteristics of values driven organizations?

Through careful and purposeful research in these areas, higher education institutions could collect needed data to support their mission and purpose. Through institutional self-knowledge, planned growth and development can occur in a systematic and productive manner. This would allow, as Astin (1989) described, for a better correlation between implicit values that drive internal institutional policies and explicit values that are written in university documents. Through assessing the values professed and practiced within an institution, changes can be made to structure that environment to promote value driven institutions and enhances the decision making process.
REFERENCES
REFERENCES


College Students. (NASPA Monograph Series No. 4). USA: National Association of Student Personnel Administrator, Inc.


Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.


APPENDIX A

INTERVIEWEES

EAST TENNESSEE STATE UNIVERSITY
INTERVIEWEES

CASE STUDY I - EAST TENNESSEE STATE UNIVERSITY

1. Female Staff Member Alumna/COM
2. Mr. Jeff Howard Alumnus/Graduate Student
3. Dr. Wayne Andrews Vice President of Student Affairs
4. Ms. Mary Jordan Affirmative Action Officer
5. Dr. Paul Stanton President
6. Ms. Edwina Greer Assistant Director, Internal Auditor
7. Ms. Kathy Feagins Admissions Counselor, Past President of Staff Senate
8. Mr. Charles Stahl Alumnus/Elizabethton City Manager
9. Dr. Jane Melendez Faculty, Past President of Faculty Senate
10. Dr. Linda Doran Associate Vice President of Academic Affairs
11. Mr. William Coleman Assistant Vice President of Human Resources
12. Dr. John Quigley Faculty, Past President of Faculty Senate
13. Dr. Nancy Bartel Faculty, College of Business
14. Mr. Russell Wilson Student, President of Student Government Association
INTERVIEWEES

CASE STUDY II - MILLIGAN COLLEGE

1. Ms. Edwina Greer Alumna
2. Mr. Charles Stahl Elizabethton City Manager, Member Board of Advisors
3. Ms. Melissa Ford Alumna/Resident Director
4. Dr. Nancy Bartel Adjunct Faculty
5. Ms. Stephanie Mitchum Student
6. Ms. Carrie Davidson Alumna/Admissions Counselor
7. Mr. Bill Greer Alumnus/Faculty/Chair of Business
8. Mr. Jonathan Robinson Alumnus/Bookstore Manager
9. Dr. William Gwaltney Retired Faculty/Interim Academic Dean
10. Dr. Bert Allen Faculty/Chair of Student Development
11. Dr. Don Jeanes Alumnus/President
SELECTED DOCUMENTS USED IN DATA COLLECTION

ETSU Faculty Handbook

ETSU Accent, September 30

Service Learning Program Brochure


1998-99 Viewbook, assorted departmental brochures

1998-99 Undergraduate and Graduate Catalogs


Minutes of the Academic Council, Senior Staff, Staff and Faculty Senates, President’s Council, Registration, and Student Affairs

ETSU General Education Review Final Narrative Report, 1997

Introduction to Service Learning (HUMT 1020) class syllabus

Various Memoranda

National Colligate Athletic Association Division I Certification Self-Study Report 1997

Syllabus Attachment

University Judicial Committee’s Annual Report 1997-98

ETSU Webpage

Press releases

Student and alumni surveys
APPENDIX D

DOCUMENTS - MILLIGAN COLLEGE
SELECTED DOCUMENTS USED IN DATA COLLECTION

1998 Application for Undergraduate Admission to Milligan College
1998 The Milligan College Administrative and Staff Personnel Handbook
1998 The Milligan College Faculty Handbook
1998 Milligan Milepost
1998-1999 Milligan College Catalog
1998-99 Milligan College Recruitment Booklet
Christ in Culture Class Syllabus
Coalition for Christian Colleges and Universities Satisfaction Survey 1998
Compass Points: Directions for the 21st Century
Introduction to College and Careers Class Syllabus
Milligan College News Release, May 14, 1998
The Stampede, September 23, 1998
The Milligan Profile (1998)
The Stampede, March 20, 1998
The Stampede Online
APPENDIX E

AUDIT
October 31, 1998

Ms. Jane Jones  
Executive Assistant to the President  
East Tennessee State University  
Johnson City, Tennessee 37614

Dear Ms. Jones:

I appreciate very much your agreeing to serve as inquiry auditor for my dissertation project. As a doctoral candidate, you know the inquiry auditor is important to establishing the trustworthiness of a qualitative study. As the inquiry auditor, you can help strengthen the trustworthiness of my study. I hope the auditing experience will prove valuable to you as you begin the data collection phase of your dissertation.

You will be provided access to all materials utilized in this study. These materials include: Chapters 1-6 of my dissertation; audio tapes; and verbatim transcripts; of interviews, all field, personal and debriefer notes; and documents analyzed.

The inquiry audit helps determine dependability, confirmability, and credibility measures of the research (Guba & Lincoln, 1985). As you review the information provided, please respond to the following points:

(1) Dependability - Can the data be accounted for? Is the data complete, comprehensive, and useful? Were all linkages and areas explored and established?

(2) Confirmability - Are findings grounded in the data? Is there evidence of researcher bias? Are inferences logical and appropriate?


Thank you again for agreeing to assisting me with this project. Your professionalism and expertise are greatly appreciated. Please contact me, if and, when you have questions and concerns.

Sincerely,

Bonnie L. Burchett
March 28, 1999

Ms. Bonnie Burchett
Associate Director, Office of Housing
East Tennessee State University
Johnson City, Tennessee 37614

Dear Ms. Burchett:

Thank you for affording me the opportunity to serve as auditor for your qualitative dissertation. It has been a pleasure to confirm the trustworthiness of your study. I am impressed with its comprehensiveness and objectivity.

The ex post facto audit procedures are completed. According to specified criteria as outlined by you, and based on the work of Lincoln and Guba, the audit addressed the dependability, confirmability, and credibility of the data.

The auditor's first task was to become thoroughly familiar with the study; the problem investigated; the paradigmatic and methodological approaches taken; the nature of the guiding substantive theory, and the findings and conclusions. The auditor, then became familiar with the audit trail as agreed upon by the researcher and the auditor. This included the linkage system that tied the audit trail materials to actual events and outcomes. Data were traced back to their original sources in interview and observation records, documents, transcripts and audio recordings. Finally, the auditor made the decision that the audit trail was complete, comprehensible, and useful.

The audit next addressed the trustworthiness of the study. This was accomplished by assessments of confirmability, dependability, and credibility.

The confirmability of the findings are grounded in the data. The inferences based on the data from interviews, documents, transcriptions, and audiotapes are logical and appropriately categorized. Critical incidences were appropriate from the transcriptions that were audited. The auditee ensured confirmability through the use of triangulation. The auditor concluded that the data and interpretation of the study are grounded in events rather than the researcher's personal constructions.
In the area of dependability, data from selected samples were accounted for and all reasonable areas were explored. Both negative and positive critical incidents, as cited by the interviewees, were recorded, and efforts to not influence the responses were noted on numerous occasions when reading the transcripts and listening to the tapes. In giving directions, the researcher made every attempt to not lead the responses.

Credibility of the study was enhanced through triangulation, peer debriefing, referential adequacy, and member checking. In conclusion, the data gathering process, through triangulation, the transcripts, categorizing of quotes, congruence of incidents and categories, and researcher objectivity are confirmable, dependable, and credible.

Congratulations on the completion of your dissertation. My observations and results of audit procedures provide the basis for my conclusion that you have consistently adhered to and maintained the highest standards of professional ethics and practice in your research. I am confident your contribution to the body of knowledge concerning values in higher education institutions will be well received in the field.

Sincerely,

Jane M. Jones, M.P.H., B.S.N.
Executive Assistant to the President
East Tennessee State University
VITA

BONNIE L. BURCHETT

Education: Flatwoods High School, Jonesville, Virginia, 1970
Hiwassee College, Madisonville, Tennessee; sociology, A.A., 1972
East Tennessee State University, Johnson City, Tennessee; sociology/political science, B.S., 1974
East Tennessee State University, Johnson City, Tennessee; guidance and counseling, M.A., 1981
East Tennessee State University, Johnson City, Tennessee; educational leadership & policy analysis, Ed.D., 1999

Professional Experience: Resident Assistant, Hiwassee College, Madisonville, Tennessee, 1971-1972
Resident Assistant, East Tennessee State University, Johnson City, Tennessee, 1973-1974
Resident Director, East Tennessee State University, Johnson City, Tennessee, 1974-1977
Coordinator for Residence Hall Life, East Tennessee State University, Johnson City, Tennessee, 1977-1981
Assistant Director of Housing, East Tennessee State University, Johnson City, Tennessee, 1981-1996
Associate Director of Housing, East Tennessee State University, Johnson City, Tennessee, 1996-present

Who’s Who Among American Junior Colleges, Hiwassee College, 1972
Pi Gamma Mu Honor Society, East Tennessee State University, 1974
Gamma Beta Phi, East Tennessee State University, 1989
Phi Delta Kappa, East Tennessee State University, 1991
Southeast Association of University and College Housing Officers, Past State Representative
Tennessee Association of College and University Housing Officers, a Founding Member, Past President
Member, served as President-elect, and President of East Tennessee State University Staff Senate
Distinguished Staff Award, 1994
Omicron Delta Kappa, 1996
National Association for Female Executives, 1998
Phi Kappa Phi, 1998

Reproduced with permission of the copyright owner. Further reproduction prohibited without permission.