5-2009

# Comparative Analysis of Advertising Value Appeals Reflected in U.S. and Chinese Women's Fashion Print Advertisements.

Yi Lin
*East Tennessee State University*

Comparative Analysis of Advertising Value Appeals Reflected in U.S. and Chinese Women's

Fashion Print Advertisements

_____

A thesis

presented to

the faculty of the Department of Communication

East Tennessee State University

In partial fulfillment

of the requirements for the degree

Master of Arts of Professional Communication

_____

by

Yi Lin

May 2009

_____

Stephen W. Marshall, Chair

James J. Mooney

Bei Cheng Liang

Keywords: Women's Fashion Magazines, Cultural Values, Advertising Appeals, China, U.S.

ABSTRACT


Comparative Analysis of Advertising Value Appeals Reflected in U.S. and Chinese Women's

Fashion Print Advertisements


by


Yi Lin

Analyzing 549 advertisements in Chinese and U.S. women's fashion magazines, this research

studies the role of western culture in reshaping Chinese cultural values in terms of modernity,

tradition, individualism, and collectivism as well as in the use of western fashion models and

language. Results indicate that there is no statistical difference in individualistic and modernity

values between U.S. and Chinese print ads in women's fashion magazines. In 1 of the product

characteristics, shared products, collectivism values in Chinese ads are not found more than

those in U.S. ads as it is assumed. In addition, almost half of the Chinese ads employ western

models and only 2 out of 226 Chinese ads are applying merely Chinese language to name the

brand. The implications for future research and limitation of this study are discussed.

# DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my father and mother who are always supporting me.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank Dr. Stephen Marshall, my committee chair, adviser, and my friend whose encouragement and support made my achievements in the past 2 years. His attitude towards study and his thorough understandings of academic research inspired and assisted me to finish my thesis. I am very grateful for all he has done for me.

I also want to thank Dr. Mooney. He is such a nice mentor in giving me advice and help that I think of him as being like my grandpa who supports me in aspects of both life and study.

I thank Dr. Liang who inspired and helped me a lot for my thesis as well.  I would like to express thanks to Professor Guo and my friend Xie Hongjing in China, who helped me collect data, as well as my four coders Yingjuan Tang, Jing Zang, Jessica, and James. I also want to show my appreciation to Swami Sunil who gave me lots of support.

At last, I would like to thank all the professors at the Department of Communication. Dr. Dorgan, Dr. Kinser, Dr. Brown, Dr. Roberts, and Ms. Lise, etc., they all gave me great help in past 2 years. Thank you all.

CONTENTS

Chapter

Chapter

# LIST OF TABLES

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

A globally standardization approach of advertising has its evident appeals to multinational companies. However, the opposite adaptation approach may has its own benefit to persuade international marketers as different countries have different cultural values (Kale, 1991). Employing quantitative or qualitative content analysis, previous research has identified different cultural values reflected in advertisements by comparing and analyzing ads from different countries, especially comparing western and eastern countries (Cheng, 1994; Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996; Lin, 1993; Lin, 2001; Muller, 1992). For instance, western countries are found to have dominant individualism and modernity values, whereas eastern countries have collectivism and traditional values.

However, previous studies mostly focused on the mass audience when they compare advertising in different countries. Because advertising is an audience-centered connective channel, ads with different target audience may reflect different levels of cultural values. Therefore, the purpose of this research is to compare and analyze cultural values reflected in Chinese and U.S. women's fashion print advertisements. The use of individualism themes versus collectivism, and traditional themes versus modernity themes in print ads in selected magazines are compared to answer a set of research questions addressing an audience-specific investigation of differences in culture.

A society's ads can signify changes in consumption and cultural values demonstrated from changes in advertising appeals (Pollay, 1986). This research is designed to investigate to what extent the presence of western values is exhibited in Chinese women's fashion magazines.

The purpose is to compare findings with previous literature regarding differences in terms of modernity, individualism, as well as in the use of western fashion models and language.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

Principally China is believed to follow eastern culture. It used to cut its connection with the outside world; however, after the "open-door" policy in 1978, China adopted the perspective of globalization and introduced many aspects of capitalist economics into its socialist economy (Chan & Chan, 2005). Chinese began to get in touch of western culture year by year. Advertising was viewed as a capitalistic evil and was banned in China for decades after 1949 because of Chinese politics" (Liu, 2002, p.119), but it is a crucial means in Chinese business currently. Nowadays, the legion born after 1970s became the potential consumer segment in China. Most of them are the single child in their families (Liu, 2002). Due to their specific position in the families, they are treated as "princes" who play a crucial role in families' consumption. Not only does this group of young consumers have money and education, but they also have their own outlook as to how to manage money. Under the influential western culture, they are less traditional and culture-bound in terms of living habits, lifestyle, and ideology. They enjoy spending time with friends and going to bars and clubs at night. They love to shop frequently and spend lots of money on fashion products. These young people are very eager to buy cutting-edge digital products like camera, GPS, handheld consoles, and cell phones. They take pleasure in dining in Pizza Hut, McDonald's, KFC, and Burger King. They watch NBA, World Cup, and fashion shows (Chen, 2009).

Comparative speaking, half of this group, women, have had a revolutionized change. They have equal social statue as men in society and family; they have high education; they are financially independent; they have increasing financial and decision-making power in family; they are the main stream in fashion world. Based on Asia Time Online's survey, 90 million of

Chinese urban women spend 10% or more of their annual income on beauty products. In addition, some of them prefer the world's top brands to show their taste of fashion and beauty (Newham, 2006). Because of women's particular position in Chinese's current society, it is worthy of studying the culture about this group. In addition, there is no specific research comparing the Chinese and U.S. women's fashion magazines and their relationship with cultural values. Thus, this study will examine the fashion magazines targeting metropolitan women age from 20 to 35 years of age with high education and salary, who can afford buying these products.

*Women's Role in China*

Written historic records of four thousand years show that women are generally repressive and always considered lower than men (Formation…Civilization, 2001).  Confucius doctrine said women were not equal to men, for they were unworthy or incapable of a literary education. Traditionally, women should obey "the three obediences and four virtues" (*san cong si de*) according to Confucian ethics. The three obediences for women are obedience to father before marriage, obedience to husband after marriage, and obedience to son after husband's death. The four virtues are morality, proper speech, modest manner, and diligent work. Women were nameless and not able to build up their own self-identity as social individuals and had no consciousness to strive for equality with men. Having no rights to go to school, they are excluding from the public sphere. To a woman, she should accept the arranged marriage, while giving birth to a baby and rearing children are the priority. And the old society prefers son over daughter. Most Chinese women tended to see themselves as attachments of their father, husband, and son and to accept the inequalities inherent in society (Siu & Au, 1997).

In addition, "Confucian classics also stress the ideals of female behavior: women should be kind, docile, pure, gentle, decorous, modest, diligent, dutiful, and quiet" (Siu & Au, 1997,

P236). If they failed to follow the rules or behaved inappropriately, they were blamed for the ruin of the harmony of society and were punished in the public.

On the other hand, in the modern society, women's role is growing in matters of social, cultural, and political importance. The new marriage law clearly states that a marriage system is based on the free choice of partners and on equality between man and woman. Nowadays women in addition to taking care of the family can work and gain power inside and outside of family (Xiong, 2008). The traditional domestic values are changing. Women are entitled to "Half of the Sky" (Xinhua News Agency, 2003, Para. 3). Like men, they are encouraged to take part in waged labor. Women are now the backbone of China's economy participating in every public affair. In the capital's primary, secondary, and tertiary sectors, women account for 39.4%, 26.4%, and 39.4% of total employees respectively. Women also play an important role in municipal and other government organizations. Currently, 16.7% of bureau-level officials in Beijing are women. Depending on their own ability, courage, and insight to create their career, women nowadays are gaining freedom to choose work and gain chances of promotion.

Women education is the foremost social interest of the Chinese government. Sincere efforts have constantly increased women literacy level over years. Until October 2000, there were 102,684 million female students in school all over the country; 99.07% of girls go to primary schools, roughly equaling the rate for boys (99.14%) (Women's Education in China, 2000).

Chinese women are standing in the vortex of the cross-culture winds sweeping the country at the present time. Particularly, women aged from 20 to 35 are the generation that grew up under the influence of western culture. Taking up the western concept of individuality, independence, and personal responsibility, they are altering Chinese traditional values (Zhang &

Shavitt, 2003). In this vein, studying changes of the cultural values reflected in advertising from this group is crucial for understanding how to communicate with this potentially value-shifting population.

*Standardization vs. Adaptation*

Studies of cultural values reflected in message of advertising achieved immense momentum from the debate on standardization vs. adaptation of international advertising strategies in different countries all over the world (Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996; Mueller, 1987, 1992). However, no matter if standardization or adaptation strategy is uesed, no matter how different or similar two societies are, understanding the audience is central to any persuasive communication. The decision ultimately comes down to the audience.

Countries all around the world are different – differences in culture, stage of economic and industrial development, stage of product life cycle, media availability, and legal restrictions suggest a localized advertising approach (Agrawal, 1994). Unwin (1974) compared print ads between US and Britain, which showed that they were different in many ways, although Americans and Britains shared same origin. For instance, British advertisements sometimes contained ambiguous expression, while American advertisers tried very hard to be accurate and clear-cut; British ads were implicit, American ads are explicit; Americans prefer writing advertisements, as British tend to visualize them. In this vein, he suggested that it might be more effective to transit one country's cultural values into its own market. Analyzing the content of American and Japanese print ads, Hong, Muderrisoglu, and Zinkhan (1987) showed that Japanese ads were more emotional and less comparative than American ads. Tansey, Hyman, and Zinkhan (1990) studied both Brazilian and US automobile ads and found Brazilian ads used more urban and work themes, while leisure themes appeared more frequently in US ads.

On the other hand, studying the transferability in Europe and the Middle East, Dunn (1966) found that US print advertisements were astonishingly transferrable in three perspectives. For instance, in terms of market or economic criteria, the state of industrialization was a good indicator of the applicability of U.S. advertisements, that is, a country was highly industrialized as U.S. may prefer ads similar to those used in U.S.. In the aspect of cultural or psychological criteria, although culture values were vary among countries, the basic elements contained in culture are similar everywhere. For media criteria, "the more the media available in a country paralleled those in the United States, the more likely the company was to use U.S. advertising" (Dunn, p.30). In addition, Marquez (1979) analyzed the cultural content of commercials from the USA, the Philippines, and Thailand and concluded that the standardized advertising could be used among the three countries as advertisements in these countries portrayed cultural values in an almost identical manner. Moreover, Levitt (1983) argued for standardization in his concept of global marketing strategy that the earth is flat.

From an international marketing perspective, advertising is considered to be a challenging complicated task due to different cultures, economic conditions, and political systems of target countries. Knowing this, advertisers are always analyzing if companies should adopt a standardized or localized approach in the international market. In addition, the debate on standardization versus adaptation has no definite conclusions (Javalgi, Culter, & White, 1994). Whichever and however standardization or adaptation strategy is employed in international marketing, the fundamental trigger is the audience-specific application of values across culture. Advertising is a reflective mirror of cultural values, which determines each advertisement is audience-bound creation (Pollay, 1986).

*Cross-Culture Studies in Values*

Values are the core of culture and reflect the society system as well as the perception of culture (Mueller, 2004). Rokeach (1973) defined a value as "an enduring belief that a specific mode of conduct or end-state of existence is personally or socially preferable to alternate modes of conduct or end-state of existence" (p. 5). Actually, value is a criterion that is held in the very central of people's mind to conduct their behavior, attitude, evaluation.

Different societies share different values, which makes the cross-culture studies in great need under the trend of globalization. However, cross-culture studies that examine the cultural values in advertising of Eastern cultures remain limited (Lin, 2001). Cultural values reflected in advertising content through appeals in such countries as India (Khariullah & Khairullah, 2009; Singh & Huang, 1962; Srikandath, 1991), Japan (Mueller, 1992; Lin, 1993; Okazaki, 2004), Korea (Moon & Chan, 2005), Hong Kong (Tse, Belk, & Zhou, 1989) have been investigated.

Singh and Huang (1962) found that U.S. print media advertisements are not effective in India in that the cultural confliction between their appeals and the host culture. Indian society had been defined as the governing ideas and guiding principles for thought and action, whose cultural values reflected in advertising messages were mainly related to powerful forces (Srikandath, 1991). In Indian culture, women were considered passive to men. They brought familial harmony and they were expected to be considerate and dutiful wives, mothers, and daughter-in-laws. Men earned the bread for whole family. However, in U.S. modern families, both husband and wife share responsibilities of family's economy, housework, and childcare. In addition, because of the high divorce rate, women serve as role models of both mother and father in single-mother household (Khariullah & Khairullah, 2009). Based on the above statement, these two countries share diverse social views toward role of women and men in both families

17

and societies. Different target audiences make different advertising design and marketing strategy.

Japan is a developed capitalist East Asian country but greatly influenced by western culture. It is easy to presume that Japan has the trend to become more western (Mueller, 1992). In 1980s, Japanese commercials still showed strong Japanese culture values, but they were becoming "Americanized" in style (Belk & Pollay, 1985). Later, Mueller (1992) studied Japanese and U.S. magazine ads by using the concept of hard sell and soft sell. On one hand, in soft sell, the major concern is to create a mood or an atmosphere rather than emphasizing the product and its features. A beautiful scene or the progress of a touching story may be employed and the communication style is inclined to be more suggestive than direct in soft sell approach. On the other hand, in hard sell, it mainly concentrates on differentiating the product from the competition. The words like "number one" and "leader" are signs of hard sell approach with insistent communication style. Mueller (1992) discovered that "the very Japanese soft-sell appeal is becoming significantly more common in Japanese advertising. And, the Western hard-sell appeal, proposed to be a growing trend, makes only a rare appearance in Japanese advertising" (p. 22). Comparing the cultural differences in message strategies between U.S. and Japanese television commercials, Lin (1993) found out both countries shared similar strategy to deliver product information. Nevertheless, more recently, the research of cross-cultural dimensionality of product-based Web sites among Japan, Spain, and U.S. by Okazaki (2004) revealed that "Japanese Multinational corporations are likely to localize their Web sites to meet the target market culture through tailoring content and creative strategies" (p.81).

Above studies are all comparing U.S. with eastern countries in that U.S. particularly represents westernized culture. In other words, it is much more complex than east and west

cultural values. However, due to the different target audience, different marketing strategies might be applied in societies that share similar cultural origin. Consequently, there are many studies comparing two countries with related cultural values. For example, the results of Moon and Chan (2005) show that femininity is an important variable to distinguish the advertising between Hong Kong and Korea. Furthermore, "both Hong Kong and Korean advertising show no difference in values of high uncertainty avoidance, although an appeal of high uncertainty avoidance was used more often in Korean advertising. However, values of low uncertainty avoidance are more prevalent in television commercials in Korea, a country of high uncertainty avoidance, than Hong Kong, a country of low uncertainty avoidance" (p.48). Thus, the connection between product categories and cultural values is society-based individually, without regards to the similarity of the cultures they share.

Similar research (Tse et al., 1989) had also been done between Hong Kong and Taiwan, which shared similar cultural or linguistic origins. In this study, the print ads from Hong Kong and Taiwan reflected different values. Hong Kong represented the absolute scheme of western consumerism, while Taiwan reflected an "easternized" western consumerism while developing under western culture. "They believe that the differences in cultural values depicted in advertisements resulted from societal differences in attitudes toward consumerism" (Lin, 2001, p.85).  Firth and Sengupta (1991) examined the cultural values of both U.S. and UK, which share related cultural backgrounds. They found there were huge differences in the use of individualism embed in magazine advertisements of the two countries. For instance, individualism is the dominant cultural value in U.S. advertisement, whereas, British traditional cultural value or history are more often showed in British advertisement.

In conclusion, the debate about the globalization or localization of international advertising messages in different countries around the world has added great force to research in cultural values and advertising. In contrast, the cross-cultural studies of advertising promote different marketing strategies to international business according to different cultural background and audience.

*China vs. U.S.*

Chinese and U.S. market are two main forces in the global market. The U.S. market has been leading the world for a long time, while the Chinese market is still developing potentially. The growth of international business boosts China's economy as well as the advertising activities in Chinese market. In 2007, the ad expenditure was $16,049 million in the Chinese advertising market, which ranks fifth all around the world. Between 2007 and 2010, China will be the second contributors to global ad spending growth, which is $10,194 million. It will just behind U.S. in accordance with 63.5% growth, although China's ad market is only 9% of the U.S. ad market (Zenith report, 2008). "China is becoming an engine for growth across Asia" (Noh & Hwang, 2006, p.320). With the past 2008 Beijing Olympic Games and the upcoming 2010 Shanghai World Expo, China provides a labor-intensive manufacturing base as well as demands enormous amounts of raw materials and purchases substantial levels of low-, medium- and high-tech products for its development (Hong, Noh, & Hwang, 2006). As China becomes an important economic powerhouse in the world, there is increasing interaction between U.S. and China. It is in great need for multinational companies to better understand the two markets with different cultural values in order to make sound international strategies.

Western culture highlights self-reliance, rejection of the past, and individualism (Hsu, 1981). Moreover, United States is a low-context culture that emphasizes more individualism and personal recognition and relies on explicit verbal messages to carry most of the conversational

20

information (Knutson, Komolsevin, Chatiketu, & Smith, 2002). Eastern culture is tradition-oriented, while Chinese way of life is largely influenced by Confucian doctrine (Hsu, 1981). Thus, China is believed to use more appeals communicating traditional values such as family, veneration of the elderly, and tradition in advertising than U.S.. In contrast, U.S. is assumed to use appeals to communicate values of modernity like youth, technology, and individualism (Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996).

Adopting Pollay's (1983) and Mueller's (1987, 1992) coding scheme of cultural values, Cheng and Schweitzer (1996) updated and identified eight cultural values that dominated either Chinese or U.S. television advertising by analyzing 1,105 People's Republic of China (PRC) and U.S. television commercials in value terms of: "modernity," "youth," "family," "technology," "tradition," "enjoyment," "individualism," and "economy". Of these values, "modernity" and "youth" were founded to be two dominant values in both Chinese and U.S. commercials. This implies the commercials in both two countries are targeting young consumers and promoting things that are new and to encourage change rather than maintain the status quo. In respect to Chinese commercials, a warm and close family is a highly desirable value in accordance with "tradition" value, which entails that Chinese society is still a culture-bound product. In terms of "enjoyment" and "economy", U.S. commercials more likely tend to use those two values than Chinese commercials. However, there were no statistically differences in the frequencies of "individualism" (Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996). Cheng (1994) content analyzed 572 Chinese magazine advertisement from 1982 and 1992. This study identified that traditional value was still stable in Chinese advertising, while modernity", "technology", and "quality" were also found to be the three main values reflected in Chinese advertising.

From above findings, U.S. commercials tend to use both symbolic and utilitarian values, while Chinese commercials prefer to symbolic ones more often. At the end, it points out that Chinese advertising is growing under a considerably strong influence of western culture, which supports that China in 1990s was more open and tolerant of Western culture.(Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996).

Although Chinese advertisements have influenced by western culture, they still reflect cultural values. Singh, Zhao, and Hu (2005) showed Chinese web sites were significantly higher in the depiction of collectivistic values compared to U.S. web sites, while U.S. web sites showed higher levels of individualism. Lin (2001) compared Chinese and American television advertising and indicated that the portrayal of traditional Chinese cultural values remained relatively stable, though subtle changes in cultural values and advertising strategies are still observable. In addition, Wang and Chan (2001) content analyzed 1,407 U.S. and PRC print ads and discovered western values such as adventure competition, enjoyment, individualism, and leisure are used in Chinese ads mainly for imported product and joint-venture products.

In the perspective of Chinese particular language, Nelson and Paek (2007) found out that both domestic and multinational ads were inclined to use Chinese or a hybrid of Chinese and non-Chinese language, but multinational brand ads were more likely to use non-domestic brand names, product names, and slogans than were domestic brand ads.

Central to this research is a study by Zhang and Shavitt (2003), which mainly targeted the Chinese X-Generation (aged from 18 to 35 years with high education and income). Content analyzed 463 ads in values term of modernity, tradition, individualism, and collectivism in both Chinese print and television advertisement, the results showed that both modernity and individualism values were the dominant values in current Chinese advertising. These values were

22

more persistent in print advertisements with target audience of X-Generation than that in television commercials, which targeted Chinese mass market. In contrast, collectivism and tradition values were more pervasive on television than in magazine ads. In terms of product characteristics (personal use versus shared products), collectivistic values are more prevalent in television commercials than that in print ads for shared products, but no media difference was found for personal use products. Overall, this study revealed the role of advertising in helping shape new values among Chinese X-Generation.

*Hypotheses and Research Questions*

From previous studies, Chinese advertisements contain both Chinese and western cultural values. However, previous studies focused on a wide range of products and were not entirely audience-specific except for a study conducted by Zhang and Shavitt (2003). This research takes a similar approach by examining ads in women's fashion magazines targeted to metropolitan women aged from 20 to 35 with high education and salary. As previously mentioned, this study is focused on the central argument of standardization or adaptation. Are brands currently taking a standardized approach to reaching women in both China and US?  Hence, it is important to ask:

*RQ 1: Is there a presence of standardized ads within Chinese and U.S. women's fashion magazines?*

*Individualism vs. Collectivism*

According to Hofstede's cultural dimensions (2009), collectivism is the degree to which individuals are merging into groups and concerned for the betterment of the group. In societies where people hold collectivism as a needed element of society, they are strongly tied in groups or families (uncles, aunts, and grandparents), and they continue protecting each other with absolute loyalty. Individualism is the opposite aspect of collectivism in which the ties between

individuals are loose: everyone is expected to look after himself or herself and his or her immediate family.

Based on previous studies (Cheng, 1994; Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996; Lin, 2001; Zhang & Shavitt, 2003), there were predominant modernity values in Chinese ads, which is a characteristic of expect to the use of individualistic appeals. Examining professional young women we will measure:

*RQ 2: Is there a difference in individualistic values between U.S. and Chinese print ads in women's fashion magazines?*

Previous studies have stated differences can be present when controlling for product type when comparing personal use products with shared use products (Zhang & Shavitt, 2003). For personal use products, purchased and used individually, they offer primarily individual experienced benefit. For example, personal use products include apparel, cosmetics, lingerie, etc. Based on product characteristics:

*RQ 3: How primary is the value of individualism in personal use product in Chinese women fashion print ads?*

For shared products, purchased and used with others, they could be viewed as reflection of either individualism or collectivism. They benefit both individual and the group. For example, wine, soft drinks, banking, insurance, etc. are all considered shared products. According to Zhang and Shavitt (2003), although China had predominant collectivism cultural value, this value still had less frequent rate overall than that of individualism with Generation X. However, Zhang and Shavitt, shared use products did tend to use more collectivism values compared to personal use products. Based on this the hypothesis is:

*H 1: For shared use products, collectivistic appeals are more likely to be used in Chinese print ads than U.S. print ads from women's fashion magazines.*

*Tradition vs. Modernity*

As mentioned in previous studies (Cheng, 1994; Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996; Lin, 2001; Zhang & Shavitt, 2003), traditional values have been identified in Chinese advertisements when examining a mass audience, but modernity values are on the rise over the last decades. China is a typical Asian country that has long history and tradition. Living under Confucian's ethics, Chinese people feel tradition holds a very important place in their daily lives.

However, after the "open door" policy, Chinese market would no longer be a single market only for Chinese people and companies. There is substantial economic growth with multinational corporations coming to China and making China an influential international market. Because of this, China's once closed culture has been changing day by day. Nowadays, 30 years since the implement of "open door" policy, modernity is a predominant value in Chinese ads (Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996; Zhang & Shavitt, 2003). Modernity is a marker for westernization. Our question is:

*RQ 4: Is there a difference in modernity values between U.S. and Chinese print ads in women's fashion magazines?*

*Western Models and Celebrities*

The usage of western models and celebrities may be considered as an indicator of westernization. The foreign tag is very much the representation of prestige and quality (Muller, 1992) and many Chinese with high salaries prefer to buy foreign products rather than the domestic products. Neelankavil *et al*. (1994) found out that global firms marketing products even in very traditional countries can achieve a form of standardization in their advertisements for

some products, such as, cosmetics products sold in Asian market that were manufactured in the USA. Because of this, it is important to measure:

*RQ 5: How prevalent is the usage of these western models and celebrities in Chinese print ads in women's fashion magazines?*

*Western Language*

Words are symbols and are crucial in print ads because they are the very way to transmit the message. If westernization is on the rise, it is possible that Chinese ads may adopt many American words and styles or may incorporate English language words into the product's brand name, thus taking a more standardized approach. However, if the ads use non-translated English words in headline or body copy, or use Chinese words entirely rather than a more adaptation approach is being used. To explore this focus the question is:

*RQ 6: To what extent are English-language words being employed in Chinese print ads of women's fashion magazines?*

CHAPTER 3

RESEARCH METHOD

Content analysis is considered a useful way to understand deep-seated cultural values (Wang & Chan, 2001). It is an observational research method that studies the symbolic content of all forms of communications that include image, word, roles, etc (Kolbe & Burnett, 1991). It has been used as a method in many studies in the fields of advertising, communication, social science (Albers-Miller & Gelb, 1996; Appelbaum, Ullrich, & Halliburton, 1993; Berelson, 1952; Holsti, 1969; Krippendorff, 1980; Rosengren, 1981; Wang & Chan, 2001; Weber, 1985). The method for this study was designed to meet the criteria of objectivity, systematization, quantification, sampling, and reliability that were adherence to Kassarjian's (1977) standards and indicated in Kolbe & Burnett's (1991) work.

*Sampling and Unit of Analysis*

According to Wiles, Wiles, and Tjernlund (1996), content analyses with print advertisements are suitable sources for measuring values due to their quality and visual elements. Four US magazines (*Cosmopolitan, Bazaar, Vogue, and ELLE*) and four comparable Chinese magazines (*Cosmopolitan, Bazaar, Vogue, and ELLE*) were selected in this study because they are read by the specific audience of study. Those magazines were comparable in terms of their respective target audience and their circulation. For example, about 90% of the *Cosmopolitan* readers are 20 to 35 years of age, while approximately more than 93% of them have at least an associate's degree (Zhang & Shavitt, 2003). According to the executive director of *Vogue* China Zhang Yu, Vogue's target audience is 20 to 35 years of age female with good salary, high education and sensitive to fashion. Moreover, the sales for first month after its launch in China

were 300,000 (Vogue, 2005). *Cosmopolitan* took 10%-15% of the fashion magazine market with third ranking in China followed by *Elle* and *Bazaar* (Analysis of Chinese fashion magazine market, 2005). In the U.S., *Cosmopolitan* has large circulation. In 2006, its circulation was 2, 947, 220 with the ranking of 17 out of all magazines in U.S. (Top 100 magazines, 2006).

The unit of analysis includes full-page (letter size) ad from these selected magazines. In addition, in order to get rid of the redundancies, any duplicated ads for the same brand found in the same country were excluded (Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996). As part of the analysis procedure, advertisements were detached from each magazine and numbered in order to guarantee manageability. Out of 549 units collected with 323 were from magazines originating the U.S. and 226 from Chinese magazines. In U.S. market, the order was *ELLE (130), Vogue (89), Cosmopolitan (60),* and *Bazaar (44)*. In China, the order was *ELLE (88), Cosmopolitan (54), Vogue (40),* and *Bazaar (44)*.

<center>*Coding Instrument*</center>

The coding design in this analysis was largely based on Zhang and Shavitt's (2003) and Muller's (1992) framework (Table 1). In order to test the usage of western language and models in Chinese ads, the Chinese coding sheet added questions about the presence of western language and models. The Chinese culture and the US culture were selected in this research in that Chinese values represent the eastern culture, while US is the leading country of western world with western culture of a melting-pot.

Table 1.

*The Coding Scheme for Values of Individualism, Collectivism, Modernity, and Tradition in*

*Advertising*

| Values | | Descriptions |
|---|---|---|
| Individualism | Self | Self-decision or choice of product. All is up to you. Individual pleasure or enjoyment (hedonism-oriented). Satisfy consumer's (your) own specific needs. Be nice to your self, self-improvement or self-realization. Attention focus or look cool. |
| | Being different | Leadership; ambition. Personal success or personal goal achievement. Unique personality or individuality; being independent. Risk-taking. |
| Collectivism | Relationship focus | Take care of family Concern about others or support of society, group goal. Harmony with others, enjoying goods with others. Enhance relationship or group well-being. |
| | Conformity | Product enjoys certain popularity. Following social consensus. |
| | Other focused | Others' happiness. Pay attention to the views of others. |
| Modernity | Technology | Provides you with "good quality product" (as claimed in the ads),such as reliable, effective, trustworthy, and safe. Empowers you to control your surroundings. Provides you a convenient and easy lifestyle. Laboratory ingredients or chemical elements showing scientific evidence (e.g., it can enhance xx by 57%). |
| | Revolution | Revolutionary force, challenges or changes old perceptions, values, stereotypes, and customs. Things change quickly. Keep up with what's new. |
| | Professional | Professional resources to get recommendation for product or brand such as from dermatologists or dentists. |
| | Fashion | Changing style or updated model. Stay young forever. |
| | Leisure | Freedom to have more leisure. |

Table 1. (continued)

| | Long history | Enjoy the heritage of long ago.<br>Enduring or timeless; being historical and legendary. |
|---|---|---|
| Tradition | Closeness to nature | Natural ingredients in product.<br>Close to natural environment. |
| | Traditional elements | Long-respected traditions such as "adapted from ancient prescription." |

Besides the scheme of Zhang and Shavitt (2003) and Muller (1992), all the ads were coded according to their product categories, which include alcoholic beverage, apparel, automobile, bag, cosmetics, electronics, eyewear, haircare, healthcare, jewelry, lingerie, media, perfume, shopping, watch, other. Due to the insufficient occurrences categories of bank, book, etc., they were combined together with category of "other". In addition, Zhang and Shavitt's (2003) product characteristics about personal and shared use products were then applied to the specific product categories (for detailed list of personal and shared products, see Appendix 1).

*Coding Procedure*

*Coder Training and Pretest*

Coder training is important to objectivity because it helps coders be familiar with the coding rules and operational definitions, thus advances interjudge and intrajudge coding reliability (Kolbe & Burnett, 1991). Four coders (two U.S. born graduate students and two Chinese international graduate students) were selected from a southern U.S. university and were trained in a 3-hour session. They were all blind to the hypotheses and research questions. First, the primary researcher explained the operational definitions and read the codebook aloud. After each coder understood and got familiar with each value, they were instructed to complete the code sheet. To encourage discrimination among ads, coders were asked to use three-point scale to rate ads for each of the four values (0 = this value is not implied or expressed at all, 1 = this

value is addressed somewhat, and 2 = this value is addressed strongly [or exclusively]) (Zhang &

Shavitt, 2003). In this vein, 10% of the ads were systematically selected and coded

correspondingly by each coder.  The coding decisions were standardized to stay away from the

reference effect within culture (Heine *et al*., 2002).  Once a subjective scale is applied to choose

the significance of cultural values in ads, one value (a coding decision) is going to be compared

with other values and norms (Zhang & Shavitt, 2003). For instance, one coder may see

somewhat modernity value in one advertisement, while the other coder may see exclusively

modernity value. Thus, in this study, we only consider presence or absence of one value.

*Coder Independence*

The coders were asked to judge, grade, and rate the ads without any interaction among

themselves so that they could make an independent and autonomous decisions hence avoid any

bias (Kassarijan, 1977; Kolbe & Burnett, 1991). In this vein, coders who knew each other were

asked to work separately in order to avoid the influences.

*Intercoder Reliability Analysis*

Intercoder reliability is usually considered as the standard measure to test the research

quality (Kolbe & Burnett, 1991). High levels of agreement suggests high reliability in research

methods. The intercoder reliability is calculated by using Perreault and Leigh's (1989) method,

as reported in Table 2. The formula is:

$Ir = \{[(Fo/N) - (1/K)] [K/ (K\text{-}1)]\} \sqrt{} $, where

*Fo* is the observed frequency of agreement between judges

*N* is the total number of judgments

*K* is the number of categories

Table 2 shows the reliability indexes calculated for each value by country. According to Kassarjian (1977), every figure that reaches or above the minimum reliability of .85 can be regarded as reliable. The average reliabilities of both U.S. and China were .85 and .95 separately. The Chinese coders had a very high agreement with each other. The intercoder reliabilities for four values between Chinese coders are .97 for individualism, .97 for collectivism, .98 for modernity, and .91 for tradition respectively. The reliability for collectivism value (.74) and tradition value (.76) in the U.S. sample were very low, but two coders agreed upon individualism value (.92) and modernity (.98).

The two main reasons that might cause low-reliability indices according to Marshall and Roberts (2008) are either 1) the miscoding of manifest content and 2) the nature of coding latent variables. Once the reliability indices were calculated, the primary researcher settled all disagreements among coders by first reviewing the choices (rating) of the coders and then assigning the decision while reviewing the codebook carefully. This process is consistent with many content analysis studies (Alexander, Benjamin, Hoerrner, & Roe, 1998; Browne, 1998; Frazer, Sheehan, & Patti, 2002; Kelley & Turley, 2004; Kolbe & Burnett, 1991; Marshall & Roberts, 2008).

Table 2.

*Reliability Index by Values and Country (according to Perreault & Leigh's, 1989 formula)*

| Values | Country | |
|---|---|---|
| | U.S. | China |
| Individualism | .92 | .97 |
| Collectivism | .74 | .97 |
| Modernity | .98 | .98 |
| Tradition | .76 | .91 |

CHAPTER 4

RESULTS

*Descriptive Statistics*

The sample contains 549 advertisements from both U.S. and China, selected from two main sample frames (women's fashion magazines by circulation in U.S. and China). The following descriptive statistics consist of frequencies and percentage of the distribution of the sample by country, magazine, product type, and product category.

*Sample Distribution by Country and by Magazine*

Table 3 illustrates advertisement number and percentage by country and magazine correspondingly while presenting the total number of ads and its proportion per magazine.  Out of those 549 advertisements, ads from U.S. edition magazines were 323 (58.8%), while Chinese were 226 (41.2%). In these four fashion magazines, Elle has the greatest number of ads, which contains 130 (23.7%) of U.S. edition and 88 (16.0%) of Chinese edition. On the contrast, Bazaar has 88 ads (16%) in total yielding the lowest ads total number. Within two countries, Vogue China represents the smallest amount of ads, which only makes up 7.3% (n = 40) of the whole sample.

Table 3

*Sample Distribution by Country and by Magazine*

| Magazine | Country | | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | U.S. | | | China | | | Both | |
| | n | Percent within country | Percent of magazine | n | Percent within country | Percent of magazine | N | Percent of N |
| Elle | 130 | 42.2% | 23.7% | 88 | 38.9% | 16.0% | 218 | 40% |
| Cosmopolitan | 60 | 18.6% | 10.9% | 54 | 23.9% | 9.8% | 114 | 21% |
| Vogue | 89 | 27.6% | 16.2% | 40 | 17.7% | 7.3% | 129 | 23% |
| Bazaar | 44 | 13.6% | 8.0% | 44 | 19.5% | 8.0% | 88 | 16% |
| Total | 323 | 100% | 58.8% | 226 | 100% | 41.2% | 549 | 100% |

*Sample Distribution by Product Characteristics*

Table 4 explains the distribution of the advertisements by product characteristics. Personal products made up the majority of the sample (n=495, 90.2%) both in US (n=287, 88.9%) and in China (n=208, 92.0%), while shared products accounted for only 9.8% (n=54) of the total sample, in which 11.1% (n=36) of the US sample and 8.0% (n=18) of the Chinese sample.

Table 4.

*Sample Distribution by Product Characteristics*

| Product Characteristics | Country | | | | | |
| | U.S. | | China | | Both | |
| | Frequency | Percent of U.S. | Frequency | Percent of China | Frequency | Percent of N |
| Personal product | 287 | 88.9% | 208 | 92.0% | 495 | 90.2% |
| Shared product | 36 | 11.1% | 18 | 8.0% | 54 | 9.8% |
| All | 323 | 100% | 226 | 100% | 549 | 100% |

*Sample Distribution by Product Category*

Table 5 demonstrates the sample distribution by product category. Apparel (14.6%, n=80), cosmetics (20.2%, n=111), jewelry (13.5%, n=74), and perfume (12.8%, n=70) are taking up a great percentage of the whole sample (N=549). In these categories, the world famous brands like Gucci, Dior, or Armani can be found. The category of media is making up the least amount with the percentage of .7% (n=4). No brands were found to be dominant in terms of sample presence. The salience brands with a presence across both magazines include Dior (22), Loreal (17), Gucci (13), Chanel (12), Dolce & Gabbana (12), Olay (10), Estee Lauder (8), Pantene (7), Prada (7), and Van Cleef & Arpels (6). All others are <5 in total.

Table 5.

*Sample Distribution by Product Category*

| Category | Country | | | | Total | |
| | China | | U.S. | | | |
| | Frequency | Percent of category | Frequency | Percent of category | Frequency | Percent of category |
| Alcoholic beverage | 1 | .2% | 8 | 1.5% | 9 | 1.6% |
| Apparel | 22 | 4.0% | 58 | 10.6% | 80 | 14.6% |
| Automobile | 4 | .7% | 2 | .4% | 6 | 1.1% |
| Bag | 18 | 3.3% | 24 | 4.4% | 42 | 7.7% |

Table 5. (continued)

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| Cosmetics | 75 | 13.7% | 36 | 6.6% | 111 | 20.2% |
| Electronics | 8 | 1.5% | 2 | .4% | 10 | 1.8% |
| Eyewear | 3 | .5% | 4 | .7% | 7 | 1.3% |
| Haircare | 9 | 1.6% | 14 | 2.6% | 23 | 4.2% |
| Healthcare | 4 | .7% | 31 | 5.6% | 35 | 6.4% |
| Jewelry | 30 | 5.5% | 44 | 8.0% | 74 | 13.5% |
| Lingerie | 6 | 1.1% | 2 | .4% | 8 | 1.5% |
| Media | 0 | .0% | 4 | .7% | 4 | .7% |
| Other | 6 | 1.1% | 13 | 2.4% | 19 | 3.5% |
| Perfume | 19 | 3.5% | 51 | 9.3% | 70 | 12.8% |
| Shopping | 2 | .4% | 7 | 1.3% | 9 | 1.6% |
| Watch | 19 | 3.5% | 23 | 4.2% | 42 | 7.7% |

*Hypothesis and Research Questions*

Research question one investigated if there is a presence of standardized ads within Chinese and U.S. women's fashion magazines. As expected, there is a presence of standardized ads within women's fashion magazines, answering RQ 1. However, there are only eight standardized ads and all are the world-renowned brands. There are Dior (perfume), Dior (bag), Gucci (bag), Estee Lauder (cosmetics), Loreal (cosmetics), Swarovski (crystal) and Cartier (ring).

*Individualism vs. Collectivism*

Research question 2 is asking is there a difference in individualistic values between U.S. and Chinese print ads in women's fashion magazines. As shown in Table 6, individualistic values are dominant values in both Chinese and US advertisements. The finding indicates RQ2 that there is no statistical difference in individualistic values between U.S. and Chinese print ads in women's fashion magazines. China is 97.8% (n=221) and U.S. is 99.7% (n=322) were coded individualistic. In sum, there were only six ads not exhibiting some type of individualistic value. Research question 3 is examining how primary is the value of individualism in personal use product in Chinese women fashion print ads. For personal products in Chinese print ads form

women's fashion magazines, there are only four Chinese ads missing individualistic values out of 208 ads, which promote personal use products, addressing RQ 3. This suggests that individualism is a significant value in Chinese print ads within women's fashion magazines.

Hypotheses 1 suggests that in shared use products, collectivistic appeals are more likely to be used in Chinese print ads than U.S. print ads from women's fashion magazines. Although collectivism is a dominant cultural value in Chinese society, of the 18 ads of personal products (Table 4) only three ads exhibited collectivistic values. Thus, H1 is not supported.

Table 6.

*Individualism Value by Country*

| Country | Presence | | Absence | | Total | |
|---------|-----------|---------|-----------|---------|-----------|---------|
|         | Frequency | Percent | Frequency | Percent | Frequency | Percent |
| China   | 221       | 97.8%   | 5         | 2.2%    | 226       | 100%    |
| US      | 322       | 99.7%   | 1         | .3%     | 323       | 100%    |
| Total   | 543       | 98.9%   | 6         | 1.1%    | 549       | 100%    |

*Tradition vs. Modernity*

Research question 4 is questioning the relationship in modernity values between U.S. and Chinese print ads in women's fashion magazines. However, even though Chinese society is believed to have more traditional values, the statistics do not support this relationship. The presence of ads exhibiting modernity in China and U.S. are 96.9% (n=219) and 97.8% (n=316) respectively (Table 7). There were only seven ads out the Chinese sample and seven ads out of

the U.S. sample that do not reveal a modernity value. There were no statistically significant differences.

Table 7.

*Modernity Value by Country*

| Country | Presence | | Absence | | Total |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Frequency | Percent | Frequency | Percent | Frequency |
| China | 219 | 96.9% | 7 | 3.1% | 226 |
| US | 316 | 97.8% | 7 | 2.2% | 323 |
| Total | 535 | 97.4% | 14 | 2.6% | 549 |

*Western Models and Celebrities*

Findings here indicate many western models and celebrities are shown in Chinese advertisements. Table 8 demonstrates the percentage of usage of western models and celebrities in Chinese print ads of women's fashion magazines. It is surprising that almost half of the ads (47.8%, n=108) are using western models, including 32 ads (14.2%) out of 226 ads that employ western celebrities. The use of western celebrities addresses research question 5 regarding how prevalent is the usage of these western models and celebrities in Chinese print ads in women's fashion magazines.

Table 8

*Western Models and Celebrities in Chinese Ads*

| Models | Presence | | Absence | | Total | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | Frequency | Percent | Frequency | Percent | Frequency | Percent |
| Western models | 108 | 47.8% | 118 | 52.2% | 226 | 100% |
| Celebrities | 32 | 14.2% | 194 | 85.8% | 226 | 100% |

*Western Language*

Research question 6 is asking to what extent are English language words being employed in Chinese print ads of women's fashion magazines. From Table 9, English-language words are prevalently used in Chinese print ads. Less than one percent (.9%, n=2) of the ads apply merely Chinese language to name the brand. 57.1% (n=129) ads are making use of both Chinese and English in their ads, and the occurrence of only English words is 42.0% (n=95) out of the whole sample (N=226).

Table 9.

*English Language in Chinese Ads*

| Languages | Presence | |
|---|---|---|
| | Frequency | Percent |
| Chinese only | 2 | .9% |

Table 9. (continued)

| English only | 95 | 42.0% |
|---|---|---|
| Both | 129 | 57.1% |
| Total | 226 | 100% |

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSIONS

*Discussion*

This study compared and analyzed cultural values reflected in U.S. and Chinese print advertisement within four women's fashion magazines. We see a great force of western cultural values in Chinese advertising in terms of modernity, individualism, as well as in the use of western fashion models and language. The Chinese conventional perspective of women is also changing as the way they are choosing to face themselves, society, and world.

Research question 1 is asking whether there is a presence of standardized ads within Chinese and U.S. women's fashion magazines. This might be the first study that ever counts the number of standardization approach applied in advertisement. The consequence shows that standardization approach is suitable for some brands in countries even with different backgrounds. However, it is important to notice that only world-renown brands are using this approach in personal products. Moreover, all of the ads share the similar characteristics – simple designed. For instance, there is only one ring displaying in the advertisement for Cartier Ring with red background. For the Gucci Bag, current famous singer – Rihanna, wearing white clothes, is carrying an in-fashion bag on the pure black base. Because of this, we can tell the target audiences of those magazines are sharing certain similar outlooks, although the limited number of ads is employing standardization approach. This supports Neelankavil *et al.*'s (1994) study that a standardization approach can be achieved in very traditional countries for some specific products like cosmetics products.

Research question 2 is asking is there a difference in individualistic values between U.S. and Chinese print ads in women's fashion magazines. The finding shows individualism value is prevalently found in both countries' fashion print ads. Cheng's (1994), Cheng and Schweitzer's (1996), Wang and Chan's (2001), and Zhang and Shavitt's (2003) studies all support this result. Individualism is becoming one of the dominant values in Chinese culture, though those studies were targeting different audiences. For personal use product, research question 3e is asking how primary the individualism value is in those products. From the result of Zhang and Shavitt's (2003) work, individualism is supposed to appear more than collectivism, which is also support our result. Only four ads out of 208 ads are not showing individualism value.

Hypothesis 1 presumes that collectivism value is more likely to be used in Chinese print ads than U.S. print fashion ads that are promoting shared use products according to the finding from Zhang and Shavitt's (2003) study. However, our result does not support the previous study. Moreover, Singh *et al.* (2005) also found Chinese web sites were significantly higher in the depiction of collectivistic values compared to U.S. web sites, which does not agree with this study as well. The reason for not showing more collectivism in Chinese ads may be caused by the specific print ad in fashion magazines. Normally, fashion print ads may prefer to promote personal use product or fashion related products like cosmetics, jewelry, watches, or apparel that might have less collectivistic appeals.

Research question 4 asks the relationship in modernity value between U.S. and Chinese fashion print advertisements. The result indicates that modernity value is dominant value in both U.S. and Chinese print ads, which support the previous studies (Cheng, 1994; Cheng & Schweitzer, 1996; Zhang & Shavitt, 2003). On the other hand, the result shows that there is very less traditional value in Chinese ads. It does not agree with Lin's (2000) study, which showed

42

that the portrayal of traditional Chinese cultural values remained relatively stable. Thus, this specific group of Chinese women is becoming more and more modern and individualistic.

Singh and Huang (1962) found that U.S. print media advertisements are not effective in India because of the conflict between their appeals and the host culture. However, even though China is a typical eastern country as India, and U.S. and China having particular opposite western and eastern culture, findings from this study show that print fashion advertisements in these two countries still can be transferrable or share similar appeals in terms of modernity and individualism. The difference between the two studies is the former one is study ads based on mass audience and our study is only studying metropolitan women aged from 20 to 35 years old. It again supports that advertisement is audience-based channel to reflect cultural values of specific target audience.

Research question 5 and 6 indicate that Chinese ads are largely employing English-language words for taglines or brand names and western models or celebrities. There are only two brands using Chinese words to name the brand, which implies the high degree of westernization in China. It also further confirms that cultural orientation of women in China is changing as sweeping of western culture. While language and model are crucial elements in ads to persuade consumers, the large use of western models and language might point out the trend of Chinese advertisement for women group. However, inconsistent with Nelson and Paek's (2007) study, our results do not support that multinational brand ads are more likely to use non-domestic brand names, product names, and slogans than are domestic brand ads. On the contrary, both domestic and multinational brand ads are in favor of using English-language words or combining both English-language words and Chinese words. Muller (1992) wrote that the western model and language were symbols of westernization, which implied the high quality of

products and represented prestige. According to this, we can tell the target audience of our study is pursuing high quality products and becoming more western.

## *Conclusion*

Applying content analysis approach for advertisements from China and U.S., this research shows that the western culture is omnipresent in Chinese women's fashion print advertisement that reshapes Chinese traditional culture continuously.  It is believed that modernization will go deep into Chinese society through the cultural changing of this specific group in that Chinese women are having increasing outlook towards the world as the growing position they are holding. Moreover, advertisement will become a significant means to help achieving this view.

The finding is consistent with the literature review (Cheng, 1994; Cheng & Schweizer, 1996; Lin, 2001) that modernity and individualism are displayed predominantly in Chinese ads that promote great changes of Chinese culture. Although the result is controversial in that China is a traditional and collectivistic society and traditional and collectivism values are still stable for mass audience (Cheng, 1994; Cheng & Schweizer, 1996; Lin, 2001; Singh, Zhao, & Hu, 2005; Zhang & Shavitt, 2003; ), individualism and modernity values are prevalent in fashion print ads with specific audience --- women aged from 20 to 35 with high salary and education in this study. Besides, in terms of product characteristics, those ads are more promoting personal products, such as perfume, cosmetic, or jewelry. Thus, it verifies that advertisement is an audience connective agent. As the result, the debate of standardization and adaptation approach will be applied according to the specific target audience, even though the existence of differences or similarities among every culture society.

44

*Limitations*

As with any scientific study, certain limitations should be taken into consideration. First, sample for this study was built only from a single month (December) of noncumulative data for both U.S. and Chinese sample as opposed to a more longitudinal sample that may provide a more consistent pattern of findings. In addition, December in U.S. is a holiday season so that the ads in the U.S. sample may have promotions for brands not typically advertised all year, whereas Chinese people do not celebrate Christmas Day.

Due to the limited number of multinational magazines focused on our demographic in Chinese market, we could not build a sample as large as we wanted. Additionally, there are a great number of duplicated ads in China within those high circulation world-renown magazines. For instance, Vogue Chinese edition has 89 ads in total at first; however, after taking out the duplicated ads, only 40 ads were left. Consequently, this process also shrinks the total number of advertisements in the sample.

The low agreement of tradition and collectivism values between U.S. coders should also be recognized. It might be a result of misunderstanding of the coding scheme. It could also be the fact that tradition in the U.S. has a much shorter reference point compared to China. In terms of collectivism, Hofstede (2009) finds the U.S. culture to be one of the most individualistic countries in the world. This could make identifying collectivism difficult for U.S. coders. Thus, researcher should help coders get familiar with codebook and clarify every ambiguous during the coding session. However, it should be stressed that it is also necessary for coders to go back and check the codebook when they are not certain about some variables.

*Implication for Future Research*

This study shows great changes of print advertisement in women's fashion magazines in China. Comparing ads from both China and U.S., it reveals that western culture is present in Chinese advertising and this could be reshaping cultural values in terms of modernity, individualism, as well as in the use of western fashion models and language. Future studies should look at more cultural values of this women's group and study the effects caused from changes of cultural values on this group. Important question can be asked: How do the cultural values reflected in women fashion print ads affect the traditional conception of women? How does the society adjust the changes in cultural values reflected in women fashion print ads? In addition, a longitudinal study using the same method should provide more credibility.

Because we only studied and compared the international magazines, it is necessary for future researchers to study both international magazines and magazines from Asian countries, or Chinese domestic magazines. Magazines from Asian countries or China itself might promote different cultural values for women according their own conception about women. However, the lack of truly "Chinese" fashion magazines is a noticeable issue that needs to be considered. In China, there is barely one competitive Chinese domestic fashion magazines. Most of the Chinese fashions magazines are from other countries such as U.S., Japan, or France. Moreover, women's fashion magazines within different target groups are also worthy of studying.

Finally, future research should explore television advertising for the same women's group as well. As television advertisement is designed for mass audience comparatively, it may embed more deep values. Nonetheless, advertisement is a window from which to perceive cultural values about the target audience.

REFERENCES

Albers-Miller, N.D., & Gelb, B.D. (1996). Designing cross-cultural advertising research: A
closer look at paired comparisons. *International Marketing Review*, 13(5), 59 – 75.

Agrawal, M. (1994). Review of a 40-year debate in international advertising. *International
Marketing Review, 12*(1), 26 – 48.

Alexander, A., Benjamin, L. M., Hoerrner, K., & Roe, D. (1998). 'We'll be back in a moment':
A content analysis of advertisements in children's television in the 1950s. *Journal of
Advertising, 27* (3), 1–9.

Analysis of Chinese fashion magazine market. (2005). *eWen*. Retrieved March 11th, 2009, from
http://magazine.ewen.cc/qikan/bkview.asp?bkid=87577&cid=227750

Appelbaum, U., & Halliburton, C. (1993). How to develop international advertising campaigns
that work: The example of the European food and beverages sector. *International Journal
of Advertising, 12*, 223 – 241.

Belk, R.W., & Bryce, W.J. (1986). Materialism and individual determinism in U.S. and Japanese
television advertising. *Advances in Consumer Research*, Richard J. Lutze, ed., Provo, UT:
Association for Consumer Research, 568 – 572.

Belk, R.W., Bryce, W.J., & Pollay, R.W. (1985). Advertising themes and cultural values: A
comparison of U.S. and Japanese advertising. *Proceeding of the Inaugural Meeting of the
Southeast Region*, K.C. Mun and T.C. Chan, eds, Hong Kong: Academy of International
Business, 11 – 20.

Belk, R.W., & Pollay, R.W. (1985). Materialism and status appeals in Japanese and U.S. print

   advertising: A historical and cross-cultural content analysis. *International Marketing*

   *Review, 2*(12), 38 – 47.

Berelson, B. (1952). *Content analysis in communication research*. New York: Hafner.

Browne, B.A. (1998). Gender stereotypes in advertising on children's television in the 1990s: A

   cross-national analysis. *Journal of Advertising, 27*(1), 83 – 96.

Chan, K., & Chan, F. Information content of television advertising in China: An update. *Asian*

   *Journal of Communication, 15*(1), 1 – 15.

Chen, Y.N. (2009). Young Chinese customers. Filoer. University of Delaware. Retrieved March

   3rd, 2009, from http://www.udel.edu/fiber/issue3/world/

Cheng, H. (1994). Reflections of cultural values: A content analysis of Chinese magazine

   advertisements from 1982 and 1992. *International Journal of Advertising, 13*(2), 167 –

   183.

Cheng, H., & Schweitzer, J.C. (1996). Cultural values reflected in Chinese and U.S. television

   commercials. *Journal of Advertising Research. 36*(3), 27 – 45.

Dunn, S.W. (1966). The case study approach in cross-cultural research. *Journal of Marketing*

   *Research, 3*(1), 26 – 31.

Elinder, E. (1965). How international can European advertising be? *Journal of Marketing, 29*(2),

   7 – 11.

Firth, K.T., & Sengupta, S. (1991). Individualism and advertising: A cross-cultural comparison. *Media Asia. 18*, 191 – 197.

Formation of the Chinese Civilization (2001). CHINA.ORG.CN. Retrieved March 4th, 2009, from http://www.china.org.cn/e-gudai/index.htm

Frazer, C. F., Sheehan, K. B., & Patti, C. H. (2002). Advertising strategy and effective advertising: Comparing the USA and Australia. *The Journal of Marketing Communications, 8*, 149-164.

Heine, S.J., Lehman, D.R., Peng, K.P., & Greenholtz, J. (2002). What's wrong with cross-cultural comparisons of subjective Likert Scales? : The reference-group effect. *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 82*, 903 – 918.

Hofstede, G. (2009). Geert Hofstede Cultural Dimensions. *Itim International*. Retrieved February 19, 2009 from http://www.geert-hofstede.com/

Holsti, O.R. (1969). *Content analysis for the social sciences and humanities*. Reading, MA: Addison – Wesley.

Hong, J., Muderrisoglu, A., & Zinkhan, G. (1987). Cultural differences in advertising expression: A comparative content analysis of Japanese and US magazine advertising. *Journal of Advertising, 16*(1), 55 – 62.

Hong, P., Noh, J., & Hwang, W. (2006). Global supply chain strategy: A Chinese market perspective. *Journal of Enterprise Information, 19*, 320 – 333.

Hsu, F. (1981). *Americans and Chinese: Passage to differences*. Honolulu, HL: University of Hawaii Press.

Javalgi, R., Culter, B.D., & White, S. (1994). Print advertising in the pacific basin. An empirical investigation. *International Marketing Review, 11*(6), 48 – 64,

Kale, S.H. (1991). Culture-specific marketing communications: An analytical approach. *International Marketing Review, 8*(2), 18 – 30.

Kassarjian, H.H. (1977). Content analysis in consumer research. *Journal of Consumer Research, 4*, 8 – 18.

Kelley, S.W., & Turley, L.W. (2004). The effect of content on perceived affect of Supper Bowl commercials. *Journal of Sport Management, 18*, 398 – 420.

Khairullah, D.H., & Khairullah, Z.Y. (2009). Cross-cultural analysis of gender roles: Indian and US advertisements. *Asia Pacific Journal of Marketing and Logistics. 21*(1), 58 – 75.

Knutson, T. J., Komolsevin, R., Chatiketu, P., & Smith, V. R. A. (2002). Comparison of Thai and U.S. American willingness to communicate. *Journal of Intercultural Communication Research*, *1*(31), 3 – 12.

Kolbe, R.H., & Burnett, M.S. (1991). Content analysis research: An examination of applications with directives for improving research reliability and objectivity. *Journal of Consumer Research, 18*, 243 – 250.

Krippendorff, K. (1980). *Content analysis: An introduction to its methodology*. Beverly Hill, CA: Sage.

Levitt, T. (1983). Globalization of markets. *Harvard Business Review, 61*(3), 69 – 81.

Lin, C. A. (1993). Cultural differences in message strategies: A comparison between American

and Japanese TV commercials. *Journal of Advertising Research, 33*(3), 40 – 48.

Lin, C. A. (2001). Cultural values reflected in Chinese and American television Advertising.

*Journal of Advertising, 30*(4), 83 – 94.

Liu, W.L. (2002). Advertising in China: Product branding and beyond. *Corporate

Communications: An International Journal, 7*, 117 – 125.

Marquez, F.T. (1979). Cross-cultural research: A decision factor in standardized versus non-

standardized global advertising. *Gazette, 25*, 150 – 162.

Marshall, S.W., & Roberts, M.S. (2008). *Television advertising that works*. Amherst, NY:

Cambria Press.

Moon, Y.S., & Chan, K. (2005). Advertising appeals and cultural values in television

commercials: A comparison of Hong Kong and Korea. *International Marketing Review,

22*(1), 48 – 66.

Mueller, B. (1987). Reflections of culture: An analysis of Japanese and American advertising

appeals. *J. Advert. Res*., 27(3), 51 – 59.

Mueller, B. (1992). Standardization vs. specialization: An examination of Westernization in

Japanese advertising. *Journal of Advertising Research. 32*(1), 15 – 24.

Mueller, B. (2004). Dynamics of international of advertising: Theoretical and practical

perspectives. New York: Peter Lang

Nelson, M., & Paek, H. (2007). A content analysis of advertising in a global magazine across

      seven countries: Implications for global advertising strategies. *International Marketing*

      *Review, 24*(1), 64 – 86.

Newham, F. (2006). China puts its best face forward. ASIA TIMES Online. Retrieved March 4th,

      2009, from http://www.atimes.com/atimes/china_business/hd06cb05.html

Okazaki, S. (2004). Do multinationals standardise or localise? The cross-cultural dimensionality

      of product-based web sites. *Internet Research: Electronic Networking Applications and*

      *Policy*, 14(1), 81 – 94.

Perreault, W.D., & Leigh, L.E. (1989). Reliability of nominal data based on qualitative

      judgments. *Journal of Marketing Research, 26*, 135 – 148.

Pollay, R. W. (1983). Measuring the cultural values manifest in advertising. In J.H. Leigh & C.R.

      Martin (Eds.) *Current issues and research in advertising* (71 – 92). Ann Arbor, MI:

      University of Michigan.

Pollay, R.W. (1986). The distorted mirror: Reflections on the unintended consequences of

      advertising. *Journal of Marketing, 50*(2), 18 – 36.

Rokeach, M. (1973). *The nature of values*. New York: Free Press.

Rosengren, K.E. (1981). *Advances in content analysis*. Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.

Singh, P.N., & Huang, S.C. (1962). Some socio-cultural and psychological determinants of

      advertising in India: A comparative study. *The Journal of Social Psychology, 57*, 113 –

      121.

Singh, N., Zhao, H.X., & Hu, X.R. (2005). Analyzing the cultural content of web sites: A cross-national comparison of China, India, Japan, and US. *International Marketing Review, 22*(2), 129 – 146.

Siu, W., & Au, A.K. (1997). Women in advertising: A comparison of television advertisements in China and Singapore. *Marketing Intelligence & Planning. 15*, 235 – 243.

Srikandath, S. (1991). Cultural values depicted in Indian television advertising. *Gazette, 48*, 165 – 176.

Tansey, R., Hyman, M., & Zinkhan, G. (1990). Cultural themes in Brazilian and US auto ads: A cross-cultural comparison. *Journal of Advertising, 19*(2), 30 – 39.

Top 100 magazine. (2006). *NYjobSource*. Retrieved February 22th, 2009, from http://nyjobsource.com/magazines.html

Tse, D., Belk, R., & Zhou, N. (1989). Becoming a consume society: A longitudinal and cross-cultural content analysis of print ads from Hong Kong, the People's Republic of China, and Taiwan . *Journal of Consumer Research*, *15*, 457 – 472.

Unwin, S. (1974). How culture affects advertising expression and communication style. Journal of Advertising, 3(3), 24 – 27.

Vogue. (2005). *QQ*. Retrieved February 22th, 2009, from http://lady.qq.com/a/20050922/000034.htm

Wang, C.L., & Chan, A. (2001). A content analysis of connectedness vs. separateness themes used in US and PRC print advertisements. *International Marketing Review, 18*, 145 – 159.

Weber, R.P. (1985). *Basic content analysis*. London: Sage.

Wiles, C.R., Wiles, J.A., & Tjernlund, A. (1996). The ideology of advertising: The United States and Sweden. *Journal of Advertising Research, 36*(3), 57 – 66.

Women's Education in China (2000). *Chinaembassy*. Retrieved February 5, 2009 from http://www.chinaembassy.org.np/women_children/text/women_education.htm

Xinhua News Agency (2003). Chinese and foreign women celebrate International Women's Day. Foreign Languages Press' Books. Retrieved February 5, 2009 from http://www.china.org.cn/english/culture/57495.htm

Xiong, H. (2008). Women in China: today and yesterday. Irish Institute of Chinese Studies. Retrieved February 19, 2009 from http://www.ucc.ie/en/DepartmentsCentresandUnits/ChineseStudies/NewsandEvents/librarytalk/DocumentFile,34516,en.pdf

Zenith Report, (2008). *Zenith Optimedia*. Retrieved October 21, 2008, from http://www.zenithoptimedia.com/gff/pdf/Adspend%20forecasts%20June%202008.pdf

Zhang, J., & Shavitt, S. (2003). Cultural values in advertisements to the Chinese X-generation: Promoting modernity and individualism. *Journal of Advertising, 32*(1), 21 – 31.

APPENDICES

APPENDIX A

Product Characteristics: Personal Use Versus Shared

| Personal Products | Shared Products |
|---|---|
| Women's sanitary products | Wine, soft drink |
| Cosmetics | Groceries |
| Haircere products | Baby products |
| Apparel, lingerie | Laundry products/soap |
| Perfumes | Over-the-counter medicines |
| Watches | Insurance/banking |
| Electric shaver | Washer/refrigerator |
| Personal copier/typewriters | Camera/telephone/television/VCR/DVD |
| Jewelry | Computer hardware and software |
| Credit cards | Automobile and service |
| Sunglasses | Hotel/resort accommodations |
| Book | Home furnishing |

APPENDIX B

U.S. Code Sheet

*Assign the appropriate number in the corresponding excel spreadsheet cell letter:*

**A. Ad #:**_____

**B. Coder name:**    **1 = Coder name**
        **2 = Coder name**

**C. Magazine title:**    **1 = Elle**
        **2 = Composition**
        **3 = Vogue**
        **4 = Bazaar**

**D. Type brand name:** _____

*Directions: Please select only one box for each value.*

| Values | Not implied at all | Addressed somewhat | Addressed strongly (exclusively) |
|---|---|---|---|
| **E. Individualism** | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| **F. Collectivism** | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| **G. Modernity** | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| **H. Tradition** | 0 | 1 | 2 |

APPENDIX C

Chinese Code Sheet

*Assign the appropriate number in the corresponding excel spreadsheet cell letter:*

**A. Ad #:**_____

**B. Coder name:**     **3 = Coder name**
                       **4 = Coder name**

**C. Magazine title:**  **5 = Elle**
                        **6 = Composition**
                        **7 = Vogue**
                        **8 = Bazaar**

**D. Type brand name:** _____

*Directions: Please select only one box for each value.*

| Values | Not implied at all | Addressed somewhat | Addressed strongly (exclusively) |
|---|---|---|---|
| **E. Individualism** | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| **F. Collectivism** | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| **G. Modernity** | 0 | 1 | 2 |
| **H. Tradition** | 0 | 1 | 2 |

*Direction: Please select all boxes that apply.*

| | No | Yes |
|---|---|---|
| **I. Are there any Westerners present in the advertisement?** | 0 | 1 |
| **J. Are there any Western celebrities present in the advertisement?** | 0 | 1 |

| | No | Yes |
|---|---|---|
| **K. Brand name is in English only** | 0 | 1 |
| **L. Brand name is in Chinese only** | 0 | 1 |
| **M. Brand name is in both English and Chinese** | 0 | 1 |

**N. If English words are present, please count the number of English words:** _____

VITA

YI LIN

| | |
|---|---|
| Personal Data: | Date of Birth: November 28th, 1985 |
| | Place of Birth: Dexing, China |
| | Marital Status: Single |

| | |
|---|---|
| Education: | Exchange Student Certificate, Southern Polytechnic State University, Marietta, Georgia, 2005 Fall semester |
| | B.A. English, North China University of Technology, Beijing, China, 2005 |
| | M.A. Professional Communication, East Tennessee State University, 2007 |

| | |
|---|---|
| Professional Experiences: | Program Assistant, Tennessee – China Rural Health Exchange Program, East Tennessee State University, Department of Public Health, 2008 |
| | Marketing Specialist, Communicatte. Ltd., Beijing, China, 2007 |
| | Assistant Director, China Central Television, Overseas Department, Beijing, China, 2006 |

| | |
|---|---|
| Honors and Awards: | Third prize for Drama competition, NCUT, 2006 |
| | Scholarship to stand first in the class, NCUT, 2005 |
| | Second prize in English Translation competition, NCUT, 2005 |
| | Scholarship to stand first in the class, NCUT, 2004 |
| | Third prize in second "New Oriental Cup" speech competition, NCUT, 2004 |
| | Second prize in First "New Oriental Cup" speech competition, NCUT, 2003 |